



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF DELIBERATION**

**OF THE**

**ISLAND OF GUERNSEY**

**HANSARD**

**Royal Court House, Guernsey, Wednesday, 11th May 2016**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Guernsey website [www.gov.gg](http://www.gov.gg)*

**Volume 5, No. 17**

**ISSN 2049-8284**

*Published by Her Majesty's Greffier, The Royal Court House,  
St Peter Port, GY1 2NZ. © States of Guernsey, 2016*

**Present:**

**Sir Richard J. Collas, Kt, Bailiff and Presiding Officer**

**Law Officers**

H. E. Roberts Esq., O. B. E., Q.C. (H.M. Procureur)

**People's Deputies**

**St Peter Port South**

Deputies P. T. R. Ferbrache, J. Kuttelwascher, D. A. Tindall,  
B. L. Brehaut, R. H. Tooley

**St Peter Port North**

Deputies J. A. B. Gollop, C. N. K. Parkinson, L. C. Queripel,  
M. P. Leadbeater, J. I. Mooney

**St Sampson**

Deputies L. S. Trott, P. R. Le Pelley, J. S. Merrett, G. A. St Pier,  
T. J. Stephens, C. P. Meerveld

**The Vale**

Deputies M. J. Fallaize, D. B. Jones, M. M. Lowe, L. B. Queripel,  
J. C. S. F. Smithies, S. T. Hansmann Rouxel

**The Castel**

Deputies R. H. Graham, L.V.O, M.B.E, C. J. Green, B. J. E. Paint,  
M. H. Dorey, J. P. Le Tocq

**The West**

Deputies A. H. Brouard, A. C. Dudley-Owen, E. A. Yerby,  
D. de G. De Lisle, S. L. Langlois

**The South-East**

Deputies H. J. R. Soulsby, H. L. de Sausmarez, P. J. R. Roffey,  
R. G. Prow, V. S. Oliver

**Representatives of the Island of Alderney**

Alderney Representatives L. E. Jean and S. D. G. McKinley, O.B.E.

**The Clerk to the States of Deliberation**

J. Torode, Esq. (H.M. Greffier)

**Absent at the Evocation**

Miss M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller); Deputy M. K. Le Clerc (*relevée à 9h 39*)

## Business transacted

Evocation .....	1287
Procedural – Clarification and election procedure .....	1287
<b>Billet d’État XIII.....</b>	<b>1288</b>
I. Committee for Economic Development – Election of President – Deputy Ferbrache elected .....	1288
II. Committee for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of President – Debate commenced .....	1289
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.39 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 11.47 a.m. ....</i>	1319
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of President – Debate continued .....	1319
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.49 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 11.53 a.m. ....</i>	1320
Committee for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of President – Deputy Le Pelley elected.....	1320
III. Committee for Employment & Social Security – Election of President – Deputy Le Clerc elected .....	1320
IV. Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure – Election of President – Deputy Brehaut elected.....	1322
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 1.05 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 2 p.m. ....</i>	1338
V. Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of President – Deputy Soulsby elected..	1338
VI. Committee for Home Affairs – Election of President – Debate commenced .....	1341
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 3.12 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 3.18 p.m. ....</i>	1358
Committee for Home Affairs – Election of President – Deputy Lowe elected.....	1358
VII. Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of President – Debate commenced.....	1358
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.17 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 4.24 p.m. ....</i>	1373
Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of President – Deputy Green elected .....	1373
VIII. Development & Planning Authority – Election of President – Debate commenced .....	1373
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m. and resumed its sitting at 4.35 p.m. ....</i>	1374
Development & Planning Authority – Election of President – Deputy Gollop elected.....	1374
IX. States’ Assembly & Constitution Committee – Election of President – Debate commenced .....	1376
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 5.15 p.m. and resumed it sitting at 5.20 p.m. ....</i>	1385
States’ Assembly & Constitution Committee – Election of President – Deputy Fallaize elected.....	1385
X. Transport Licensing Authority – Election of President – Adjourned to next sitting .....	1385
<b>Billet d’État XV.....</b>	<b>1386</b>

STATES OF DELIBERATION, WEDNESDAY, 11th MAY 2016

---

I. Overseas Aid and Development Commission – Election of President –  
Deputy Yerby elected ..... 1386

II. States Trading Supervisory Board – Election of President – Deputy Jones elected..... 1389

*The Assembly adjourned at 5.40 p.m.*..... 1391

# States of Deliberation

*The States met at 9.30 a.m. in the presence of  
His Excellency Vice-Admiral Ian Corder, C.B.  
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

## **PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

## **EVOCATION**

**The Greffier:** To the Members of the States of the Island of Guernsey, I hereby give notice that a meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at the Royal Court House on Wednesday 11th May 2016 at 9.30 a.m. to consider the items contained in Billet d'État XIII and XV which have been submitted for debate.

### **Procedural – Clarification and election procedure**

5 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States of Deliberation, good morning to you all.  
Before we start, there are just two procedural matters I would draw to your attention. First of all, in Billet XIII, on page 2060, the note that sets out the criteria for the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee is a little misleading, in that it says that:

'Pursuant to the Mandate of the Scrutiny Management Committee, a President of the Committee shall not be the President or a member of the Policy & Resources Committee ...'

That is correct, but it goes on to say:

'... or the President or a member of more than one of the six Principal Committees.'

10 In fact, what the mandate says is that:

'The President of the Scrutiny Management Committee shall not be the President or a member of *any* of the six Principal Committees.'

So shall not be either President or member of the Policy & Resources Committee or President or member of any of the six Principal Committees. That is just to make that clear before we get under way.

15 The other thing I just wanted to say is that in terms of procedure, the procedure will be very similar to the procedure we followed last Wednesday in relation to the election of the President of the Policy & Resources Committee, save that if there is only one candidate nominated for any particular presidency then there will be a speech from each proposer and each candidate but no question time. I hope that is all clear. If anybody has any questions on the procedure generally, then please raise it now, but otherwise, Greffier, will you please announce the first Article.

## Billet d'État XIII

### **I. Committee for Economic Development – Election of President – Deputy Ferbrache elected**

*Article I.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Economic Development to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

20 **The Greffier:** Billet XIII, Article I, Committee for Economic Development – Election of President.

**The Bailiff:** Do we have any nominations?  
Deputy St Pier.

25 **Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I wish to nominate Deputy Peter Ferbrache.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Peter Ferbrache. Is there a seconder for Deputy Ferbrache?

**Deputy Trott:** There is, sir.

30

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

Any other nominations for the President of the Committee for Economic Development?

No? I see no one else rising. In that case, Deputy St Pier do you wish to speak in favour of your nominee?

35

**Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I can and I shall be brief.

I think Deputy Ferbrache needs little introduction. His credentials need little introduction, particularly following the lengthy session at last week's meeting of the States last Wednesday. I think, clearly, Deputy Ferbrache's previous career and his family interests give him clear and demonstrable experience of both the business services and the hospitality sectors of our economy. I think there can be little doubt, given his previous career, that he is quite capable of taking a brief on all the other sectors of the economy. Sir, the presidency of the Economic Development Committee will, of course, be a relatively high profile role requiring both speaking engagements on and off the Island as well as a media presence and a media profile, and, again, I think Deputy Ferbrache's credentials to discharge that with distinction are beyond doubt.

45

Sir, therefore, I am delighted and pleased to be able to propose Deputy Ferbrache, with the unanimous support of the Policy & Resources Committee, and strongly encourage the Assembly to do the same.

50 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

**Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, like Deputy St Pier – and I am grateful to him and his colleagues for the nomination and support – I will be brief, because I am not going to repeat all the words that I said last week, although I ask the States to take note of them.

55

Somebody described our economy and it reminded me of the quote from Macbeth, 'Hubble, bubble, toil and trouble,' but equally in relation to the very wise words of Deputy St Pier on the

60 phone last Sunday when he said he is quietly optimistic. So am I, but we have, under our responsibility, if elected to this office – which I am not presuming even now, sometimes one horse races, the horse falls at the final fence, but let's hope that is not the case, I will be coming back next week with a team which I believe will be cohesive and collegiate, and I and that team will seek to drive forward the words 'economic development' in their full force. This is not the time for navel gazing, it is not the time for self-indulgence; there are priorities and again you can tell I have read a few books in my life, because I am going to quote from Animal Farm where they say:

'Some animals are equal, but some animals are more equal than others.'

65 Here, we have got all the priorities but we have got some key priorities. Our key priorities are to develop and promote the businesses across the Island. Another key priority is to protect and enhance the reputation of commerce and industry, and another key priority is to establish good travel links throughout the Bailiwick, and particularly with our sister Island in Alderney. All of those are key matters. I sincerely believe that we can, over the next four and a bit years ... we will have a troubled and difficult road, but with what I believe will be a very strong team, if elected by the States next week, I believe we can drive that forward, and I ask the States to vote for me.

**The Bailiff:** Well, Members, as there is only one candidate, voting will be *aux voix*. I remind you that Deputy Ferbrache is proposed by Deputy St Pier and seconded by Deputy Trott. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

75 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Ferbrache elected as the President of the Committee for Economic Development. (*Applause*)

Deputy Le Clerc, do you wish to be *relevée*?

80 **Deputy Le Clerc:** Yes, please, sir.

**The Bailiff:** It is quite warm in here, so those who wish to do so may remove their jackets.

## II. Committee for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of President – Debate commenced

*Article II.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article II, Committee for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of President.

85 **The Bailiff:** Do we have any nominations?  
Deputy Gollop?

90 **Deputy Gollop:** Oh, my little top has come off!  
I want to put forward the name of Deputy Charles Parkinson.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson, and is there a seconder?

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Yes, sir.

95 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel. Thank you.  
Any other nominations?  
Deputy Ferbrache.

100 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I would like to nominate Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher, and the seconder? Deputy Graham.  
Anyone else?  
Yes, Deputy Roffey.

105 **Deputy Roffey:** Thank you, sir,  
I would like to put forward the name of Deputy Shane Langlois.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois, and a seconder?

110 **Deputy Tooley:** Yes.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, thank you very much, Deputy Tooley.  
Deputy Trott.

115 **Deputy Trott:** Sir, I would like to propose Deputy Paul Le Pelley.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Paul Le Pelley, and a seconder?

**Deputy Soulsby:** Yes, sir.

120 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby.  
Anymore? No.

Well, in that case we have four candidates nominated: Deputy Parkinson, proposed by Deputy Gollop, seconded by Deputy Laurie Queripel; Deputy Kuttelwascher, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Graham; Deputy Langlois, proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Tooley; and Deputy Le Pelley, proposed by Deputy Trott and seconded – sorry, yes, I said Deputy Tooley, I meant Deputy Tindall. I do apologise (*Interjection*) Oh it is right you are sitting in the wrong seats – I thought I was right but my seating plan says otherwise. Deputy Langlois, proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Tooley – it is my seating plan. It is wrong, not your seating. Deputy Le Pelley, proposed by Deputy Trott, seconded by Deputy Soulsby.

130 So I invite those four candidates to come up on to the bench for question time, and to be seated in alphabetical order, starting from the window, with Deputy Kuttelwascher closest to the window – in other words, get some fresh air.

135 The speeches will be in the order in which candidates were proposed, so the first speech will be by Deputy Gollop in favour of Deputy Parkinson.  
Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** Thank you very much, sir.

140 I have been, of course, a political colleague of Deputy Parkinson for most of the last 12 years. I recall that we worked together on Scrutiny, for example, which was a very interesting Committee, and also later on when Deputy Parkinson led the States' Strategic Plan through its various

manifestations and I was privileged to serve on that board with, amongst others, the recently retired Deputy Chief Minister, Deputy Allister Langlois, and Deputy Mike Garrett.

145 I would point out here that Deputy Parkinson has had a distinguished business career, a trained qualified barrister and accountant he was extremely successful at, I believe, Pannell Kerr Forster, and became an acknowledged expert on French taxation amongst other subjects. But, more relevantly for this role, he is not only a popular politician, having polled in the top two in both the South East of Guernsey and St Peter Port North, but recently, according to a *Guernsey*  
150 *Press* survey, whether it is accurate or not, was in the top five of popular politicians. In that sense he probably can take on a not always popular presidency and lead it forward without any significant problems.

He comes from an academic family. His father was a resident of St Martin's and a professor of history and, of course, he is perhaps as well known for Parkinson's Law about work expanding to fill the time available, which seems to apply to the States at times, (*Laughter*) and his father was  
155 also a Conseiller, I think, at one point and his mother taught maths.

He has a great interest in education and we found out recently he actually attended a school in Alderney, I believe, St Anne's, as well as various schools in Guernsey and in England. His oldest daughter is a qualified teacher and works in the Civil Service in London. He studied law at  
160 Cambridge and is ... well he describes himself as an amateur historian, but that is perhaps underselling his abilities because his work on the Dark Ages and the Celtic past is fascinating.

He is very interested in the ancient history of Guernsey, and has written at least one book on the subject. He gave a lecture recently to the students of Ladies' College and Elizabeth College on the historical King Arthur and maybe the real Merlin.

165 He has been studying education reforms in England, initiated by the not always popular current Lord Chancellor Michael Gove and now led by Nicky Morgan. He does not subscribe to any educational dogmas but wants to develop a system for Guernsey drawing on best practice elsewhere. It is also well known that he would like to see a university established in Guernsey and Alderney.

170 He has been prepared to already discuss some of his views publicly and I think that they would bring an exciting dimension, not only the new ideas and policies that Deputy Parkinson is renowned for, and the analytical mind and the vision, but also a way of building bridges between sometimes two opposites and actually coming up with new ideas that will make the 21st century work much better.

175 So I therefore commend his candidature and I personally, I think, share many of his visions, not just to see more higher education on the Islands, but maybe an approach to education that could embrace, for example, academies as well as the best of what we already have.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

180

**Deputy Parkinson:** Sir, I think I need to preface my remarks by explaining that the English education system is going through profound changes, particularly for the years leading up to GCSE. The old gold standard that we are all used to, of five GCSE passes grades A\* to C including English and maths, is being replaced by several measures, of which the most important are called  
185 the Attainment 8, and the Progress 8.

This is happening now and over the years from now until 2018. Attainment 8 and Progress 8 are much wider than the present gold standard. They include five exams from what is called the English Baccalaureate, including English and maths, and candidates can score marks from a further three exams chosen from any GCSE subject in a wide range of vocational options. The last  
190 Education board chose not to follow England's lead on this, but I believe that we must – Jersey has – and the reason is simply that students from Guernsey who apply to universities usually apply to universities in England, and those who go from school straight out to work will be assessed by HR personnel who will increasingly be familiar, mainly, with the English qualification system.

195 The vocational subjects available in the new system include a very wide range, for example, business and finance, art and design, creative studies, child development and care, constructing the built environment, engineering, hairdressing and beauty therapy, health and social care, computer technology, open systems, computing and sports science, to name but a few. There are somewhere in the region of 150 vocational options on top of every possible GCSE.

200 Sir, some of these vocational subjects are provided by our College of Further Education, but it is clear that a small education system like Guernsey's cannot hope to offer all of the options, and it certainly cannot hope to offer more than a handful on any one site. My view is we need to sit down and decide what options we can offer and what site. This is where the rebuild of La Mare becomes critical, because the redevelopment gives us an opportunity to make specific provision on that site for options that we would like to offer, and which cannot be conveniently provided at  
205 any of our other sites.

This seismic change in the English education system is what leads me to the conclusion that we need to re-organise our four secondary schools, in harmony with the College of Further Education, and to make them academies. These will specialise in some of the options outside the E-Bac subjects, and to a degree within those subjects.

210 I am not hung up about the name 'academy' and all I mean by that term is 'self-governing schools'. I am well aware that the term has become controversial in the UK, where some schools would prefer to remain under local authority control. But I do think that we will need all four sites to provide a reasonable spread of options, and I want the schools to specialise in pre-determined areas.

215 At age 10 or 11, children, guided by their parents and teachers, should choose the school that most closely matches their interests and aptitudes. They will be free to move between schools if they later find that they have made a mistake, up to end of Key Stage 3 when, aged about 14, they will choose the subjects that they want to study for the Attainment 8 and the Progress 8. This, sir, would be a system designed to meet the demands of the curriculum which puts children front and  
220 centre; [*mobile phone*] students would be taught in the school that best suits them and no-one would be labelled as a failure. It is a system designed to get the best results for every child and, in consequence, the school well above the national average for the school system as a whole.

225 Sir, I realise that these ideas represent a departure from the *status quo*, which will not wholly satisfy some of those devoted to our present system, and that they will also not appeal entirely to those who want three or four undifferentiated secondary schools, but I think my plan is more than simply a compromise. I believe it is the best option for Guernsey's children and one which meets the demands of the curriculum of 2016.

I would like to see courses in the local curriculum also focussing on Guernsey's history, language and culture. These may not count towards academic qualifications, but I think it is  
230 important for us to preserve our cultural identity.

As a further matter, and as an aside, we do need to update the 1970 Education Law to reflect these changes. The Law is well out of date.

235 Other issues facing the Education, Sport & Culture Committee include the successful implementation of a pre-school education programme. This represents one of the family-friendly policies that I believe this States should prioritise.

In terms of tertiary education, I think there are three options for widening the opportunities available to our school leavers. Firstly, we must continue to support the GTA University Centre and the courses it is delivering in finance, business and law, as well as the work of the Institute for Health & Social Care Studies. Secondly, I believe we need to introduce a student loan scheme to  
240 help families with children at universities in the UK and elsewhere. Thirdly, I want to investigate and conduct a feasibility study on the idea of a university in Guernsey and Alderney. I believe that the feasibility study could be undertaken for little or no cost.

Sir, the Education, Sport & Culture Committee is the product of a merger of two old Departments and so far I have only talked about Education. The sport and culture elements of the

245 mandate are also very important. Guernsey has a rich tradition of participation in sporting and cultural pastimes, and this is a tradition that we must nurture and develop.

In matters of sport, sir, I make no claim to athletic prowess, but I have been, in my time, a competitive sailor and I have taken part in world, European and national championships of various dinghy classes. I am also a past winner of the biggest yacht race in the Channel Islands calendar. I was also involved with coaching junior sailors at the Guernsey Yacht Club for many years, all three of my daughters represented Great Britain in dinghy sailing and I know the difficulties and expense that many Guernsey teens face when they are competing off-Island. We should help those if we can.

255 During this term the Education, Sports & Culture Committee will be preparing for the Island Games in 2021, but it will not fall to this Committee to host those games. There are, nevertheless, plenty of opportunities for us to develop sports tourism for the benefit of local competitors and our economy.

In terms of culture, I was, for many years, a member of the Committee of the Arts Council in Guernsey and undertook the promotion of musical events ranging from opera to rock concerts at Beau Séjour, St James, and the Fermain Tavern. I collect modern European paintings, and I play the guitar, very badly, so I will not neglect the culture part of the mandate.

265 In conclusion, sir, I offer to lead the Education, Sport & Culture Committee through a reform of our secondary system which will put the child first and which will meet the demands of the new structure of the GCSEs. I believe that my proposal will command the support of most of the teaching profession on the Island, while preserving and enhancing our several centres of academic excellence. I will be creative in addressing the problems of students struggling to meet the cost of tertiary education, and I want the cultural and sporting life of the Island to remain vibrant and to flourish. I ask Members to support me in this venture, to allow me to achieve all of this for the Island's benefit.

270

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache will speak in support of Deputy Kuttelwascher's nomination.

**Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, the mandate for this Committee is very wide indeed. It is education, sport and culture, and all three have their importance. When I looked at the mandate of the Committee I looked back at the purpose and the purpose, I will read it, is:

'To encourage human development by maximising opportunities for participation and excellence through education, learning, sport and culture at every stage of life.'

280 To me, that means from when the child goes to his or her first nursery school, to the 82-year-old who is attending a College of Education course or doing an Open University degree. All of that is equally important. It is a massive remit. When I looked at that I was reminded of another book that I have read is *Guernsey People* written by L James Marr. It spoke about a former Bailiff and said he was a person of sterling worth and, having got to know Deputy Kuttelwascher over the last few months, he is a person of that worth. He is a person who has leadership skills, who will take what is a difficult decision in relation to lots of difficult matters in a sensible way.

285 Because the Manchester United match was delayed for 45 minutes yesterday evening, I listened twice to Deputy Kuttelwascher's one-minute manifesto from April 2012. He spoke about financial prudence, but more than that, he concluded it by saying there are three key factors, self-discipline, common sense and leadership. The person who accedes to this presidency needs all three of those qualities. That man has those qualities in abundance.

290 Not only was he a BOAC/British Airways pilot, flying those massive things across all the oceans of the world with the lives of 300, 400 or 500 people under his care for upwards of 31 years, his leadership qualities – and that is what we are talking about with a Committee like this – were recognised by his employers, because he went on the leadership course and he became a senior trainer of pilots – intelligent, skilled people – this man was faced with the responsibility of doing that. As he has reminded me 20 times in the last two or three weeks, he is the only candidate ever

295 from St Peter Port South who has polled more than 1,000 votes twice. But more important than that, he was Deputy Treasury Minister in the last States, he has had positions of responsibility and every time he has increased his vote. Now, you have got to listen, Members of the States, to people who are popular with the electorate, you have got to listen to a person of his quality.

Deputy Jones and I often speak about our humble beginnings – not for us, middle class fripperies and indecisiveness. Not like me to make those comments at all. Deputy Kuttelwascher, whose family were political refugees from the communist state of Czechoslovakia as it then was, until the age of three was a political refugee. This man I have marched up and down the streets of St Peter Port South with; I have seen at the closest quarters you possibly can; I, above all else with these four commendable candidates, recognise this man has the qualities, because not only has he got leadership qualities, not only has he got common sense, not only has he got self-discipline, he also has that great quality of humour. That is important in two characteristics, it can diffuse tensions and it is a great element of persuasion. I have seen that used so many times by people who have that ability.

I commend to you. He was not here from 1626, like my lot, but there are all of three generations of Kuttelwascher's here. His daughter is here and his grandchildren are here. This is a man to lead this very important Department over the next four years.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, I feel somewhat humbled by that, but there we go.

315 Sir, I have been persuaded to stand for this position by a number of colleagues whose opinion and counsel I truly value and respect. My personal education CV is quite brief. I did succeed at the 11-plus. I attended a grammar school and I read physics at Queen Mary College, as it was called then – part of the University of London.

Over the last four years I have been involved with numerous operational issues with the Education Department as a result of my membership of the Treasury & Resources Department. As a member of a particular subcommittee – the Information and Communications Technology Subcommittee – I became aware of Education's inability to deliver its technology-assisted learning objectives because of a lack of bandwidth.

A meeting was hastily arranged between myself and non-States' members and a director of a telecoms company. The situation was rapidly remedied and was a very welcome example of corporate social responsibility. The Education Department were most grateful.

I was one of the political Treasury & Resources representatives meeting regularly with Education to try and resolve the issue of the funding for pre-school education, and it was resolved. I was the T&R political representative on the Beaucamps Project Board for the four years I was on that Department. I am overly well versed with the business case presented for the rebuild of La Mare School, it consumed a very large amount of staff and board time, and I do not think the exercise is over yet.

My view on selection was published in the *Press Election Supplement* and reads as follows:

'11 Plus has become a toxic issue for many, the very word selection promotes elitism if not snobbery. The past foul nature of this selection encourages and perpetuates this reaction.'

I would suggest an educational direction assessment would be more appropriate in the last two years of primary school to include the three Rs. No more pass or fail. The termination of the Grammar School would be most foolish. It provides a centre of excellence to rival the colleges, it is available to all families, irrespective of means. The Grammar School is attractive to incomers of modest means, and facilitates recruitment and retention. It provides a positive stimulus to our economy. It could be re-designated as the Guernsey College. I would support any move to retain the Grammar School with an appropriate entry assessment.

Sir, if elected, my first priority would be to restore some stability to the Education Department, by bringing a very short report to the Assembly on 8th June to reconfirm, or otherwise, its stance

on selection. The last States did the same thing in relation to the Financial Transformation Programme. That was a highly contentious programme, and the States – the last States –  
345 reconfirmed it, and we continued with the programme. If this policy of getting rid of the selection process is reconfirmed, then I just want to read what it says in Annex 1 of the Rules of the new Rules of General Responsibilities of all Committees of the States. In B Section 7 it says, half way down:

‘... the States may at any time they consider it desirable issue directions to a committee and that committee shall be expected to carry into effect any such directions irrespective of whether that committee or any of its individual members agree or disagree with such directions ...’

Those directions were given in the March debate. The report from Education was heavily  
350 amended and those are the extant Resolutions that are there at this time. If this Assembly want to change that, the first step, as I suggested, is you have to decide whether you want to continue to support the whole principle of selection or not. Therefore, it is obvious, I do not propose to be a bull in a china shop, and I do not see there is any point in developing any new policies until that particular issue is resolved once and for all.

355 My overarching policy will be to promote value for money initiatives, and support the Service Guernsey Programme with particular scrutiny of governance within the Education Department.

So I want to focus on leadership for a moment. I am aware of three Members of this Assembly who have completed, successfully, a formal leadership course: two retired Army officers and myself. For half of my career, I not only conducted leadership courses but also was an approved  
360 Civil Aviation Authority Examiner observing leadership performance in others. Part of my own training required completion of an instructional skills course. My manifesto included a definition of leadership as relates to our consensus form of Government, and I will read that out. I said:

‘Leadership is a process of social persuasion which maximises the efforts of others towards achieving the greater good.’

I said, ‘hope is not enough’ at the end, but that is not really relevant ... but it is relevant. It is social process. What I mean here is that you have to be persuasive. There is no authority to force  
365 anybody to do anything. There may be in the Army where you are backed by the Law, but it is all a matter of persuasion. That is an art. You would be surprised how many things came into being because of some backseat driving that I was involved in. You can persuade from the rear seat, or you can drive. If you can drive, you do things quicker. Doing things from the back seat, it happens a lot slower but it can happen.

370 In order to discharge those leadership responsibilities, there are several issues that need to be addressed.

One is medical: you have to be sound in mind and body. By ‘sound in body’ I mean you should not be suffering any debilitating physical sickness which causes pain which would detract from your capabilities.

375 Situational awareness – that is an interesting one. That is my anti-silo mentality slogan, if you like. You cannot act just as a particular committee; you have to take into account the effects on everybody else, including financing of whatever it is you may want to promote.

Technical – that relates very much to being properly informed about whatever it is you are dealing with; very important.

380 Feedback – you have to listen; not only listen, but take note of what you hear. It is no good having a consultation and having an overwhelming view in one area and then ignoring it.

You have to be capable of a systematic analysis and a very important factor is you have got to be able to prioritise. That is so important and it will be a very important issue when it comes to dealing with prioritising any new service delivery.

385 There is another one which is strange; it is modifying behaviour – you can never change a character, but you can modify your behaviour. If, in your private life, you are a rather raucous, coarse sort of person and liable to crack jokes which others may not wish to hear, you cannot do

that in the environment we work in. It is true. Being able to do that and knowing how to behave in a particular situation is self-discipline and is very important.

390 So, sir, I see effective leadership as an absolute necessity to discharge the responsibilities of this Committee, which I have often regarded, and others, as a poisoned chalice Committee, along with others like HSSD, along with the Treasury Department, which I was on for four years. You will, on this Committee – or one is continually being – scrutinised by the media, *The Press*, the public, and you can expect a lot of abuse. Well, I still have my leatherback turtle shell intact. As I said four  
395 years ago, I am like a leather back turtle, so that does not bother me. So I am happy to provide effective leadership of this particular Committee, Members, if you so wish.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey will speak in support of Deputy Langlois.

400 **Deputy Roffey:** Thank you, sir.

As others have already said, this is the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture, and all three are important. But I want to focus on education first, because it has been such a massive subject on the political scene over recent months.

Deputy Langlois' deep and abiding passion for matters educational is nothing new and I am  
405 sure those Members that have served with him in the past in this Assembly will be well aware of it. Put simply, he really cares about education. Therefore, this is a natural Department for him to go for.

Deputy Langlois believes that Guernsey should optimise the potential of every single one of its young citizens, and indeed not just the young ones, but also the older ones through continual  
410 development throughout their lifetime. He believes that for two reasons: firstly, for their own sake, to make sure they optimise their own life chances; but, secondly, as an economic enabler, because Guernsey only has one natural resource – leaving aside tidal power maybe, but apart from that one overwhelming natural resource – and that is its people, and Deputy Langlois believes we have to invest in them wisely.

415 Sir, if he is elected he intends to press on in a timely manner with the task of reforming secondary and tertiary education as started in the dying days of the last Assembly. He thinks we ought to do that relatively quickly, because the present uncertainty is not healthy. But he is also clear that it needs to be done in a thoughtful and considered manner, to make sure that the outcome is both sensible and sustainable. He believes that one lesson we should take from the  
420 March debate – and I agree with him totally on this – is that there are dangers in a rushed debate, a rushed report and a rushed Resolution.

Sir, before leaving the issue of education, it is worth bearing in mind that Deputy Langlois was actually a T&R representative for four years on Les Beaucamps School Project Board – a very  
425 useful background, particularly given that there is going to be almost no continuity at all in terms of members of the Education board, so at least that background gives him an insight into the work that was going on previously.

Moving on to sport, Deputy Langlois is a well-rounded individual – I know I should not say it in every sense of the expression – and therefore he is keen on many sports, but he is the first to say  
430 he is probably keen more as a spectator than a competitor and, for that reason, if he is elected he will, I am sure, ensure that at least one member of the team that he puts forward is more actively engaged in sport than he is himself.

When it comes to culture, well, Deputy Langlois is absolutely steeped in Guernsey culture which is what we would expect as a member of the Langlois clan, who have been in Guernsey since the year dot. Mind you, think about their name; we do know where they came from!  
435 *(Laughter)*

I do hope Members will forgive him those origins – they were many centuries ago, I think even earlier than the Ferbraches – and would consider voting for him today. I am sorry about the cliché, but he would be a round peg in a round hole. He cares about education, he is thoughtful, he is calm and he will apply himself to this job, and I really hope you vote for him.

440 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Thank you, sir.

The mandate of this Committee is broad but clearly the focus of the moment is on secondary education. I will be covering the broader mandate later, but first I will make my position on secondary education clear.

445 Happily, I find myself in the position of being the *status quo* candidate, in that I am standing on a platform of progressing the extant States' Resolutions diligently, and reporting back to the States, as instructed by those Resolutions, as soon as possible. Those at the coal face of our education system have pleaded for an end to the uncertainty that is proving so disruptive and dispiriting for them and their pupils, and attempting to engineer a policy U-turn under the guise of this election will only add to the uncertainty, not ameliorate it – whatever some may claim. I would regret a requête being brought in the future, but that would be a much more satisfactory, open and transparent route to attempt a revision of existing policy than using today's election procedure.

450  
455 Clearly, the primary extant Resolution is to agree that the current selective admission of students to the States' secondary schools, and the grant-aided colleges, based predominantly on the 11-plus examination shall be replaced by non-selective admission.

460 A year or so before I and Deputy Ferbrache were born, our grandfathers' generation introduced one of the States' foremost progressive measures: 25% of the pupils in our parish primary schools were given the opportunity to prove, at 16, they would benefit from a post-16 education. Until then, post-16 education had only been available to Guernsey's very top tier, whose parents could afford the college fees.

465 Sixty five years later, it is time we extended that same opportunity to all our primary school pupils. The compromises of intervening years, whilst benefiting a minority of students, failed to deliver equal opportunity, and by that I mean the opportunity for each to fulfil their own potential. Not only do all our children deserve that opportunity, but Guernsey needs as many as possible to take advantage of it in a world becoming more and more knowledge based. We are too reliant on importing professionals, civil servants and the like, largely because we hobble many of our own students within an archaic education system.

470 I will summarise the five main reasons why I believe the States is finally on the right course, having ended selection at 11, as follows.

Firstly, a pupil's intelligence relative to their peers is not fixed, as was believed when selection at 11 was formalised 70 years ago, therefore any test or assessment at 11 aimed at predicting academic ability at 16 has a wide margin of error.

475 Secondly, no-one has been able, or ever will be able, to devise objective tests or assessments of academic ability at 11 which cannot be heavily influenced by coaching.

480 Thirdly, academic ability is only a part of an individual's personality and worth. As such, 11 is far too young an age to categorise pupils according to academic ability and then separate them into different schools on that basis. As the time pupils spend in the education system has increased over the years, 14 has become the new 11. The proposals reflected this with guided self-selection at that age.

485 Fifth, selection for setting provides all the degree of separation necessary in our schools. A tried and tested system that has proved so effective in our mixed ability colleges. I am aware I am giving undue emphasis to those pupils who aspire to post-16 academic education, but that is because predicting suitability for post-16 academic education was the whole *raison d'être* of the 11-plus, the subject of the primary Resolution.

490 In the past, the States may have been appallingly slow in opening up the pathways to post-16 education, but in its favour, the gates have never been closed up again once they have creaked open a little. In March this year, those gates were finally opened and I am confident they will remain that way.

The close juxtaposition of the debate on the future structure of secondary and post-16 education report and the election has created a dichotomy for the Committee. There is a further extant States' Resolution that 11-16 education shall be provided in three schools, and that the Committee shall report back as soon as possible on ceasing 11-16 education at either La Varendes or La Mare de Carteret sites. These conflicts with the majority of successful election candidates, myself included, having declared during the campaign they will not support the closure of any of our four existing schools. Resolving this problem will not be as difficult as it first appears. Whilst there were sound educational and financial reasons for a three-school system 15 years ago, we are where we are: three quarters of the way through developing a four-school system.

As President of the Committee, I will use my best endeavours to fulfil the States' Resolutions. As an architect, I anticipate reverting to a three-school model at this stage will prove financially and practically less attractive than the four-school option.

This election is about a lot more than selection at 11 or even education. The Committee mandate has been expanded to include culture and sports. If elected, I propose setting up two three-person sub-committees – one each for culture and for sport. They would have the authority of being a majority of the board, and therefore able to make decisions, if unanimous, whilst having the safety net that even if one member has doubts, the matter can be taken up to the full board.

Such a system worked very well when I was a member of the States' Treasury & Resources Department. The sub-committees would be lighter on their feet than a full board, and able to form a closer relationship with outside bodies; for example, the sports and the arts commissions. We should be looking to leverage and to support the great work being done by the private sector, and the volunteers who are the backbone of sport and culture in Guernsey.

One of the main points I made in my manifesto is that the States has to heal the rift that has opened up between many islanders and the public sector – a rift that has resulted in regular criticism of the public sector, as being overmanned by unproductive middle management.

Education's HQ has been a prime target of that criticism, and I would want to address that in two ways. Firstly, by publishing Education's management structure and job descriptions in a readily comprehensible form. Secondly, by revealing how the Mulkerrin Report's recommendations to devolve functions to individual schools has been, and will be, implemented under the new system. Clearly, there has to be a balance as some functions are more efficiently performed centrally and others by devolution.

A further priority will be looking at the impact of the primary schools' reorganisation on those schools now receiving pupils from St Andrew's and St Sampson's Infants. Islanders need reassurance that we are being objective and honest about the transition, and that any unanticipated problems are recognised and acknowledged.

Finally, I will return to the elephant in the room, which is that many want to believe that there is a fair and more accurate alternative to the 11-plus, which would justify both continuing to separate pupils into two categories – academic and non-academic – at an early age, and retaining our high schools as secondary modern schools. That alternative does not exist. Deputies Trott and Le Pelley tabled a last minute amendment in March to retain selection based on a combination of progress tests and continuous assessment during a pupil's final two years at primary school. Where that idea came from I do not know, and was quite convincingly defeated.

During the course of the debate on the amendment, which I recommend Members revisit in *Hansard*, Deputy Green said:

'If anything, I would like to congratulate the proposer and seconder of this amendment, because actually they have managed to make the 11-Plus look good.'

It is a line worth remembering because it will be applicable if ever anybody in this Assembly tries to convince Members there is a viable third way. There is not. It always has been and always will be a binary choice. And a virtual binary choice is what Members have before them today, either to become mired in clumsy attempts at U-turns, or to take the first steps towards being the

540 best States ever by endorsing me as the President of the Education ... (*Laughter*) Sport & Culture  
Committee.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Trott, in support of Deputy Le Pelley.

545

**Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir.

As the President of the Committee for Economic Development reminded us earlier, the purpose of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture is:

'To encourage human development by maximising opportunities for participation and excellence through education, learning, sport and culture at every stage of life.'

550 Sir, Deputy Le Pelley has excelled at education, learning, sport and culture at every stage of his  
life. Looking at the policy categories of this new combined department, it becomes immediately  
apparent that whether it be secondary education, lifelong learning, sport, recreation, youth affairs,  
the arts, libraries, museums or Liberation Day Celebrations, Deputy Le Pelley ticks the required  
boxes over and over again, and without exception. If we set out to develop a role from scratch  
that captured Deputy Le Pelley's skill set then this would be it. His suitability for the role is quite  
555 extraordinary.

Let me elaborate. Sir, Deputy Le Pelley trained at the Bishop Otter College of Higher Education  
where he obtained a Certificate in Education in 1972. He is a qualified school librarian and has  
been a full member of the College of Preceptors since 1981. He is a qualified youth club leader  
and was the Assistant Bailiwick Commissioner for the Guernsey Scout Association between 1986  
560 and 2000, with responsibility for special needs throughout this period.

Sir, he is a qualified football referee – although I maintain I was never offside! (*Laughter*) He  
holds coaching certificates in volleyball, cricket and hockey, and has represented our Island several  
times in the latter discipline. He was Curator and Education Officer for the National Trust of  
Guernsey Folk and Costume Museum between 2005 and 2012, and a member, Vice-President and  
565 President of the Channel Island Occupation Society from 1972 to date.

Sir, he was elected by his peers, in recognition of his leadership, teaching and diplomacy skills,  
to be the negotiating secretary of the NAS/UWT, the Teachers Union, between 1979 and 1987,  
and was the Union's Vice-President, President and Past President between 1988 and 1991.

570 Sir, among the number of States' duties in the last Assembly, Deputy Le Pelley was a Scrutiny  
Committee member, serving latterly as its Vice-Chair and, unsurprisingly, he was a key part of its  
Children's Law Review Panel. He also performed a number of key roles on, and is the only  
returning member of, the Culture & leisure Committee of 2012 to 2016, which is the new Sport &  
Culture part of Education's mandate.

575 But, sir, what of Deputy Le Pelley's teaching skills? Sir, Deputy Le Pelley was not simply a  
teacher in Guernsey for 32 years, until his retirement from teaching a decade ago, he was an  
inspiration to generations of our young people. I fondly remember my own little sister coming  
home from school over 30 years ago beaming from ear to ear. I asked her why she was so happy.  
She told me it was because she and her friends had the most brilliant teacher who made teaching  
fun. It was easy to learn with Mr Le Pelley, she told me, and absolutely everyone respected him –  
580 pupils, teachers and parents alike. Sir, if I had a fiver for everyone I had met during the Election  
campaign that spoke in equally glowing terms about Deputy Le Pelley, I would be as wealthy as  
Deputy Ferbrache! (*Laughter*)

585 Sir, a key feature of leadership is the ability to positively influence the behaviour and actions of  
others; another is the composure and confidence that a lifetime of relevant experience brings. In  
Deputy Le Pelley you have it all.

Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy le Pelley:** Thank you very much, sir.

590 I would first of all like to thank my proposer and seconder, Deputies Trott and Soulsby – especially Deputy Trott for those lovely words. He is actually going to make me stumble a little because I did not realise he was going to say such nice things.

Sir, four years ago I entered the States as a Member – a Member for the district of St Sampson's. When I first came in, I thought I was going to move mountains, I thought it was going to happen overnight. I was soon very, very quickly put in my place. Nothing happens very quickly in the States of Guernsey. I decided, rather, to serve my apprenticeship. I have done that. Others who went straight to the top have struggled; some of them have even struggled to get re-elected, but I have served, as Deputy Trott has told you, on three boards or committees: Housing, Culture & Leisure and Scrutiny. I have been on two investigative committees, SLAWS and SWBIC, as well as a member of Douzaine Liaison Group. I have chaired several Scrutiny Panel public hearings, and Culture & Leisure sub-committees.

My manifesto states quite clearly that we were going to look at the debate on Guernsey's Education Department's proposals on secondary education; I voted at that time, when we were debating it right at the very end of last term, that we should actually sursis the debate. The idea of 47 Members – two Alderney Reps and 45 Deputies – actually deciding something on the very last day of term, which was going to have a terrific effect on this particular body, who would have to deliver something that they had not participated in, seemed to me rather silly. Here we are now, actually going to have to debate it all over again.

I said it would turn into a General Election issue; it certainly was. I managed to get something in the region of just shy of 1,900 votes when I went through the district, and through the Election; and I can say that over 1,800 of those were all in support of some form of re-constituted selection process. As many as that! It may be that some people were a little concerned about how many people might be attending the St Sampson's High School if we were to drop down into three secondary schools.

But, having challenged people on that issue, the answer very clearly given, even by some of the older people, was that they actually valued the Grammar School education; they valued it, but they were a little concerned about the selection method. More than being concerned about the selection method, they were actually worried that in fact, because it was faulty – and it is faulty – the area of intelligence – 'intelligency', as some people have called it – which can be artificially raised by coaching ... when that coaching stops you revert back, you drop back. It is possible for someone at the age of 9, 10, 11 to receive two years of coaching or so to actually artificially get over that level, over that barrier, and then when the coaching stops having passed – if that is the right term to use – an outdated exam, in my opinion, they can actually drop back to the wrong side of that level. They are then at a Grammar School and they struggle.

That is why Deputy Trott and I suggested, after much thought, it was not something that was cobbled together right at the very last minute. We thought it right the way through. This was something that had to be changed, something that had to be made more valid; and if you take a child's ability – proven ability, proven own ability – you take that by a continuous assessment programme over the last two years of their school life in the primary school, and you build in various areas where you can actually have controlled conditions, so you know that is the child's true ability, not being helped by extra care at home, by mum and dad or by elder siblings, that is the attainment level that that child had got – you can be much safer in actually working out which education system that child will flourish best in.

But that is not all. Many years ago, when I first started teaching, there was a thing called the 13-plus, and it used to work – or it *could* work, if there had been a syllabus which everybody was following at the same time. Now the National Curriculum has actually done that. You now have a system in place. It does not matter whether you are being taught in England or Wales, because it is the English and Welsh system, not the English system. If you are being taught anywhere in England and Wales or the Channel Islands, you can move from one area to another and you can

640 know that you are going to be roughly on the same page in every single subject, and moving from one to the other is easy.

We could have, and we must have if selection at 11 comes back in, the ability for these youngsters at 13 or 14 to be able to move across, up or down – whichever word you want to use – but move across into the level that they are currently performing at. I do not want to see youngsters being held back, and I do not want to see youngsters struggling because the pace has moved on. That is why I have put in my manifesto that I would like to see the retention of the Grammar School, albeit with a much reduced stressful type of assessment at 11, with a safety net of being able to transfer, if you have got it wrong or if the progress has moved on at 13 or 14. Absolutely essential.

650 I also made it quite clear that I thought the idea of an Education Department going out to consultation with the parents *'Your Schools, Your Choice'* and then actually coming back and having the audacity to say that they were going to totally disregard the public's opinion ... 61% wanted some form of selective education. That was brushed aside because it was not suitable or did not fit with the preconceived idea. Despicable! I am sure this area needs to be debated again.

655 I am also very concerned with all the last minute amendments that were thrown this way and that toward the end of last term's debate. The idea of three schools: what size of school are we going to have if we have three schools? Which schools are you going to actually build and improve or increase the size of? None of them are readily fit to take 900 pupils or 800 pupils.

660 I will tell you, with all of the experience I have had – and I know it is 10 years ago and I have moved along a little bit and have had two careers since then, but – having 800 plus students in a school is a recipe for disaster if you want to have good discipline, good behaviour and total inclusion of all people.

You need teachers who will be able to identify youngsters and identify with youngsters and to identify any kind of potential troubles that may be coming along. With 400 or 500, possibly even 600, you might just about manage to do that. One teacher being able to identify every child in a school. You are not going to do it with 800, 900 or nearly 1,000. Deputy Ellis Bebb was suggesting you actually had two schools of over 1,500 or so. I remember doing a teaching practice in Crawley a good few years ago now: 1,500 pupils on a three school site. The biggest problem was that the PE staff did not know each other and one actually tried to put another teacher into detention! (Laughter) It gets as silly as that.

670 I mentioned that I have had some – or my proposer and seconder know that I have had some – experience in education, and that I have also had some experience in culture and leisure. Other candidates have mentioned that we have got some big events coming up, in culture and leisure. In 2021 we will be taking the Island Games forward, and there has been some careful manoeuvring, because the reason that that is coming to us is because another Island cannot any longer financially afford to run those games, and that is why those games will be coming to Guernsey. Guernsey has been asked to actually bail somebody else out! Our turn was really meant to be in 2027. So 2021 we are going to be doing it. We now need to get our act together a little bit quicker than we thought we would. We need to make sure that Guernsey has a sort of 'Open for business' sign, that we are actually a sporting Island, that we actually can have very good development of our sporting and cultural skills.

675 We also, in 2020, are going to a quinquennial Liberation Day. That is one of those big ones that happens every five years. It will be massive. Hopefully, we will still have a Queen on the throne, but it could possibly be that we have not. If we have not, or if we have, we may very well have a very senior royal visitor. This Island has got to be showing itself off at its very best.

680 Culture is very important too. We need to make sure that our three commissions of language, sport and of ... I still have another minute, don't I ...

**The Bailiff:** No, that is your 10 minutes.

690

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you very much indeed.

Well, you know where you are going. Please vote for me! (*Laughter*)

**The Bailiff:** Members, next we will have a period of question time. With four candidates, question time will last one hour. I remind you that the questions must not exceed 30 seconds in length and the answers may not exceed one minute.

The candidates will reply in the order in which they were proposed, so it will be Deputy Parkinson, Deputy Kuttelwascher, Deputy Langlois and then Deputy Le Pelley, and that order will rotate. Unlike the other day, I do not propose to draw names out of a hat, I will just call people from the floor, so if you wish to ask a question please stand in your place, and I will call your name out. So question time will start now, at 10.38.15.

Deputy Lester Queripel will ask the first question.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** Sir, I have been actively involved in sport and the arts here in Guernsey for over 40 years, mainly as a footballer, musician and a poet. My great fear is that now the Departments have been merged, sport and the arts will become even more of a poor relation than they currently are. Sir, I have heard all these assurances but, if elected, can the candidates please tell me what they will actually do to support sport and the arts?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, I have tried to indicate that I have an enthusiastic interest in the arts, and I am an interested participator in some sports. All I can give you is my personal assurance that I will not neglect these areas of the mandate, that I want to see Guernsey have a rich and thriving cultural and social sporting life, and to me it is all part and parcel of education. I think it is right and proper that that now comes within this mandate, because education is the start of many people's interest in sport and we need to encourage it as a lifelong interest.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, I am not sure why Deputy Lester Queripel has that fear. We have changed our structure from 10 Departments to six and those Departments will also, as it were, share the budgets of the original 10, so the Department for Education, Sport & Culture will also have now most of the budget of Culture & Leisure, so I do not see why anything should change.

The staff that are involved with these activities at Frossard House and elsewhere will continue to function as such. All that has changed is the management team. So I see that there is no reason to have any reason to have any fear at all.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Thank you.

Well, I have already mentioned in my speech the idea of having a light footed three-person sub-committee to build up relationships with the various sporting bodies in Guernsey. I think that is going to work well. There was a whole page in yesterday's *Press* from the Cricket Board, outlining what they were hoping to get from this new States, and the final line was, 'Please at least come and talk to us'. That is obviously the first thing that any new Sports sub-committee of Education, Sport & Culture would be doing – making contact with the private sector – because the private sector tends to be a lot better at these sort of things than Government. So I see our role as supporting and, as I said, leveraging the private sector and all those volunteers; there are thousands of volunteers involved in sport in Guernsey at the moment.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

745 I would like to empower even further the Sports Commission, the Arts Commission and the Guernsey Language Commission. We need even closer ties with them, they need to have their funds guaranteed and in fact, if we can, possibly to actually increase them.

I must just remind people that the States of Deliberation did agree last year to the Collins amendment, which is going to call for a full review of all sporting activities and the funding thereof. Deputy Kuttelwascher is correct, funding will remain in place, but I would like to see it increased. Extra funds will have to be called for in order to help the Island Games' development and to make sure that our level of performance is high.

**The Bailiff:** I did not want to interrupt any of you, but it is normal to stand up when answering a question in this Assembly.

Deputy Roffey and then Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Roffey:** Thank you, sir.

760 I will preface my question by saying it is not planted and my candidate has no idea it is coming – sorry, Deputy Langlois.

I was struck, during the opening speeches, that there was very little mention of special needs education. I know they cannot cover everything in 10 minutes, but I would like to know the candidates' vision for the future of special needs education in Guernsey.

765 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, there are facilities now for special needs education and they will continue. In fact, the La Mare project has within it a new autism centre, and I expect that to be delivered. But, as always, all these areas will be constricted by budgets and you cannot get away from that, so I would suggest that what we have now will be maintained and can be improved.

770 In fact, the Service Guernsey initiative might be able to afford or provide some sort of improvement to what is provided. But, at the end of the day, everything will be determined by budgets available, and I have to remind Members that last year our revenue income dropped, or was more than £20 million under estimate. I have absolutely no idea at the present time what is happening this year. If such a situation was to prevail then, as they said, 'Apollo 12 to Houston, we have a problem' and at the end of the day you cannot escape from that. So whatever is affordable will be delivered.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

780

**Deputy Langlois:** Yes, thank you.

Well, in my previous career as an architect we actually dealt with another aspect of special needs, and one thing which became very clear very quickly is we talk about special needs, but special needs tend to be very specific to individuals and it is only too easy to categorise needs.

785 So, I suppose what I would really like to look at is how our existing system copes with specific needs – in other words, tailoring education to individual's specific needs – because if the categories we use are too broad, a lot of people are going to be disadvantaged by the system. So I think a priority would be to see how the system is working addressing individual's needs.

Thank you.

790

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

795 I see special needs as demanding full inclusion. That can be delivered better in smaller schools; certainly smaller secondary schools. I am very, very concerned that people could be sort of picked

out, bullied, hounded, made to feel different, and I think that is far better settled and dealt with in the smaller secondary school system.

800 I do agree that we do need to fund this autism centre. When you talk about special needs or disabilities you often think of people with white sticks or wheelchairs. There are many more different types of special needs requirements and I would like to see the school have sensory rooms etc., and darkened areas where people can sort of cool, chill and actually get themselves back calm and proper so that they are actually in a better condition to go forward with their learning and with mixing with other people. Full inclusion in all the schools.

805 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

810 **Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, I think when the autism centre is completed the physical assets, the physical infrastructure for dealing with special needs children will be pretty good in Guernsey. What we need to do though is to try and keep as many of them as possible integrated into mainstream schooling and that will, of course, mean a lot more in classroom support. There we will run into budgetary problems, I am sure, but the ideal would be to keep children in the mainstream, so long as they can be educated in the mainstream, and not to segregate them out and put them in what are generally excellent facilities, but nevertheless separate facilities, which will affect their social development.

815 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir.

820 Sir, six of the seven poll toppers and all of the runners up in our recent General Election support a form of selection at 11. Do the candidates have any view as to why such an electoral outcome occurred?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

825 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, it might have to do with the personality of the poll toppers, rather than any specific policy such as selection.

830 As I said in my various mini manifestos issued during the course of the campaign, I think whenever we have a controversial issue such as selection in the Island, almost by definition the Island is probably split 50:50 on us, so it is only too easy for one particular group to stand up and claim that the whole Island is behind them on a particular topic such as selection, when in fact the reality is – and selection is a classic case – I believe this Island is split 50:50 on this issue, and that might have been reflected in the Election results, I do not know, nobody knows. You cannot just assume that that is the case. As I said, it is up to us to show the wisdom and leadership in situations where there are such controversial issues to be debated and decided on in this Assembly.

835 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy le Pelley.

840 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

I am pretty sure it is because it is the right policy. I had 1,875 votes in my Election and I actually spoke to, I suppose 1,000 people. Not all of them actually mentioned the 11-plus or the removal of it, but the great majority certainly did and they certainly wanted something in its place with the Grammar School retained.

845 I have also spoken to many other candidates who were successful – and some of them are in here – who actually asked and made a record of those people who actually supported the

retention of the Grammar Schools with a different type of selection process, and it is unanimous across the Island that that is the way that the people want to go.

850 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, I would have to dispute Deputy Trott's statistics, because I think he said all of the runners up supported selection, and if I recall I was a runner up and I do not support selection, so I am not quite sure what the evidence base is. But my proposer obviously supports my view and he was a poll topper.

855 I think the Island is divided, in my experience, roughly down the middle, as is this Assembly, and what I am proposing, I hope, is a development of our education system which can satisfy both those who want to see selection and those who do not, because I think it should be selection by the children and as long as there is selection by the children, I am wholly in favour of it.

860 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Thank you, sir.

865 My experience in going round 1,920 addresses in St Peter Port South was amazing. Education and particularly selection was the number one topic, and I would say that something like 90%-odd of the people who brought it up as an issue suggested they wanted to retain some form of selection.

870 What is interesting is I spoke to eight current teachers in the high schools and they all supported it. I spoke to one teacher in the Grammar School who was neutral on the matter, and I talked to two retired teachers: one did not want it and one did. If you look at a percentage of that sample something like 70% of the teachers I spoke to wanted to maintain selection. What is also interesting is there seems to be a massive disconnect between what head teachers think and what their teachers think. So, to some extent, I believe that the results of the polls did reflect that and it was a major issue, and I think it is far more than 50% of the Island that want to keep something; it is more like 70%.

875 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc next and then Deputy Stephens.

880 **Deputy Le Clerc:** Thank you, sir.

We know considerable investment is required in the College of Further Education. Where do the College redevelopment plans fit in with your plans for education and where do you envisage funding coming from?

885 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

890 £5.5 million has recently been allocated to the redevelopment of the tertiary sector. It is a very important area. We do need to make sure that we grow our own, if I can use that sort of term, with tradespeople and people who are going to do more vocational studies. I think it is absolutely essential that this Island does not become too reliant on having to import people. The funding of that sector is absolutely vital. We will have to find the funds from within the Education budget, and if I am successful and I have my board around me, we will be discussing that very early on.

895 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

900 **Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, I believe the College of Further Education should probably be consolidated on the Les Ozouets site. Clearly, the States will at some point in this term have to debate a capital prioritisation programme, and this will be one of the bids for capital projects in the next round of the capital prioritisation. I hope the Assembly will support the Education Department when it bids for funds to develop the third sector.

905 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, one of the complaints I have heard from the Director of the College of Further Education – I think that is the right title – was that they were being ignored by the previous Department, effectively. There seemed to be very little communication, which is sad.

910 The governance structure for the College of Further Education is not terribly clear at the moment; it is sort of partly independent with a board, and there is some input from the Education Department, but I think the whole governance structure needs to be reviewed.

As far as funding goes, the SAMP project – the Strategic Asset Management Plan – could actually release funds if some of our Estate could actually be disposed of. But it will be for this States to decide in a budget where funds go, where capital goes and how things are prioritised, particularly new services. I await, with some trepidation, the next Budget.

915 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

920 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, the position of the College of FE is fairly central to Education's proposals. The consolidation on Les Ozouets site, which I know a little about – another one of the project boards I was on was the first stage of that between 2008 and 2012, so I made frequent visits to that site. It was always only ever seen as phase one or phase two. Let's not forget the Performing Arts Centre, phase two of the consolidation on that site. But Education's Vision was to have that site being in close proximity to the Sixth Form Centre and therefore being able to co-ordinate courses between the Sixth Form Centre and the College of FE on Les Ozouets site, and that seemed to me a very sensible arrangement, if you were not going to combine the two as a tertiary college in the first place.

930 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Stephens, then Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy Stephens:** Thank you, sir.

Would candidates wish to influence current procedures for the recruitment and retention of staff for schools?

935 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

940 **Deputy Parkinson:** Well, the whole point of academies is that they are self-governing and I believe at the secondary school level, not at the primary school level, the schools should have the driving role in recruitment of staff.

There are other issues around recruitment and retention, particularly about the length of Housing Licences, but one of the things that Dennis Mulkerrin pointed out to us was that the States is not nimble enough in recruiting new teachers, and they need to be much more opportunistic when good teachers become available. I think the key to this is to get recruitment down into the schools: leave it to the head teachers, leave it to the governing bodies of those schools to make their decisions on who they need.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

950 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, I heard from many quarters that the current procedure for recruitment of teachers is somewhat laborious. In fact, by the time the States get to recruiting teachers and many come from England, they have all got jobs somewhere else. So there is an issue.

955 The other issue relates to the Housing Licence situation, but we have got a new population management procedure or Law coming into effect. One of the things that has to happen is, whatever is there, we have got to be able to easily retain the best teachers that we have got. I see no logic in sending a teacher, who happens to be maybe one of the best we have got, away purely because they are reaching a particular timeline where they might actually start gaining residence. My idea would be that if they are that good, welcome them. We have got these  
960 arbitrary rules which cause problems.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

965 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, I will not repeat what some of the other candidates have said because they are absolutely right. The Mulkerrin recommendations, that we need to be not so centralised when we are recruiting ... but one point which has not been mentioned yet, which quite often comes up, is now that we are moving away from the idea of secondary modern schools to more like the sort of schools they have in Europe and England, we will not need those ... We will be more attractive to teachers in our mixed ability schools, which is one big plus, I think, for it.

970 The question of Housing Licences: maybe we will talk about the new structure of education on a later question, so I will not cover that now, but I have not really got anything more to add, not being an expert of recruitment other than as has already been said –

**The Bailiff:** Deputy le Pelley.

975 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you.

The Licence policy has, in fact, been relaxed somewhat recently, following talks between the Education Department and the Housing board. So, in fact, 15-year Licences are not that difficult to gain, providing the Education board, together with the head teachers, make out a reasonable  
980 case. So that, in fact, is already well under way.

The Mulkerrin report, quite correctly, says that the time taken to appoint teachers is far too long. We should be able to turn appointments round really within a week – that is what he was saying. I totally agree with him and should there be LMS – that is local management in schools – then that would enable the head teachers to actually effect that much more quickly.

985 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle next and then Deputy Dudley-Owen and then Deputy Soulsby.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

990 Do the candidates support further withdrawal of the States' funding of the colleges as proposed in the Education Department's report?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

995 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** We have already a process in place which expires, I think it is, in 2019 or something – I cannot remember the exact date – but my simple answer to that is, no, because this is an amazing public/private partnership where for a few thousand pounds – which is what the taxpayer puts in to the pot to help put somebody through the colleges – they are saving themselves most probably £5,000, because it would cost them £7,000 if the States had to educate them themselves. So, to me, it would be more expensive in the long term if you were to withdraw  
1000 it.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1005 **Deputy Langlois:** As was said, the current arrangement lasts until 2019 and there will obviously be ongoing negotiations with the colleges in the lead up to that. Having fee-paying or grant-aided colleges on a small Island like this is a difficult problem to see quite how they fit into the proposed educational system, because in name only are they colleges; they are really direct grant grammar schools.

1010 I think Education grasped the nettle when they suggested having bursaries rather than special place holders' positions. The idea that the colleges would actually help us or provide another facility for pupils who might need some sort of assistance in their learning would be useful.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

1015 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you.

1020 I think the arrangements do need to be renegotiated. I would go for reduced rather than withdrawn at this point in time, but I would say that there needs to be a fairer distribution of States' money across all schools per head. In other words, the Grammar School should not be getting more per head than the States' secondary schools. It needs to be a much fairer level playing field.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

1025 **Deputy Parkinson:** I think any new bursary scheme for the colleges needs to be means tested. Probably therefore the cost to the taxpayer will fall. The exact terms of any new arrangements will be renegotiated during this term of the States leading up to 2019. Exactly what those terms will be, I do not know, but I do want to see the colleges survive and continue to do so well.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Dudley-Owen.

1030 **Deputy Dudley-Owen:** A very real concern about the proposals for a new education system, as passed by the previous Assembly, was a bad track record in managing change by the old Education Department. Given that this old Department forms part of the new committee, how do candidates propose to deal with dysfunctional management issues within the committee?

1035 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1040 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, it is a rather difficult question to answer without being there, but obviously it is about communications with people. We saw that with some of the closures at some of our primary schools, and in effect the new proposals Education came up with. There is a lack of communication between the Departments. I do not want to use the word silo, but there are fundamental ways to explain to people what your proposals are and how it is going to affect them.

1045 I think that is the single biggest flaw, because I do support a lot of the things Education has been doing over the last few years. I think it has been excellent, but its level of communication and the concern it creates by poorly communicating is, I think, a leading factor in some of the disquiet some people feel about the new proposals.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

1050 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you.

I am considering some form of Ofsted-type inspection of the whole Department. I think there is going to be some very tough talking ahead. The Department is quite heavy in numbers: 120 or

1055 so. When I started my teaching career it was right down nearer the 30 number. There needs to be  
better use of staff and more joined up thinking. They really do need to start looking to see how  
they can affect their own changes because if they are not going to do it then we will have to help  
them along.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

1060

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, much will depend on the composition of the new Committee, and  
clearly we need people on that Committee who have experience in managing enterprises,  
experience in managing change, but further down, the Department does need reform. I believe  
that reform will come out of the devolution of power from the Department to the schools and a  
1065 slimming down of the centre. This will involve change and that will need to be carefully managed.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, getting back to the question talking about dysfunctional  
1070 management and I would add obstructive attitudes within management – and I have come across  
them on many occasions – ultimately, the responsibility would be for the Chief Executive of the  
States. There is a Service Guernsey initiative in place, which is supposed to be able to change the  
culture of people. Everybody in the Civil Service reports to somebody and are monitored by  
somebody – even the Chief Executive is monitored – and if a member of staff is being obstructive  
1075 in delivering a particular policy then that should be reported to the Chief Executive and he should  
take appropriate action – disciplinary action, if necessary.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby will ask the next question, then Deputy Smithies.

1080

**Deputy Soulsby:** Sir, there is an extant Resolution from 2013 instructing the Education, Sport  
& Culture Department to review primary provision at the Forest and La Houquette schools, in what  
is now the next two to seven years. I would like to know whether the candidates would be  
prepared to bring a policy letter to this Assembly recommending closure of either or both of  
1085 those schools?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Neither. You may remember that I was the lone voice in the wilderness that  
1090 tried to prevent the closure of St Sampson's Infants. I think I lost that by 40 votes to 7, and I got a  
similar kind of hammering when I tried to resist the closure of St Andrew's.

Small schools are very valuable to me. I would not want to see either of those two schools –  
the Forest which, by way of history, I actually attended as a pupil, and La Houquette, which was  
my old stomping ground when I was a Constable of St Pierre du Bois ... I think both are valuable  
1095 and neither should close.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, my voting record shows that in the 2004-08 Assembly, when the  
1100 Education Department brought forward a proposal to close St Sampson's Infant School, I  
supported the Education Department, but it is a bit difficult to jump to a conclusion on this  
because the direction to the Committee is to review those schools and until that review has been  
undertaken it would be foolish of me to pre-judge whether or not anything needs to change.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1105

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, yes, I agree, a premature question. Until one sees the review, I do not know it has progressed; I have not been party to what the progress is. I know nothing about what is in the review. When we get the review then we decide.

Thank you.

1110

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** I think I will add to that, until you have got the review you can hardly make a judgement. But I assume that the review was related to having a viable intake. I think that is one of the problems we have had in the West. We have got two schools out there and if the intake on both of them is not viable then obviously somebody will come up with the idea of combining the schools to get a viable intake, and I assume that that is what the review will be looking at with predictions of intake over the next few years. Really, until we have seen that review it is impossible to make a judgement. Obviously, as a West Deputy, I certainly would not like to see either of our two primary schools close.

1115

1120

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Smithies and then Deputy Ferbrache.

**Deputy Smithies:** Thank you, sir.

I would like to invite the candidates' views on the future of the federation and how this will fit in with the local management of schools. That is devolving school budgets from the centre to the individual schools.

1125

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, I see the future as being a group of four academies which will have to co-operate in various matters, and co-operation and co-ordination provided from the centre, a much reduced centre. So I think, in effect, my proposals supersede much of the Education Department's proposals for a federation, but recognise that there will need to be a forum where the heads of each of the schools get together with the Education Department to sort out curriculum matters and other matters where co-ordination is required.

1130

1135

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, I was not supportive of the whole principle of federation, mainly because of its effectiveness and the cost. Now, shipping teachers and pupils between schools on a large scale is very expensive and I believe, if I remember, the amount would have been in excess of £2 million each year every year, and then of course the children and teachers on the transport at the time are hardly likely to be buried in books studying so it is time out of their education. There are better ways and, in short, I do not support the whole principle of federation.

1140

1145

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Well, Education's original proposals – the one school on four sites, as it was called; the description really did not do it any favours – which was going to be a development of the federation idea, came in for an awful lot of criticism: the bussing of students, the having one headmaster. There seemed to be a misunderstanding about what the structure was going to be – which is strange because the structure was extraordinarily similar to our new Government structure, where you had autonomous committees each with their own President but an overarching, in our case, Policy & Resources Committee co-ordinating, helping, budgeting,

1150

1155

keeping an eye on how the whole thing is working, without interfering with the individual committees, and that was a very similar to Education's original one-school-on-four-sites proposal.

1160 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** I am not at all happy with the idea of a federation. I have a son who is in Year 13 – in fact he is in his last week of exams, and I hope I am not putting him in any difficulty by answering this question in this way – but he has suffered as a result of this idea of federation, because his teachers have not been where they should be to teach him, they have actually been travelling to another school to deliver something somewhere else. So there is a waste of time in travel, there is a waste of money in paying for people to be on the road, and I think the teacher time lost in all that is terrible. I do not like the idea of a super head either overarching or co-ordinating business. I think the heads in each school should be doing that on their own; they do not need anybody to look after them.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

**Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I preface my question the same way as Deputy Roffey prefaced his: my candidate has no idea that I am going to ask this particular question.

The people outside of this room want practical answers and can the candidates say whether they would expect at the end of their tenure as President, that La Mare de Carteret or its equivalent will be rebuilt; and, if so, will it be built in the form that is proposed; and, if not, what amendments will be made to the current plans?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** The Treasury & Resources Department's – of which I was a part – view was that in the situation that was presented to us, the rebuild of La Mare de Carteret as a 960 option or a 960-pupil school would have represented the best value for money. Now, what actually happens will depend on, as I say, whether or not this Assembly still supports the idea of selection, and that is why on 8th June I hope such a decision can be made and then one can progress the whole issue satisfactorily.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Well, if what Deputy Ferbrache is asking for is a prediction, my prediction is that La Mare will be on site and very much in the form Education originally proposed, when, as I said, I am almost 100% convinced that the three-school option will prove to be financially and practically unviable and we will end up reverting back to Education's original principles.

So I imagine that La Mare, together with the autism and communications centre and the primary school will be on site, and the delay will seem to be, at that time, both unfortunate and a very expensive mistake by the previous States. I think La Mare will go with all those add-ons – frivolous add-ons as they have been described by many people. I have not seen one frivolous add on –

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Yes, I believe the La Mare de Carteret secondary school needs to be rebuilt, I go further than saying 'needs', it *must* be rebuilt. I hope it would be up and running by 2019. Perhaps the sports hall could be built in at some later time, but it is not the essential thing that has to go straight away. Nine hundred or so: far too big; it might be the best value for money, as

one of the other candidates said, but it would not be the best value for education, and it is the kids that matter.

1210

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** The short answer is, yes, I would expect La Mare de Carteret to be rebuilt. Deputy Ferbrache asked whether it would be built in exactly the way that the last Education board envisaged. I would say we need to review the curriculum in the light of the changes which are taking place nationally, to consider what options we as a Committee are going to offer, and then consider where those options need to be offered from, and it may be that the La Mare design needs to be re-tweaked to enable it to provide an option that we cannot offer from any other site.

1215

1220

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** We have heard a lot about policies and leadership style and attitudes to officials perhaps, but I would like to ask the candidates what would their management style be towards diversity of opinion amongst the four other board members?

1225

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Towards the four other board members: well, as I have already said a couple of times, one of the innovations that T&R 2008-12 was that idea of sub-committees, because you give one of those four members, who at that time was me, a lot of responsibility and authority, because suddenly you are sitting in a sub-committee making decisions, and if the three of you are unanimous, you are a majority of the board and therefore you can make decisions and that is very enabling and empowering. It is a management style I like a lot.

1230

I thought you were going to say, 'How were they going to communicate with people outside the board?' because that is something I have been thinking about rather than boards being a five-man band; what kind of level of communications are they going to have with other States' Members informally? It is just something I started thinking about. I think probably monthly meetings, probably too soon to ... think about it.

1235

1240

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

I see the Education, Sport & Culture Committee as being a team. I am happy to be its leader, but I would like to be a team member as well. I like to be a team player. I have never ever asked anyone to do anything that I was not prepared to do myself. So I would like to be an equal, or a leader among equals.

1245

I would like to build a team that would actually have four people – five people including myself, if I was there – to actually have different areas of interest and responsibility, but also have the ability to call in, from time to time, various interested parties to come and make presentations to the Education board. I am not talking about bringing non-States' members as permanent members, I am talking about people with particular arguments and ideas to actually come and present, and I think that could be done at a full board level, and we could then move on together as one unit rather than having lots of sub-committees trying to work out what the right way would be.

1250

1255

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, my management style is a matter of record. As Minister of Treasury & Resources, I was the architect of the sub-committee system that Deputy Langlois has described.

1260 And, as Chairman of the States' Strategic Plan team, I was the Chair of a body that in the end had seen, through rotation, pretty well half the Assembly pass through its membership; and I like to think that most of those people will have gone away with the view that I work collegiately and try and get the best out of the group of people, and certainly not in a dictatorial way or trying to always have my own way.

1265

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Thank you, sir.

1270 We do not have any form of collective responsibility. Therefore, when you have five people in a committee you can expect some dissent and you just have to manage it. At the end of the day it may just be a majority vote in favour. I do not know how many times we have had it in this Assembly where there has been a – it happened with the Transport Strategy – report brought back by a majority of the committee and then a minority brought their own report. So you have to accommodate a diversity of opinion. At the end of the day it will not necessarily be a majority view. All I can say is I do not plan to have any Mugabe moments.

1275

Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

1280 **Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

While I was canvassing during the Election I spoke to a number of teachers – or rather they spoke to me. There was a real concern expressed about a lack of political awareness in regard to some of the complex social and behavioural problems that teachers and schools have to deal with. If elected, will you take these concerns on board and meaningfully engage with teachers to try and address these issues including, proper, not token, committee visits to schools?

1285

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

1290 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Yes, certainly, I would be inviting those people to actually come and address the board. I think it is very important that the board does go and visit the schools. In fact, the present system is that the actual board has a council member or an Education board member, but I think it is far more important we just do not go parading round as if we were on some kind of procession. I think we need to look into the things, the nitty gritty of how things are working, and we need people to be able to come and tell us exactly what is going right and what is going wrong, with their suggestion of how things that are going wrong can be put right.

1295

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

1300 **Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, well, as a Deputy for St Peter Port North I represent, arguably, the most sort of working class district on the Island, with a high proportion of all of the Island's social housing, and I am well aware of the problems that that causes at, for example, Amherst School, where there is an extraordinary mix of social diversity and some quite severe social deprivation.

So these are issues that are dear to my heart and I think all we can do, as Deputy Queripel says, is do more than parade round as a committee but actively engage with the teachers to see what their problems are in those schools and what the committee can do to assist.

1305

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1310 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, it is necessary, first of all, to bring to the attention of the committee that there are problems. They will be varied, and the problem then, having been made aware of these problems, is to muster the right skilled staff to not just go and confirm there is a

1315 problem but how to address it. I suspect I could not address half the problems that occur in the schools; it is not something I have been trained in, but once you are aware of the problem you can certainly divert the appropriate staff to go along and recommend how the problem could be resolved. What often happens is you get aware of a problem and then nothing happens. That cannot persist.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1320 **Deputy Langlois:** Obviously, involvement in social and behavioural problems will be a major part of the mandate of the committee, because that is probably people's biggest fear about social mix, it is one of the reasons people like the idea of tiered education systems. As we are moving to a less tiered education system, we are suddenly going to be involved in social and behavioural  
1325 problems which we could have ignored in the past; it is beholden on the committee to get to grips with that.

Having said that, one Grammar School student once said to me, 'There is as much blood spilt on the playgrounds of the Grammar School as the high schools; it is just that you never get to hear of it'. In other words, it is not just confined to the poorer areas, the poorer students; there are  
1330 other behavioural problems across our education system, and it is a crucial part of the committee job to –

**The Bailiff:** I will not allow any second questions until everybody who wishes to ask one question has had the opportunity.

1335 Deputy Yerby, Deputy Dorey, Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Yerby:** How will candidates ensure that the voices of children and young people are heard in the shaping of education policy?

1340 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, the children and young people have become very politically vocal in the last Election, which was one of the huge benefits of this last Election process, and I want to encourage them to stay engaged. This is not something they should switch on to every four years, this is something that they need to be engaged with all the time.

It would be great if those groups of people who formed themselves will participate in some way in continuing forums to raise with the committee the issues that concern them. They clearly have strong views going both ways on selection and other issues.

1350 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Yes, sir, I found this interesting, because in the previous term – I did not do it the one before – I did get involved with the States' programme of visiting schools, and I visited three schools and talked to the children. They were very interested in what went on here.

1355 So the issue is simply this: could all the schools, the children, whatever, get together one way or another and produce a list, if you like, or an agenda of what their concerns are and present it to the committee? I would be very happy to welcome any representatives who would like to come along. So I think the onus is on them pushing forward their agenda, if you like, and making it known to us, and I would welcome that.

1360 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1365 **Deputy Langlois:** I think it is part of an evolutionary trend, obviously education 50 years ago was really dictated by adults, but the progressive moves have been to get children involved, and by eliminating the 11-plus and having choice at 14, I think that is going to be a fruitful field for children's involvement in their education system, because once they have started choosing their course the actual nature of those courses will then become more apparent to them.

1370 So I think if we press ahead with Education's proposals we will see an involvement of young people in organising their education, which will evolve quite naturally from them being given more choice, and particularly when they are 14, under guidance from their parents. I think that has got to be one of the very positive aspects of education, and once that has been established it will trickle down –

1375 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you.

1380 As a teacher, I was head of community studies and actually developed the programme which I hope has been sort of taken on board by other schools. Because I have been out of touch for 10 years, I do not know if that is actually true, but what we used to do there was we regularly invited States' Members and civil servants to visit the school and to actually take part in exchanging of views.

1385 The school council does exist in most secondary schools, and also in primary schools, and I am sure that we could arrange for a member of the board, or the Committee, to visit. You are quite right, the engagement has been established at Elections and I hope that carries on. I would like to see more youth forum type meetings organised by the Youth Commission and I would also like to see the States' publication being used to engage young people and to get them to talk to us.

**The Bailiff:** The next questioner will be Deputy Dorey.

1390 **Deputy Dorey:** Thank you.

We have primary schools with one form per year, two forms per year, three and four forms per year. We have plans to rebuild a two-form-per-year school. What, in your view, is the ideal size of primary school and why?

1395 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1400 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** It is more than one form per year. The reason why we were told that St Andrew's would shut was because it could not provide enough years as a school and it is better to have a choice. What the ideal is, I do not know. I think one can accommodate three or four depending on the buildings and depending on the teaching skills that are available. So I do not know what the ideal size would be in that respect and I would be quite willing to take advice on that matter. But apparently one year is not the best.

Thank you.

1405 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1410 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, I am going to say something very similar to Deputy Kuttelwascher. I am not an educationalist. I have been convinced over the years that the one-form entry, which is what I thought a primary school was until well in my 20's – I had no experience of anything other than that because that was the one I went to – that that is now far less efficient than two- or three-form entry.

So I would not even like to put a guess as to which is the better. As it has been said, it is certainly not one; whether it is two or whether it is three, I really do not know, but I expect I will be finding out fairly shortly.

1415 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

1420 I think two-form entry is preferable, because it gives you the chances of using staff cover if someone is away. If you have got a one-form entry and you have only got three teachers or four teachers in the school, it is going to be very, very difficult to actually find someone to cover a lesson if a member of staff goes ill.

1425 The size of the school – I think when you become less than 150 you are starting to really struggle and I would not want to really see schools of more than 400-450 pupils. I know there are some over here with 500 but, for a primary school, 450 for me would be an ideal number.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

1430 **Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, setting is not really an issue at the primary school level, so you do not need the numbers to enable you to segregate the children into streams or sets.

1435 There are issues about staff management if a school gets very small, but I think schools can be excellent if they are one-form entry or three-form entry. We are conducting a review. I am not an educationalist, I will wait and see what the review comes back and recommends, and consider the recommendations in the light of what I am told.

**The Bailiff:** Next question, Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you, sir.

1440 I would like to bring it back to culture and sport please, and how the political Members feel that they can attend the many functions that are taken on by Sport & Culture, where they represent the States when they attend these various events that are on, bearing in mind that the Education Department previously were allocated to attend the School Management Committees and/or the concerns and things which each Member was allocated around nine schools per Member?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1450 **Deputy Langlois:** That is a timetabling question and really, until one had got into position, one would not be able to make a sensible answer to that. Obviously, there are lots of cultural and sporting events taking place in the Island, and there are also, obviously, a lot of events taking place at the schools; and with a five-person board, it is going to be difficult to be represented at all of those. But it is really a question of prioritising which are the important ones, which are the ones one feels the President should be attending, and which can be attended by members of the Committee. It is just going to have to be a decision at the time. Somebody presents you an annual timetable of events and one will have to make decisions. There is only so much one can do. One will try one's best.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

1460 **Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

I think we will be truly stretched. We are truly stretched at the moment just doing culture and leisure and if you have got to do culture and leisure and education, it is going to be very difficult. I will do my very best to attend everything.

1465 I agree with Deputy Langlois: we will have to prioritise, but I would want to get everybody involved, we have got an Island-wide Election, probably, coming up in 2020 and I think it is useful

for everybody on the board to actually have their fair share of profile so that they can actually get in and around and out and about. A little bit flippantly, perhaps I might have to get a body double.

1470

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, I think it is important to share the load around, and that means that the committee needs to have a range of interests, so you know clearly there will be members of the committee who are more interested in sport, and members who are more interested in culture and so on. I think it will be impossible to attend every event. We will just have to try and make sure that we get out and about enough to maintain contact with the sporting and cultural associations, and to show that we are interested in those areas.

1475

1480 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, it is all about prioritising and sharing. I would run the board – or the committee; we do not have boards, do we – just like the P&R Committee, where they will have specific responsibilities in certain areas.

1485

The other thing we can remember is you can also muster some of the staff to represent the department, they do sit on the committees and on occasions there would not be a problem maybe if just a member of staff represented the committee at certain events, and that may become more common. Certainly on the Treasury & Resources Department it was not uncommon for the States' Treasurer or somebody else to present something relating to Treasury without a political Member representing it. So sharing, prioritising and using staff when necessary.

1490

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Graham.

**Deputy Graham:** Sir, Guernsey's history is no longer taught in any of the States' schools. Does it matter?

1495

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** It is like a red rag to a bull, sir. It absolutely matters. As I said when I was teaching the actual local history it was actually one section of the Year 10, Year 11 syllabus, and I actually devised that, certainly for St Sampson's Secondary School when I was there.

1500

It is very important that we know our heritage, that we know our famous Guernsey people, that we know our role in English history, because we have influenced it as much as they have influenced us; I think we did actually conquer them in 1066.

1505

I think it is very important that our heritage is very clearly explained. There is a trending down here now of sort of English ways and I think, fine, but I think we do need to make a stand and make sure that our own culture, our own heritage and our own history is right to the fore.

**A Member:** Hear, hear.

1510

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Well, Guernsey has a long and fascinating history which I have devoted many hours of research into, and I think children on this Island should be aware of that background. So, yes, I am absolutely in favour of running courses on local history and culture, and even a smattering of the local Guernsey French to keep these things alive, but clearly those things do not score for academic purposes in any league tables, and I am afraid they will always be sort of a bit of a side interest in the curriculum.

1515

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1520

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** The simple question was: do you think it is important? My simple answer to that is, oh yes. As a first step, it will be interesting if every school could be presented maybe with a book written by Deputy Parkinson and a book written by Deputy Graham! *(Laughter)*

1525

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** Thank you.

1530

For a long time now I have been advising people interested in politics in Guernsey, or even a few Deputies, to buy and read a copy of Richard Hogarth's *An Island Assembly*. In a minute we cannot run through the whole of Guernsey history, but as we are in this Chamber it might be worth saying how important it is for Deputies, for States' Members, to know why they are here and what the history of this Assembly is, because it puts the whole thing into context. Believe me, it is a fascinating book and a lot of the points, especially to do with education funding, are very relevant today.

1535

So that is my number one recommendation if anybody is interested in Guernsey history and I encourage everybody to get interested in it. The second one is the very recently published *History of Guernsey Education 1560 to 1971* by Rose-Marie Crossan which is equally revealing.

1540

**The Bailiff:** Do we have another question? Yes. Deputy Meerveld, and this is probably the last question.

1545

**Deputy Meerveld:** Sir, please can the candidates answer with a 'yes' or a 'no': do they consider the Grammar School to be a centre of academic excellence?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

**Deputy Parkinson:** Yes.

1550

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

**Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Oh yes.

1555

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

**Deputy Langlois:** It is currently, yes.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

1560

**Deputy Le Pelley:** That is four yeses and they are through to the next round!

**The Bailiff:** Sorry, there is time for one more question.

1565

Does anybody else want to ask one question, who has not done so? No. In that case, Deputy De Lisle, you may ask a second question.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

Do the candidates support the previous Education board's proposal for rationalisation and consolidation of the Catholic Schools?

1570

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1575 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** I am not actually fully aware of all the detail of that proposal at the present time. Sorry, I am supposed to stand – it has been an hour you know. I am not sufficiently aware of that proposal so I reserve my comment on that.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1580 **Deputy Langlois:** I am so pleased Deputy Kuttelwascher pleaded ignorance, because I am going to do exactly the same thing. If he asks me to guess, I imagine what Deputy De Lisle is talking about is somehow only funding one of two particular schools, asking them to merge. I am talking off the top of my head here; whether I support it or not, I would need a great deal more detail on the matter before I could say yes or no to it.

1585 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Yes, I have heard something of this. I would much rather they both remain, but it is a matter in my opinion for consultation with the Roman Catholic community.

1590 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Parkinson.

1595 **Deputy Parkinson:** Well, yes, generally I do not support the provision of States' support for any particular religion and I would want the school system to be basically secular, but certainly in the case of the two Catholic schools, I think there probably is a case for them to merge that needs to be discussed and developed with them.

**The Bailiff:** The hour is now up so that concludes question time.

1600 You will now vote by way of secret ballot using the election pads in front of you. Just write the name of one of the candidates on the election pad and I remind you Deputy Parkinson is proposed by Deputy Gollop, seconded by Deputy Laurie Queripel; Deputy Kuttelwascher, by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Graham; Deputy Langlois was proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Tooley; and Deputy Le Pelley, proposed by Deputy Trott, seconded by Deputy Soulsby.

1605 Members, can I just have your attention whilst slips are counted up? What I am going to propose is that we adjourn now. We will allow just about five minutes or so for the counting, I think, so we will resume at 11.45 a.m. or as soon as they are ready, but if you are not immediately in the vicinity of this room do not expect to be called. If you are not back here by 11.45 a.m. you may miss out on possibly another round of voting. 11.45 a.m.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.39 a.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 11.47 a.m.*

**Committee for Education, Sport & Culture –  
Election of President –  
Debate continued**

1610 **The Bailiff:** Just to explain, I asked the candidates to go back to their seats down below, so that we can get on as quickly as possible with the next election. But I can announce the result of the voting for the election of a President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture. Deputy

Le Pelley, 18 votes; Deputy Langlois, 11 votes; Deputy Kuttelwascher, 6 votes; and Deputy Parkinson, 5 votes, with no blank or spoiled papers.

1615 There will therefore be a further round of voting with three candidates: Deputy Le Pelley, Deputy Langlois and Deputy Kuttelwascher. Deputy Le Pelley, Deputy Langlois and Deputy Kuttelwascher.

1620 **Deputy Kuttelwascher:** Sir, I am willing to drop out of the contest at this stage if that is possible.

**The Bailiff:** It is not within the Rules, but yes. So, in that case, it is a straight vote between Deputy Le Pelley and Deputy Langlois, and I remind you that Deputy Le Pelley was proposed by Deputy Trott, seconded by Deputy Soulsby and Deputy Langlois, by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Tooley. Deputy Le Pelley and Deputy Langlois.

1625 Well, those have been taken away to be counted. I am sure there will be another five minutes if people want to go out and be back here by 11.55 a.m. then they may do so.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.49 a.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 11.53 a.m.*

**Committee for Education, Sport & Culture –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Le Pelley elected**

**The Bailiff:** I am now being handed the results of the voting. The voting in the second round of voting for the election of a President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture: Deputy Le Pelley, 25 votes; Deputy Langlois, 15 votes and no blank or spoilt papers.

1630 So I declare Deputy Le Pelley elected as the President of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture. *(Applause)*

**III. Committee for Employment & Social Security –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Le Clerc elected**

*Article III.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Employment & Social Security to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article III, Committee for Employment & Social Security – Election of President.

**The Bailiff:** Do we –? Yes, Deputy Le Tocq.

1635 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Sir, I am very honoured to propose the name of Deputy Michelle Le Clerc.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc. Do we have a seconder?

1640 **Deputy Stephens:** Yes, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Stephens.  
Do we have any other candidates? No.  
In that case, Deputy Le Tocq.

1645

**Deputy le Tocq:** Thank you, sir.

I had the privilege of working with Deputy le Clerc when I was Minister for the Home Department last term. It goes without saying that from my perspective, and that of the staff across the Department, she outranked us all in being the hardest working and most pro-active Member of that Department, despite the fact that she was neither Minister nor Deputy Minister.

1650

When I was elected Chief Minister she was one of my top two candidates to replace me. However, her own view was that she wanted to continue the key work she had begun on other committees; that the time was not right for her to take on a senior position.

Sir, as I will demonstrate to the Assembly, the time is now right for Deputy Le Clerc and I am delighted to be proposing her today for the role of President of the new Committee for Employment & Social Security. Many of you already know Deputy Le Clerc, but for those who do not, here is a brief resume of her career to date.

1655

Deputy Le Clerc has a long career in financial services, specialising in banking operations, internal control, risk management and corporate governance. She is a Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Bankers and has an honours degree in financial services. She is a member of the Institute of Directors, completing the IOD certificate and diploma in company direction. She is also a qualified marketer with the Chartered Institute of Marketing.

1660

Michelle is one of the few Deputies also in part-time employment. She currently spends 10 hours per week heading up the Corporate and Social Responsibility Programme for a local private bank, which has supported Amherst School for six years and will be undertaking a new programme with La Mare Primary School from September. That is the reason that she was slightly late here this morning.

1665

Michelle has strong leadership skills and is most definitely a team player. She has been one of the most hardworking Deputies over the last four years. She has been on the previous Social Security Department board for four years, a member of the Home Department board and Vice-Chair of PAC. She stepped down from these latter roles when she agreed to go on to the HSSD board late 2014.

1670

As I mentioned earlier, an opportunity had already opened to take on the role of Home Minister early in 2014 but Michelle decided that her sub-committee work on the Personal Tax and Benefit Review and SWBIC was at a critical stage and she should continue that commitment to that work. With additional experience gained on Schools Guernsey, SSD Investment Sub-Committee, Living Wage Working Group, the SLAWS Working Party, and as Chair of the Children and Young People's Plan, now is most certainly the time for her to take on the role of President of the Committee for Employment & Social Security.

1675

Michelle has always been supportive of Policy Council and has been asked to help on several occasions with delegations such as the Chinese, Latvian and South African visitors. She is a supporter of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and the Commonwealth Women Parliamentarians and has developed contacts in Westminster, regional and other Assemblies.

1680

Michelle has actively contributed in debate not only around board tables but also here in the Assembly, she is not afraid to deal with difficult issues, to stand, and to stand for what she believes to be just and fair. It may seem to you that she has a heavy bias towards finance, but she has also fostered teenagers for many years. She is thoughtful, hardworking and a pragmatist who does not suffer fools gladly, and cares passionately about our Island.

1685

I highly commend her to this Assembly.

1690

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc.

**Deputy Le Clerc:** Thank you, sir.

Well, I have got a long speech just in case there was a candidate opposing me, so I do not intend to go through it all, but just to say that thank you very much for your support.

1695 There is a lot of work to be done in the new Department. I cannot get my head round ESS, I am still on SSD time. I have met with the Chief Officers. I know there is an actuarial report waiting for the new committee, and we will be bringing back an updating report, I think it is October or November of this year, which is going to be very important.

1700 I am very interested in the new parts of the mandate and I think such ... I believe that I am collaborative and inclusive, and I know that the only way we can work is together to continue to provide value-for-money services.

1705 As I say, I will enjoy the challenges of the new mandate, the equality and social inclusion aspects, but also the housing, employment, labour market legislation and industrial relations. I believe that the combined attributes of my business background, as outlined by Deputy Le Tocq, together with my understanding of the social issues facing many in our community, do make me an ideal candidate, and I thank you for your support.

**The Bailiff:** You vote now on the election of the President of the Committee for Employment & Social Security. Deputy Le Clerc was proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy Stephens. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I now declare you elected, Deputy Le Clerc. *(Applause)*

#### **IV. Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure – Election of President – Deputy Brehaut elected**

*Article IV.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article IV, Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure – Election of President.

1715 **The Bailiff:** Any nominations? Any candidates?  
Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** I wish to propose the name of Deputy David De Lisle.

1720 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle, and a seconder? Is there a seconder for Deputy De Lisle?

**Deputy Lowe:** Sorry, sir. I will second Deputy de Lisle.

**The Bailiff:** Yes, Deputy Le Clerc.

1725 **Deputy Le Clerc:** Sir, yes, I propose Deputy Barry Brehaut.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut. And a seconder?

**Deputy Ferbrache:** Yes.

1730

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

Any other candidates? No.

Well, Members, it is now 12 o'clock ... Sorry, are there just the two candidates; anybody else? No, so there are just two candidates.

1735

The speeches by the candidates and the proposers could take a maximum of half an hour, and then there could be half an hour for questions. So all of that could take an hour, and then there would be voting. I am going to propose that we continue sitting now until the conclusion of this. If you agree vote *Pour*, if you wish ... (**Several Members:** *Pour*) (*Laughter*) Well, I will put it to you in a moment. If you wish to take an early lunch and come back later then vote *Contre*. But the proposal I am putting to you is that we continue to sit in order to complete the matter of the election of a President of the Committee for Environment & Infrastructure. Those in favour; those against.

1740

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** We will continue sitting.

1745

Deputies Brehaut and De Lisle, will you come up on to the bench please? Deputy Brehaut nearer the window and Deputy De Lisle nearer the door.

The order of speeches will be Deputy Gollop, Deputy De Lisle, Deputy Le Clerc, Deputy Brehaut.

Deputy Gollop. You have just switched your microphone off, Deputy Gollop.

1750

**Deputy Gollop:** Thanking you again, sir.

1755

I have known Deputy De Lisle for at least 20 years and I am aware that he is now one of our longest serving Members who has started his fourth term, having served over 12 years. Each time he has performed creditably in the polls. He had an uplift of around 250 votes this time around in a tighter election where there were only five seats, and it has to be said on the one occasion he did not get in, in the year 2000, he still polled over 50% of the votes, but there was a very strange ballot that year.

1760

He is a very experienced Member and, of course, has served at least one year as Minister for the Environment Department. He was born in Guernsey, studied at the intermediate school, trained as a teacher and earned a BSc at London University. He worked as a teacher at the University of Toronto and completed a master's degree in planning and completed a doctorate at Magill University under a Canada Council Scholarship. He worked at different times for Manitoba State as Economic Development Officer, and indeed lived in the Canadian capital of Ottawa for many years, working as a university lecturer in two different universities, a professor in their terminology. He also was employed as Chief Economist for the Canadian Federal Government and apparently worked – I did not know this until recently – on the planning of the Museum of Civilisation, The National Art Gallery and the Ceremonial Route He is concerned very much about balancing economic development with the life of the nation – qualities that he has brought to Guernsey. On return to Guernsey he worked as a teacher in various places, including St Sampson's School and indeed taught evening classes. I remember completing an A-level in economic geography that Deputy De Lisle taught. So he has got many roles.

1770

In terms of his qualifications for the position, he has completed: four years as a member of the Commerce & Employment board; four years as a member of the Education board; four years on Environment, including when that Department took the lead in waste; one year as Minister of the Environment Department, when he attended British and Irish Councils; and he has had many other

1775 experiences from the Construction Committee of the States, to dealing with waste and sitting on  
different bodies.

His manifesto very much stressed that he wishes to see, and will see, expanding business  
opportunities and a diversification of the economy, using public funds wisely and balancing the  
books; his environmental commitments, that Environment should be working for the little people  
1780 of Guernsey, he would wish to provide a clean and healthy environment free of chemical  
pollutants that have been internationally condemned.

When he was Minister of Environment in 2007 he set in motion Guernsey becoming a  
signatory to the Convention of Biodiversity and proposed further designation of Ramsar sites in  
the Bailiwick. Many of these work streams have only recently come to fruition. The work on sea  
1785 defences has still to be completed. He would wish to see sea defences given priority, as rising sea  
levels do threaten our coastline. He has organised a beach litter clear up at L'Eree Bay and he has  
been very much both a Western district person and an Island-wide representative. Because of  
retail interests in St Peter Port, he is very keen to revive the Town and see diversification of our  
economy, whilst using the bonus of the cruise liners more wisely. Without a vibrant Town, we will  
1790 suffer a difficult fate.

Dealing with our waste is a top priority too for Deputy De Lisle. He realises that this Waste  
Strategy has been held back by delays, uncertainty and cost concerns, but very much wants to  
deliver waste and recycling facilities, and to see in-vessel composting in place. He would wish to  
see the arguments about working more on recycling on the Island, maintaining kerbside and  
1795 working with Jersey re-explored, as again he has been a visionary here. Some of us can remember  
when he questioned the figures from the then Public Services Department relating to waste  
arising, and it has proved the case that his vision and his analysis has come closer to the truth than  
the opponents.

1800 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** I thank my proposer and seconder. I am seeking your support for the  
position as President of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure.

As Minister of Environment in 2007, I put in place a vision and 10-point plan which has been  
1805 enacted in policy and adopted by subsequent Ministers of the Department. The electorate this  
time have made very clear that they seek a new vision that is open and transparent, representing  
them, and their views, for the future development of Guernsey. I seek to do just that.

I am a Guernsey farmer's son who understands the commitment it takes to make a living off  
the land; a researcher who thoroughly investigates the information given, and looks beyond the  
1810 set of parameters to seek the truth; a teacher who nurtures others to bring out their very best  
qualities. I have experience in both Environment and Public Services. As this is my fourth term I  
can hit the ground running.

In two minority reports to the States, I have stressed the need to channel energies into waste  
reduction, recycling and composting. I had to fight very hard to gain approval for my  
1815 amendments for a 50% recycling target for household and commercial waste, believed at the time  
to be unattainable, and today it is reality. I was ahead of the times.

I placed several amendments and a successful requête, hard fought again for Public Services to  
commission a study of kerbside recycling, which revealed that this would increase our recycling  
rate and save thousands of tonnes of waste entering landfill. This initiative has prolonged the life  
1820 of Mont Cuet. Recycling in itself has created a local waste industry, owned and operated by  
independent business entrepreneurs, which should be encouraged.

I aim to see delivered the key elements of the Waste Strategy, within budget, and make it a  
positive function, fully supported by the Island. There needs to be clarity on costs of the Waste  
Strategy and how much it will cost householders. This can only be accomplished by working  
1825 openly with the parishes and in different interest groups, to collaborate together for the best cost-  
effective long-term results for the people of Guernsey.

1830 As Minister of Environment, I had only 12 months to make good. I faced the telecoms operators, the public demonstration march, and over 8,000 signatures in protest over the telecom proliferation of mobile masts. I delivered, with the OUR and the board of Health, a policy that modified telecom licences to enable sharing of infrastructure and reduce the number of masts and the impact on the environment by 50%. I successfully resolved the issue to the satisfaction of the Island to this very day. I accomplish and get things done.

1835 I was able to deliver several successful initiatives in that year. I instigated an internal review of the Planning Service, I worked with the department planners to bring in the Ordinances of the new Planning Rule. I introduced proposals for the introduction of fees for planning and building control applications. I produced an environmental strategy plan to protect and enhance the environment biodiversity and the countryside, which is now in place as policy. I set in motion for Guernsey to become a signatory to the Convention of Biodiversity, and proposed further designations for Ramsar sites in the Bailiwick to safeguard the natural environment. I introduced a strategy for the future management of coastal defences. In road transport, I planned a school pedestrian priority area around the new St Sampson's Les Vauxbelets schools in association with the community, and implemented a new States' policy for speed restrictions around all Island schools. Improvements were made to scheduled bus services and cycling facilities along the front. I progressed planning and redevelopment of Leale's Yard and delivered the planning brief for the  
1845 Salt pans Key Industrial Site.

There are priorities and initiatives that I would wish to establish for the Committee. Public transport needs to provide a realistic alternative for today's commuters, and reflect our way of life with bus sizes, direct routings, frequency and evening services considered.

1850 In my term, I increased bus usage, I extended the cycle path along the Town front and introduced small car parking. The commercial and retail centre of St Peter Port must maintain ease of access, and provide adequate parking for the residents and those working and shopping in Town. Experiments with policy and interim measures need to be sympathetically dealt with, and commuters and those in business operating commercial enterprises.

1855 Our Harbour terminal facilities are antiquated and need upgrading to provide a more inviting entry to Guernsey to match those of the Airport. We need to encourage the development of micro-renewable energy sources for domestic and industrial purposes by working with States' Electricity. We must interact with the finance industry and private equity firms to attract clean technology and renewable energy at a reasonable cost. Guernsey can become a centre of expertise and provide advice and assistance to people and businesses interested in investing in  
1860 renewable energy projects.

With regard to general housing policy, there is a need to consider first-time home buyers and those wishing to downsize, and cater to those who have disabilities. These could be located close to village centres. This would stimulate the construction industry.

1865 Climate change is a real concern and we must be prepared. We must strengthen our sea defences to protect coastal properties from damage and extreme flooding.

1870 I will continue to lobby for a clean and healthy environment, free of chemical pollutants that have been internationally condemned. We need to be more pro-active in encouraging farming and the production of local food to supplement that which is being shipped in. We need to encourage the support of independent Guernsey bakers and meat and fish producers who are filling the void and producing home-grown and baked Island products.

I have management experience and relevant professional background to lead the Committee. I hold a doctorate and master's degree specialising in land-use planning in industrial location, urban regeneration and economic development and diversification.

1875 We need to bring back certainty and stability to both environment and infrastructure issues. Strategies are not enough; we need to fast track and implement the policies that are already in place. The doors need to be open to public feedback and communication. Information needs to be clear on the direction, delivery, method and cost of proposals.

1880 I will work together with public interest groups and private industry to carry out the objectives of the States. I take a balanced approach. Any action taken has to have public support and benefit the Island as a whole.

I ask you to support my nomination for President of the Environment & Infrastructure Committee.

1885 **The Bailiff:** Now we will hear from Deputy Le Clerc, the proposer of Deputy Brehaut.  
Deputy Le Clerc.

**Deputy Le Clerc:** Thank you, sir.

Sir, I was delighted, firstly, when Deputy Brehaut was re-elected and, secondly, when he asked me to propose him today for this important position.

1890 Deputy Brehaut was a non-States' member to the Housing Department and Cadastre Committee in 2000, prior to being elected as a Deputy in 2004. So he has 16 years' experience of committee work. In his first term he served on the Housing Department, HSSD and the Public Sector Remuneration Committee. He was also a member of St Peter Port Douzaine and an Overseer of the Poor Procureur.

1895 Deputy Brehaut was the second States' Member to hold the position of Chair of the Scrutiny Committee, from 2008 to 2012, many reports were published at that time, including an examination of the Education Department's exclusion policy which was referred to during the latest debate on education.

1900 He was a long serving member of HSSD, spanning three terms. He served as Deputy Minister on two occasions, sat on many project boards and various sub-groups. He also chaired the Children & Young People's Plan Project board in its early development. I was very grateful for the work that he had accomplished when I took over from him as Chair of the CYPP board. He was a member of the Fostering and Adoption Panel, an area that Deputy Brehaut and I both feel very passionately about.

1905 For the past four years, Deputy Brehaut has been a member of the Environment Department; the last two years as its Deputy Minister. Planning matters, traffic, the environment are thorny issues to deal with. Anyone seeking to head up a Committee dealing with issues, when there are clearly already 63,000 on-Island specialists, does do so with their eyes wide open.

1910 Deputy Brehaut has never taken refuge in what might be described as the more comfortable committees or departments in the past. He has consistently worked in areas that are demanding and attract, at times, the harsh spotlight of public scrutiny. One thing I know about Deputy Brehaut is he can clearly articulate a message when it is needed most.

1915 The position Deputy Brehaut is standing for is not the Chair of the Environment Department – that role and that Department have gone, disappeared; the new role, the new job description, the new mandate are wider and more extensive. This is a committee now dealing with elements of the former Public Services Department, so it would be a distraction to get bogged down in narrow policy areas only dealing with niche areas such as traffic. Whilst important, the job is now much bigger than that.

1920 I am therefore proud to propose Deputy Brehaut as President of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you very much, sir, Members.

1925 I thank both Deputy Le Clerc and Deputy Peter Ferbrache for proposing and seconding me. Thank you.

Mr Bailiff, Members, the past few weeks have been hectic; unknowns have become knowns, and the, 'What if I am elected?' has become, 'Yikes, I have been elected!' and the realisation of the commitment we have all taken on becomes real.

1930 The question now is where do we all fit, what do we want to do, what do we feel we can do, and the small matter that is what your colleagues believe you can actually do? It is a steep learning curve. We have seen a few blushes this past week from colleagues declaring an interest in working in certain areas only to find the mandate sits somewhere else, but do not worry, lifelong learning is admirable. I must point out anyone seeking to stand to deal with waste, post the  
1935 overarching policy, is probably standing for the wrong committee.

For my part, I feel I have spent a great deal of time growing into the role I am seeking your support for this morning, or now this afternoon. Deputy Le Clerc has already pointed out that my work started long before the Election to this Assembly, some 16 years ago, when I sat as a non-States' member on the Housing Department, dealing with the very new concept then of Housing  
1940 Association's partnering the Corporate Housing Programme.

These were, and are, big themes that revisit this Assembly as sure as night follows day. But the political machine runs slowly and I never imagined I would speak to this Assembly some 16 years later with a plea to do what we need to do regarding the clear demand for housing. We must use the tools, the levers, the mechanisms contained in the Strategic Land Use Plan to deliver for this  
1945 community. Focussed policy guidance in this area is both urgent and crucial, and the Soulsby amendment also reminds us that we need and – sorry, the Soulsby amendment calling for a review, a reappraisal, a reassessment of our housing need – will play a pivotal and significant role over this term, and is a timely reminder.

I make no apologies for referring to housing at the top of my speech, and it may perhaps disorientate a few of you who may have wanted me to address those hardy perennials of traffic and planning – the bread and butter, the dual poisoned chalices that keep the comment column and *The Press* pages brimming over, but more of those a little later.  
1950

But, friends, the review of the Government has seen the end to what was the Environment Department, the new Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure has grown, or rather grown up; the mandate is extensive and the challenges real. This new committee cannot obsess over the minor detail of the width of unloading bays within St Peter Port, spend another second discussing paid parking, or worry as to whether the wing mirrors are colour co-ordinated with the bumpers on larger vehicles. But I am making a serious point in that also. The makeup of this Assembly has changed significantly, and it would be both politically naive and irresponsible to pursue or revisit  
1955 certain policy areas when opposition is writ large on the wall of pragmatism ahead of me.  
1960

However, it is important to note the very clear overarching statement contained in the committee mandate which states:

'To protect and enhance the natural and physical environment and develop infrastructure in ways which are balanced and sustainable in order that present and future generations can live in a community which is clean, vibrant and prosperous.'

Whilst to some that statement may be seen as a call to arms to those to seek out the bobble-hatted environmentalists, it is actually simply a very common sense objective. It is achievable, it is doable and it is desirable; and in a small community such as ours we should welcome it and embrace it.  
1965

I suppose we are all accepting of the challenges of the built environment because they are comprehensible, they are quantifiable. For Alderney residents, for example, undermining the Base on the Breakwater, the condition of the Airport runway and the Airport infrastructure bears witness to the need for co-ordinated focused action in those areas. Whilst we are perhaps not so good at realising the potential for the natural environment to deliver, the payback from the natural environment is much greater than we can ever imagine; things as simple as eco-tourism that give you a reward on investment in the community and the natural world, the natural environment rather. The natural environment, sadly, only starts to dominate the political agenda, and worldwide, when it is being lost or eroded by the demands of the commerce, when actually  
1970 those two elements, commerce and environment, should have a hand-in-glove relationship.  
1975

1980 Whilst we may have lofty ideals of a perfect world, changes locally are achievable through concerted, focussed actions of politicians with a clear mandate. If we reflect for one moment in one small area, our bus service: deprived of funding through a difficult FTP decision-making process, held in low regard, viewed as low priority, ridership slowly ebbed away. But some determined, disciplined political action has seen numbers rise beyond 1.5 million, and usage may soon surpass 2009 levels – I am sure Deputy Gollop will keep us posted. That is actually very good news for the 7,000, both young and old, in our community who cannot and never will drive.

1985 Members, the majority of this speech could have been taken up simply by reading the mandate of the new committee – from animal health and welfare to security and supply of essential commodities, including: fuel, food and energy; the management, collection and disposal of surface waters; traffic and transport; the runway; the road network – the list is almost endless and the challenges are very real.

1990 The amalgamation of aspects of PSD along with elements of the Environment Department require some experienced hands and, without wishing to be the least bit presumptuous, Members, if you did or feel able to elect me to this position today, I would very much like to have Deputy Dorey as a member of the new committee, specifically because of his knowledge of these former PSD areas of interest.

1995 I spoke earlier of the poisoned chalice that keeps *The Press* pages busy, and I do not want for one moment to sound fatalistic or demonstrate a lack of insight regarding how a community regards Government and those who serve it, but I can only do this job with the support of you all.

2000 When we come to this Assembly with our policy guidance ... for the role of E&I is not in the doing, in the nitty-gritty detail, and I think there has been a degree of confusion at times to what people believe any one individual can achieve in this role, or what personal agenda anyone would seek to promote. Maybe I need to be explicit here: the idea, the very notion that I take up the baton on behalf of the now defunct Environment Department and approach this role with an unfinished business-type agenda, is simply not going to happen. It cannot happen, debates have been had, decisions have been taken, let's all move on.

2005 Just referring back briefly, what any committee cannot ignore and must view as a high-priority in the element of its mandate is the element that refers to the safe and efficient movement of people and goods around the Island, including traffic management and road safety. I stress this point because this is an area where the public, the parent, the constituent, has led the way, particularly with regard to safety around our schools, Island-wide. We must do and we can do a little more on that.

2010 I feel I also need to say, having read a number of manifestos in recent weeks, I note how many of you spoke of joined-up Government, some even of collective responsibility and others of cross-departmental, or now perhaps cross-committee, co-operation and I cannot stress how important that is, for when this States speaks with one voice and acts cohesively, we can deliver for the greater good of the community. When we fragment over, at times, relatively small policy issues we lose much more than a States' report and much more than a vote.

2015 During my time in this Assembly – in fact, even before my time in this Assembly – as a non-States' member, I have not shied away from responsibility; I have not taken the path of least resistance. In my first term I was on three States' committees and my workload was equal – and occasionally heavier, incidentally – to that of Ministers.

2020 I have acquired a wealth of experience in so many areas, from HSSD through to Scrutiny and, of course, the Environment Department. Like others, actually, I can claim to have topped the poll in St Peter Port South too, although at times things appear to have conspired against me. The most contentious, hotly-disputed planning applications have all been squarely in my electoral district, for example. That said, and making some tough calls, the good people of St Peter Port South have only seen fit to dock me about 100 votes over the past 12 years.

2025 So, colleagues, I would consider it a privilege to be elected to Chair of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure. I would very much like to assemble a team of committed individuals

from across the political spectrum, using the talents, skills of all to deliver the very best for this Assembly, for the community, for our Island and for the Bailiwick.

2030 I very much hope you feel you can support me and I look forward to your questions.  
Thank you very much.

**The Bailiff:** We move in to question time. I just remind Members that questions must relate to areas of policy included in the mandate of the Environment & Infrastructure Committee.

2035 Deputy Jones will be the first questioner.

**Deputy Jones:** Thank you, yes.

2040 Could I ask the potential candidates where they would find the money for some of this wonderful, new infrastructure expenditure that we are hearing about down at the harbour and elsewhere?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2045 **Deputy De Lisle:** I think it is very important that we use public funds wisely and balance the books, and I agree there. I think many projects that have been proposed will have to, perhaps, be modified or reduced in capital expenditure in order that we can balance our books and support local community concerns, which are, of course, that we reduce spending and concentrate, actually, heavily on the business side of progress in the near future to get our economy back on track.

2050

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you, sir.

2055 What I tried to say in my speech is there has been confusion over where responsibility for certain issues regarding health and waste sit. If I could read from the Rules of Procedure: the States' Trading Supervisory Board Operational Functions – I believe Deputy Jones has an interest in that area – it is responsible for the:

'Management of the collection, disposal and recovery of solid waste' [and] "the Waste Disposal Authority"

2060 But, if we talk about investment in infrastructure generally, this is an issue for P&R and it is an issue for Environment & Infrastructure also, to sit around the table and get some of these issues resolved.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard, are you about to stand up?

**Deputy Brouard:** Thank you, sir.

2065 It may be niche, but of interest to me and my electorate: the Environment Department policy in the last term courted controversy with the Seafront lane fiasco, the failed Transport Strategy – which annoyed many – and you could not have a bus fare, could you? They tried to introduce paid parking and left common sense behind.

2070 Will you continue with these policies or seek a new way forward of forging the future of the environment of our beautiful Island?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** I could refer Deputy Brouard directly to the speech I have just given.

2075 May I remind Members, the minority report, the Road Transport Strategy, was fully endorsed by this Assembly, and I would just ask you in the meantime to revisit *Hansard*.

The Environment Department then returned to this Assembly at the legislation stage and some of the funding elements were stripped out.

2080 On 1st May, we saw the introduction of emission charges. I believe there are members of the community that still do not realise, perhaps, that was an element that this States have approved.

But, generally, the Road Transport Strategy, although it was rather compromised at legislation stage, actually remains pretty much intact and sits at home within the Environment & Infrastructure Department.

2085 **The Bailiff:** Will you switch your microphone off?  
Deputy De Lisle.

2090 **Deputy De Lisle:** I will seek a new way forward to work with the people. It has been extremely disappointing to me to have Environment working in the way it has in the past. As a businessman and a politician, I think I have suffered and I think others have suffered as a result of the Strategy put forward.

2095 Environment should be working for and with the people of Guernsey and not against them, and I think this is extremely important. I agree with the questioner that the Department has to bring back a presence and also support business and the economy in the future.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

2100 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** If you are elected, will you be proposing a motion to introduce paid parking in Town, on The Bridge or anywhere else in the Island, for that matter?  
If you are not intending to propose such a motion, would you support it if it was proposed?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2105 **Deputy De Lisle:** I am not a supporter of paid parking. I feel that it would have a major negative impact on our Town. I think that it is important that the Town flourishes, that the Town actually expands and is able to compete with areas like St Helier, because at the moment we are not, and also we are not providing the opportunities in Town that we can do in the future. But we need more parking in Town, certainly, and that is something not only for the residents, which I feel should be looked at, but also for shoppers and people working in Town. But not paid parking,  
2110 as such, because that would cripple the business and the shoppers to the Town. *[Bell rings]*

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2115 **Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you.  
I could respectfully refer back to the speech I have just given or I could also refer Deputy Lester Queripel to my manifesto that says I will not revisit paid parking. I believe it would be ill-advised to do so.

2120 When people talk about increased parking to St Peter Port, just remember that if the States are not going to provide facilities for people to park, because we cannot afford to do it, these private ventures take millions of pounds and each individual car space has to be a considerable amount to park in hourly. So the question is then, why would we build, within St Peter Port, something that may look actually not particularly attractive and have a very high hourly rate.

2125 But actually we do have paid parking in other areas. We have it at the Airport and we have it on other States' land, but to introduce it globally across the Island ... And can I say I would never consider paid parking at any stage in the future, particularly at the Hospital. But I have given a commitment in this four-year term not to revisit paid parking.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Dudley-Owen.

2130 **Deputy Dudley-Owen:** Despite the recent increase in numbers using the bus service, this is still a drop in the ocean, and the service continues to run under capacity and is subsidised. Has the time come to completely rethink the bus service and whether the traditional model we are currently supporting fits with modern Guernsey and its people's transport needs?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2135

**Deputy Brehaut:** The States have invested multi-million pounds in the bus network that actually serves this community much better than you think it does.

2140 In my family experience I have somebody who may never drive, who would be dependent on those around him to get from A to B. The bus service plays a vital role in investing in an individual to get them to school, to get them home, to get them to after-school learning. Their contribution to society will be immense and enormous.

2145 I would love to see a huge surge in the uptake in bus usage but that is down for this Assembly to promote bus usage, rather than, at times, talk down what people consider to be a service that does not perform particularly well, when we know actually it performs remarkably well over recent months.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2150 **Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, I think commuters would welcome a reliable bus service into Town without, of course, straddling the whole of the countryside in its journey to the Town: direct routings, in other words. Frequency and evening services must be considered as well.

2155 I saw the bus service increase during my term in Environment Department, four years, from about 900,000 to almost 1.5 million. I was very keen on pushing bus ridership to its maximum and very successful in doing that through providing some free days as well to market the system.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

2160 **Deputy Gollop:** As one of the candidates has already observed, some of us might have red faces about which bits belong to which new principal committees, but what would be the two candidates' views in relation to their Alderney responsibilities, which may well include the Airport and the breakwater and other infrastructure elements for the northern Island?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2165

2170 **Deputy De Lisle:** I am very keen on linking and providing transportation opportunities for Alderney so that it can develop its economy to the fullest in the future. I am disappointed it does not have a realistic sort of sea connection to Guernsey, but I would be interested in seeing the Alderney runway resurfaced, and the breakwater maintained to the level of expenditure that we are appropriating at the current time – about half a million a year – in terms of making that facility sound and a strong defence to the Alderney Harbour.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2175 **Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you, sir

When I was a member of HSSD one of my proudest achievements, oddly enough – and I know politicians like building things – was to be associated with the construction of Le Mignot Hospital, because when you look at the situation in Alderney, at the time, with regard to healthcare, it was a real investment in people and the community.

2180 What you touch on, and I am sympathetic to the demands, and again it was in my speech with regard to the Breakwater and with regard to infrastructure in Alderney ... what we have had for years in this Assembly is disconnect where what we have done is we have come to this Assembly with policy then we looked to this bench and say, 'Any chance of any resources?' What I am hoping that we can have in the future is clear policies and resources married together before  
2185 policy letters, States' reports, return to this Assembly.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Well, Deputy Brouard has already asked one question. Does anybody who has not asked a question ...? Deputy de Sausmarez

2190

**Deputy de Sausmarez:** Can the candidates please outline how they see the role of the Committee for Environment & Infrastructure in enhancing the public realm?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2195

**Deputy Brehaut:** Well, actually Liberation Day I was lucky enough to play in a band at the Last Post. The power cut. Sadly for the public, the power was still connected at 6 o'clock and we went on stage (*Laughter*) so they had to endure us! But actually, from where I sat, I looked down Rue Frairies, I looked down towards the former St Helene's Hotel and I saw the street alive with people – people cycling, people walking, people playing. To get people out of their motor car actually and into the public realm and reclaim elements of the public realm is a laudable thing to do and these things can be done very simply, without great expense; and other communities do them very well, but that is a great discussion to have about reclaiming elements of the public realm from what you might call displacement parking and issues such as that.

2200

2205

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** I want future generations, and the current generation, to live in a community which is clean, vibrant and prosperous, and I think that has to be the cornerstone of environmental and infrastructure policy going forward. It is very important, I think, to also protect the natural and physical environment, and develop our infrastructure; but it is all a matter of balance, but it is also an issue of sustainability for the future, and this is where I emphasise local self-sufficiency in food production, for example, locally, and us encouraging the dairy industry and also the farming industry, the fishery industry also, in the future.

2210

2215

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

I would like to ask the candidates: would they put the adequate provision of affordable premises for light and heavy industry near the top of their priority list if they are successful in this election, and do they understand the strategic and economic need to do so?

2220

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

Well, from a planning policy point of view, I think that is within the mandate of the committee under Strategic Land Use.

2225

Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, strategic land use is extremely important. As a businessman and politician, I think that it is very important that we stress that particular aspect and, of course, I

2230

have been keen since working on the Environment Department to strengthen environmental policy and to bring in a vision for environmental policy into the future.

2235 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Yes, just for clarification perhaps for people who are not aware, there is another role within Government which is the Development Planning Authority and that does the 'doing' bit of planning. But the Strategic Land Use Plan does actually sit with the Environment & Infrastructure Department. I think Deputy Smithies, in his question possibly earlier in the week, spoke of the Fred in the Shed and the need for people to have light industrial units.

2240 I do like the term 'Fred in the Shed'; it was coined, I think, by the former Deputy Gill, but what we actually do is evidence the need and evidence the demand, and I think the best place to do that is through the committee that Deputy Ferbrache now Chairs, and again bring these issues to the table to get the overarching policy directions right in the first instance and then once again do the doing bit and do the implementation.

2245 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Does anybody else want to ask a first question? Deputy Yerby.

2250

**Deputy Yerby:** Sir, my interest is in inclusion generally and, of course, physical accessibility is only one part of that, but being unable to physically access a place does send people a very clear message. What is the view of the candidates on the role of inclusion in shaping the policies and activities of the new committee?

2255

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Well, the subject is broad but thank you very much for the question.

2260 If we take simple daily activities of living, bus drivers, for example, now have training sessions so people who have great difficulty actually getting physically to a bus stop are assisted on public transport and aided when they get there.

Also this will sit actually with the Development and Planning Authority, but what Environment have done before today is ensure that with building control and regulations we try to get access for individuals.

2265 I know that deals very specifically with physical needs maybe, but I take on board your points that the Environment & Infrastructure Department must have considerations like that at the forefront, but I have to say that is an area where we could all learn when we adopt senior roles – is to realise when the policies we oversee actually exclude people rather than being inclusive.

2270 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, inclusion and disability – very important area. Access, particularly in Town – I think there are areas for improvement there, and I think we should be looking at that.

2275 But, when I speak to the disabled, it is jobs that they require and I think the Government in Guernsey should be doing far more to enable the disabled to actually work and have and make a living in this Island, and I am not sure that we are doing as much as we could do in order to provide facilities and also employment opportunities for the disabled. I think that is a critical issue that has come through a recent conference that we had whereby many feel that they are disengaged –

2280

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Dorey.

**Deputy Dorey:** There are many parts of our infrastructure that need significant investment, what do you see as your priorities in terms of investment in our infrastructure?

2285

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** I think one of the areas, of course, is in infrastructure for waste disposal. I think we are going to have to spend in that area to immediately resolve some of the issues and, apart from confrontation with respect to building certain facilities so that we can operate a sound waste disposal policy, we could even look at perhaps providing in-vessel composting here in Guernsey, and investing that way rather than perhaps clogging up the ports with food waste in the future.

2290

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2295

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you, sir.

I think if we talk about housing broadly in infrastructure that is probably a standalone thing. My focus would be on coastal erosion, coastal defence. There is some work that looks perhaps rather pretty and attractive, which is functional, which costs a great deal of money, which is the pointing of granite to keep sea out.

2300

However, earlier in the year, Bulwer Avenue, the road was almost undermined and under that road was electricity, there was a gas main, where the ISD connections for banks and that was a very real risk to infrastructure. So the priority must be on coastal defence and ensuring that the services are safe and businesses stay well connected.

2305

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Any other first questions? Yes. Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** Under the Annex 1 to the mandates of the Committees of the States, each committee has to be aware of the powers, duties and limits of the committee's mandate and to respect and not to undermine the mandates of other committees of the States. How do the candidates see that they will work with the Development & Planning Authority?

2310

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

2315

**Deputy Brehaut:** That is a fantastic question. I would really have liked a month's notice, but thanks anyway! *(Laughter)*

Communication is absolutely important, but I make again, if I may, a general observation. When we have had situations recently arise in the States regarding communication and when perhaps departments have struggled in some areas to get the community on board, the lessons were all there perhaps in the Wells Audit Review some years ago, and what we need are absolutely indelible paper trails to trace back to decisions that were made at a certain time and place. So when conflicts arise and there is overlap, it is clearly evidenced as to where these points of tension were created, so you can work backwards from that.

2320

2325

I am sorry for the particularly general answer to that question.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, I think we have to further the planning process and make sure that it is responsive to the people of Guernsey. I think too many people feel disaffected at the current time through planning application results, that they feel quite unfair to their particular needs and they see others having preferential treatment beyond their own. I think this is something that we have

2330

2335 to deal with and this is something that I will be lobbying very hard through the committee to ensure that the Development Committee is made aware of.

**The Bailiff:** Any other first questions? If not, Deputy Brouard and then Deputy Lester Queripel, who have bit been waiting a long time for a second.

2340 **Deputy Brouard:** Thank you, sir.

Do you support the draft policy of Environment which changes the policy from minimum car parking standards for new residential developments to keep cars off the street and having to be moved daily, or do you support the proposed change to a maximum parking standard, restricting the developers when they want to provide residents with parking on site?

2345

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2350 **Deputy De Lisle:** No, I think that the restrictions are too much, and I think we have got to realise that the car is here, the car is here to stay and we have to accommodate it, and businesses should not be constrained, and businesses are constrained in Town at the current time.

We have got to provide more parking, and the ability elsewhere for commercial premises to provide the required parking spaces that meet the needs of the business, and unfortunately I think the current proposals are too restrictive and should be opened up.

2355 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you.

2360 Well, the safety bicycle is here and I think it is here to stay. Can I just say with regard to Deputy Brouard's question and the manner in which he has asked it, Deputy Brouard, by his own admission, has been a fairly consistent challenge to the Environment Department over the years, but the Environment Department in isolation cannot do anything without the consent of this Assembly.

2365 Deputy Brouard talks of planning law that this Assembly has overseen and endorsed, and I am standing now to be Chair of the Environment & Infrastructure Department that has the responsibility for the Strategic Land Use Plan and Deputy Brouard is now talking about an area of planning, in a certain manner – if he does not mind me saying so – that probably no longer sits fairly with regard to the mandate and office that I am attempting to occupy.

Thank you.

2370 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** If you are elected will you be proposing a motion for us to deal with our waste here on-Island instead of exporting it? If you are not intending to propose such a motion would you support it if it was proposed?

2375

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Again, sir, the - and I am sorry, I keep saying overarching policy, and I do not want to say it quite as frequently as that – but we have done that element.

2380 The States have approved ... If we take the PSD announcement with regard to waste export to Tilbury and then on to Sweden, that is the direction it is going. With regard to specific elements with regard to infrastructure, that sits somewhere else rather than with the new Environment & Infrastructure Department.

2385 **The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Exporting our waste is a useful way of cutting down actually on the amount of waste produced in the Island, because there is a cost factor, and there will be an interest in reducing that cost and, as a result, reducing the waste.

2390 But I think, in terms of food waste, we still have to look at that as to what the future system will be, and I think there we need to look again at in-vessel composting here to cut down on the transport outside the Island of the amount of waste, and to provide facilities here for food waste recycling and in-vessel composting.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

2395

**Deputy Gollop:** More specifically, following up the last question, would the candidates commit to retaining kerbside recycling and perhaps looking again at what Jersey might have to offer our waste strategy.

2400 **The Bailiff:** I am not sure – well, I am sure – that is within the mandate of this committee, because management of the collection, disposal and recovery of solid waste has moved to the States' Trading Supervisory Board. I look to be guided by H.M. Procureur as to whether this is within the mandate.

2405 **The Procureur:** You are very on the ball, sir. I think that is right.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

2410 Do the candidates wish to see derelict vinery sites put to better use so as to provide the Island with social economic strategic and environmental benefits, or are they happy to see them remain as they are?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

2415

**Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, I am very keen on seeing renewable resources use of the vinery sites. I know we cannot use all the vinery sites, but in certain cases I think we could be generating solar energy from vinery sites, whereas those sites are totally static at the moment and not producing anything. I think we have to look – particularly a small Island, densely populated as we are, with a lot of conflicting land uses – at the opportunities that we have and develop them accordingly.

2420

I think solar, renewable energy is something that we are sadly lacking here. We are way behind other jurisdictions and we have to do something with respect to the Island resources, and vineries provide that opportunity for solar production.

2425 **Deputy Brehaut:** Fortunately, there are plenty of safeguards on policy directions for politicians to answer these questions because the Environment Department, one of the last things it has done is sign off the Island Development Plan, which will be an element to this.

2430 The Island Development Plan was overseen by an independent building inspectorate, for want of a better description, and they arbitrate, they hear, individually, people who go to them and say that, 'I have a vinery. I believe it could be housing. I believe it could have some other use.'

2435 I think it may have been the returnee, Deputy Roffey, and possibly the non-returnee, David Grut, who placed an amendment to argue that derelict vinery sites within the environment of an existing social housing estate could be used for social housing. But of course with the population of 63,000, and growing, the tensions within the community and with regard to settlements in established settlement areas, there is always a tension within that, I think there is –

I think it is time I sat down! *(Laughter)*

2440 **The Bailiff:** One more question. This will probably be the last question. No. If nobody wishes to ask it then we will ... Oh I thought you were about to jump up, Deputy Roffey. You are getting your pen out to record your vote, are you? I thought you were about to jump up, I am sorry.

**Deputy Roffey:** I was not, sir. Your questions just let you down, I was just grabbing my pen to vote that was all.

2445 **The Bailiff:** Well, please go ahead and vote then. Deputy De Lisle, I remind you, was proposed by Deputy Gollop, seconded by Deputy Lowe and Deputy Brehaut was proposed by Deputy Le Clerc and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache.

Are there any more voting slips? No.

2450 Members, I propose that we wait so that we get the result of this vote so the candidates know before they go to lunch whether they are elected are not. The votes are going off to be counted now and as soon as we have declared the result then we will rise for lunch – unless it is tied of course.

2455 **Deputy Jones:** Sir?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Jones, yes.

2460 **Deputy Jones:** Sir, can I make a suggestion that we have an hour for lunch today and get back and get on with this process, because we have got other speeches to come this afternoon.

**The Bailiff:** You can make that suggestion, I will put it to the Assembly. The proposal is that we resume at 2 o'clock, the alternative will be 2.30 p.m. the Proposition is that we resume at 2 o'clock. Those in favour; those against.

*Some Members vote Pour, others voted Contre.*

2465 **The Bailiff:** Oh, I do not want to call that one actually, I think. Well, it will fill the time; we will have a recorded vote. *(Laughter)* We will go for a recorded vote on the Proposition that we resume at 2 p.m.

Greffier.

2470 **The Greffier:** The voting will start with St Sampson's.

*There was a recorded vote.*

2475 **The Bailiff:** Well, Members, I will announce the more important one first, the voting for the election of the President for the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure: Deputy Brehaut, 25 votes, Deputy De Lisle, 13 votes and there was one blank paper and one spoilt paper. So I declare Deputy Brehaut elected. *(Applause)*

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you very much everyone.

Carried – Pour 24, Contre 14, Ne vote pas 1, Absent 1

**POUR**

Deputy Stephens  
Deputy Meerveld  
Deputy David Jones  
Deputy Lowe  
Deputy Smithies

**CONTRE**

Deputy Trott  
Deputy Le Pelley  
Deputy Merrett  
Deputy St Pier  
Deputy Fallaize

**NE VOTE PAS**

Deputy Yerby

**ABSENT**

Deputy Kuttelwascher

Deputy Hansmann Rouxel	Deputy Laurie Queripel
Deputy Paint	Deputy Graham
Deputy Le Tocq	Deputy Green
Deputy Dudley-Owen	Deputy Dorey
Deputy De Lisle	Deputy Brouard
Deputy Langlois	Alderney Rep. McKinley
Deputy Soulsby	Deputy Gollop
Deputy de Sausmarez	Deputy Parkinson
Deputy Roffey	Deputy Mooney
Deputy Prow	
Deputy Oliver	
Alderney Rep. Jean	
Deputy Ferbrache	
Deputy Tindall	
Deputy Brehaut	
Deputy Tooley	
Deputy Lester Queripel	
Deputy Le Clerc	
Deputy Leadbeater	

2480 **The Bailiff:** I think we are coming back at 2 o'clock, but we will wait and see ... which is how I would have called it, I should have trusted my ears.

Yes, in favour of the motion that we can resume at 2 p.m., 24 in favour, 14 against with 1 abstention. We will resume at 2 o'clock.

*The Assembly adjourned at 1.05 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 2 p.m.*

**V. Committee for Health & Social Care –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Soulsby elected**

*Article V.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Health & Social Care to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article V, Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of President.

2485 **The Bailiff:** Do we have any nominations? Deputy St Pier.

**Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I would like to propose Deputy Heidi Soulsby.

2490 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Trott, are you seconding?

**Deputy Trott:** Pleasure to second Deputy Heidi Soulsby.

**The Bailiff:** Any other candidates? No.

2495 In that case, for the position of President of the Committee for Health & Social Care, there is one nomination: Deputy Soulsby, proposed by Deputy St Pier, seconded by Deputy Trott.

Deputy St Pier will speak in her favour.

2500 **Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I have worked with Deputy Soulsby on and off in various organisations since the early 1990's and Members who were elected in 2012 will, of course, recall that I proposed her for the position of Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, and I said, at the time that I was proposing her, that I would probably come at some point to regret that during that period, because I knew she would be Rottweiler-esque – if there is such a word – in discharging her role as Chair of Public Accounts Committee, and I think I was proved to be correct.

2505 She definitely made me feel uncomfortable on a number of occasions when she spoke in this Assembly and through the work of Public Accounts Committee and, of course, quite rightly so, given the role.

2510 Similarly, of course, we have not always agreed on all policy issues that have come before this Assembly, certainly during the period of the last term, but, as I am sure all Members of the Assembly will be aware, Deputy Soulsby is of course a chartered accountant and those financial skills – as I said four years ago – would have been extremely valuable on Treasury & Resources, and indeed, of course, they would have been valuable on Policy & Resources in this term.

2515 But of course the need is undoubtedly greatest in the Committee for Health & Social Care. It is those financial skills and experience, plus of course her previous roles and experience as the chief operating officer in a number of organisations which make ... and gained with that a significant change management experience, which make her emphatically the right choice for this position at this time.

2520 This is an organisation that is going to experience a significant amount of change and challenge and, sir, we all need to get behind Deputy Soulsby, if indeed she is confirmed as President of this committee, and her committee. That, of course, was a comment I made also during the election of Policy & Resources in response to questions there. It is incredibly important that we are supportive of that committee, and I think we need to recognise the challenges.

2525 So I am, sir, absolutely delighted to have the opportunity to propose Deputy Soulsby for this position and, once again of course, with the unanimous support of the Policy & Resources Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby.

2530 **Deputy Soulsby:** Sir, I do think it is important that I make a speech particularly for this committee, which I think will probably be one of the major committee with challenges throughout this term.

2535 Four boards, three Ministers, 17 Members and five Chief Officers – that is the reality of change in the Health & Social Services Department since January 2010. Whilst the title may change from Minister of the Health & Social Services Department to President of the Committee for Health & Social Care, it will not make the challenges any different, or the role any easier. Indeed, it makes the job of running Condor seem like an attractive proposition! (*Laughter*)

2540 I put my name forward for the position of President with my eyes wide open, having been Deputy Minister of the Department for the last 18 months, and with a firm belief that things can be different. However, one President and one committee cannot do it alone. The challenges of Health & Social Care are the challenges of the entire Assembly, indeed, those of the whole community and therefore all of us to overcome together.

2545 So what are they? Well, from reading Members' manifestos, it is clear many already here have very good ideas about what needs sorting out: reducing dependency on agency staff; supporting local nurses; helping carers; multi-agency working; being patient centred; moving forward the Mental Health Strategy; improving care for the elderly; increasing the focus on prevention and early intervention. All completely valid, but there are only a fraction of the 88 tasks that the last board of HSSD has passed on to the new Committee for Health & Social Care.

These include: re-profiling PEH; moving the emergency department in-house; implementing SLAWS; secondary health care contract renewals; development of tele-health and tele-care; and exploring closer working with Jersey. Each and every one of them is important to the

2550 transformation of Health & Social Care. Each and every one of them can lead to a more sustainable service. A service which is currently 17% more expensive than its peer group, according to BDO.

This, at a time when we are struggling to meet the needs of an ageing population, where the number of 85's will increase 20% by the end of this term. This, at a time when medical goals and people's expectations are rising, using that horrid phrase, 'doing nothing is not an option'. But if we are to have any chance of success, apart from the obvious need to establish priorities, we will require team work, resources and a sea change in how we communicate both internally and externally.

2560 Taking team work first, we need partnership and engagement both across committees of the States, but also externally with private and third sector organisations. We need to work together as a team, regardless of who pays us. Just look at the success of Leicester City to show how much a difference team work makes. It is not easy for me to say that as a Spurs fan, by the way! But it clearly shows how the whole can be greater than the sum of its parts, and if a football team with odds of 5,000 to 1 can go from near relegation to winning the Premier League in 12 months then surely we can make a difference through team work here.

2565 But that will not be enough. Last week Deputy Brouard likened the Policy & Resources Committee to the bridge of a ship steering it on the right course. He is right, but only half right. It may be the bridge in terms of policy, but it is the engine room when it comes to providing the IT, HR and finance resources that the principal committees, and especially Health & Social Care, will need.

2570 What I am saying is nothing new; various reports in the last term made reference to this, not least of which was that from the Public Accounts Committee, one that I know quite well, needless to say. You cannot run a cruise liner with an outboard engine. You cannot run an organisation with a budget of approximately £120 million when you are not made aware of an overspend until three weeks before the year end, or get no financial information until the end of the first quarter. Nothing will get better; in fact, things can only get worse, unless and until such issues are resolved.

2575 That is why the Policy & Resources Committee is crucial to the success of the transformation of Health & Social Care. That is why I did seriously think about standing for the Policy & Resources Committee. That is why I asked the questions of candidates last week about what they would do to ensure Health & Social Care got the quality of resources it needs. I was heartened by the response I received, and how all candidates referred to the need for collaboration and working together. What we are going to need now though is actions to back up those words.

2585 The third requirement, communication, today apart from health promotion messages what comes out of Health & Social Care tends to be restricted to reactive responses to the several media requests received every day. That has to change. Difficult decisions are going to have to be made, which means we must have proactive dialogue with both the Members of this Assembly and the people of the Bailiwick.

2590 Indeed, we need to build bridges with Alderney – well not literally, although it may solve the Island's transport issues (*Laughter*) but certainly metaphorically! We need everyone to know what we do and why, but also what our challenges are. We need to listen, understand which solutions are accessible and which are not. We need to demonstrate we have listened and show what progress we have made. We need to explain why some treatments are approved and others not, why some services are provided and others not. Where there is no information, myths quickly fill the vacuum.

2595 It became crystal clear to me when canvassing over the last few weeks, people telling me there are exactly 4.8 administrators to front line staff in the Hospital. Myth! No, this is not about propaganda but education, understanding, openness and transparency, partnership and engagement. There are 1,936 people employed directly by the States in Health & Social Care: 2600 nurses, auxiliaries, housekeepers, cleaners, accountants, pathologists, business analysts, radiologists, porters, electricians and cooks, to name just a few. Phew. There are many more who

work with them: consultants, physiotherapists, carers, GPs, dentists and the emergency services. Each one has an important part to play to provide at 24/7 365-days-a-year service.

2605 Remember, if there is no-one to equip the theatres properly, the surgeons cannot operate. If there is no-one to clean the sheets, patients cannot occupy the beds, and again the surgeon cannot operate. It would be madness to think that in such a complicated structure things will not go wrong; they will. What we must do is minimise the risk of bad things happening, but when they do own up to our mistakes and learn from them. We can help do that through transitioning from crisis mode to a period of stability and recovery, where morale can improve and positive mind sets kick in.

2610 It will be hard work. When work gets hard you see three sorts of people: those who turn up their sleeves, those who turn up their noses and those who do not turn up at all. I have shown in the last four years that I do not shy away from hard work. I promise to do the same as President of Health & Social Care: work with people, not against them and bring people with me on a journey of transformation. A journey that, like a Guernsey road, will have a few potholes, the odd pile of horse muck, one or two diversions, but hopefully not a closure sign.

I would like to end with a quote from an inspirational leader, the Dalai Lama. He said:

'To remain indifferent to the challenges we face is indefensible. If the goal is noble, whether or not it is realized within our lifetime is largely irrelevant. What we must do therefore is to strive and persevere and never give up.'

2620 I believe that to seek the best health and social care service that our people deserve is a noble cause, and ask that Members give me the support to enable me to help start that journey towards it, as President of the Committee for Health & Social Care today.

**The Bailiff:** Members, you vote now on the election of the President of the Committee for Health & Social Care. There is one candidate: Deputy Soulsby, proposed by Deputy St Pier and seconded by Deputy Trott. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

2625 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Soulsby elected. *(Applause)*

## **VI. Committee for Home Affairs – Election of President – Debate commenced**

*Article VI.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Committee for Health & Social Care to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article VI, Committee for Home Affairs – Election of President.

**The Bailiff:** Any candidates? Deputy Ferbrache.

2630 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I have pleasure in nominating Deputy Mary Lowe.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe. Is there a seconder? Deputy Brouard.  
Any other candidates? Deputy Soulsby.

**Deputy Soulsby:** Sir, I have pleasure in proposing Deputy Matt Fallaize.

2635

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize and a seconder? Deputy Dorey.

Any other candidates? No. Well, in that case I invite Deputies Lowe and Fallaize to come up on to the bench.

2640

The speeches will now be in the order of Deputy Ferbrache, Deputy Lowe, Deputy Soulsby and Deputy Fallaize.

Deputy Ferbrache.

2645

**Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, Deputy Lowe has been a Member of this Assembly for 22 years. She and I entered the States of Guernsey as Deputies in the spring of 1994, and she and I were elected by the people of Alderney, the People of Guernsey and, of course, the people of Herm, as Conseillers in 1997. I then left the States, unintended, and she continued and has succeeded in five elections since. So she has been elected with a considerable number of votes, both cumulatively and individually, in seven elections. Not only the people of the Vale but, when they had their one opportunity, the people of the Island respected her in significant numbers.

2650

Now, I worked with her during my six years in the States and she was a person of absolute quality. We had similar political views on most issues. I have never known anybody more diligent or more conscientious. After I left the States we maintained a friendly relationship. I was always interested in the States' affairs, and I also had the pleasure of working with her for some years as a member of the board of the Guernsey's Women's Refuge. Except for me, she had a team of absolute quality ... they were international class players, let alone anybody else, of a wide series of disciplines.

2655

And I have sat on boards, company boards, I have sat on States' committees, I have sat on trustees' boards, I have sat on all kinds of boards; I have done more sitting than I have done speaking on some occasions in relation to all those. I have never seen a better Chairperson. Her work was collegiate, it is collaborative and she carried forward that institution with great quality, and perspicacity, over a number of years. Indeed, if you remember Her Majesty gave Guernsey Women's Refuge an award, and it was largely due to the work and leadership of Mary Lowe.

2660

Now she has sat on – she tells me she has counted them; I have not, but I accept what she says – 17 States' committees, numerous sub-committees, various other boards; she is a member of three school boards, one for a mere 29 years and the other for another 20 years, and more recently she joined another one.

2665

When you look at people you have got to say has the ... also, of course, she has been on the predecessor to this committee, for the best part of four years. We talk about continuity, how that may ... I do not know what 20 of you know what you are doing: one was not sure and the other 19 voted for me a week ago in relation to Deputy St Pier. One of the key factors – and I think rightly so – was continuity; he had been in the States for a number of years, I had not. This lady has been in the States for longer than anybody.

2670

I could speak volumes about her credibility and her work rate. She is a constituency Deputy; she is a person that cares. She can sometimes have an approach which is direct – well, direct is one of the favourite words in my dictionary – and Deputy Lowe, I can say – having worked with all the people I have worked with over the last 36 years in Guernsey; 40-odd years as a lawyer, in so many various committees, bodies and others – I have never met a person who, as I said, works harder and has better leadership skills.

2675

This is a great opportunity in relation to a committee that she holds very dear to her heart, and bear in mind she has previously had experiences in this, and experience as a member of the Policy Council, and she also shaved a mere £1 million, not a bagatelle, off the prescription budget some years ago, so she knows the value of a shilling, which you would expect from a good Guernsey girl, but she also knows how to get things done.

2680

I very much commend her to this Assembly.

2685

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you, sir.

2690 I would like to thank my proposer, Deputy Ferbrache, especially for those really kind words as well, and my seconder Deputy Brouard for their support. I would also like to thank the Vale electorate who have kindly elected me for a seventh time.

2695 Why do I want to be President to the Committee for Home Affairs? Well, apart from the fantastic staff who work there – and I have a good working relationship with them – I am the longest serving Member on the previous Home Department, which has now become the Committee for Home Affairs, and having continuity, as Deputy Ferbrache has just said, and utilising my 22 years' States' experience, working on all those departments and committees, plus a number of sub-groups, would be invaluable with even more working across the other new committees as the services step up the challenges the Bailiwick will face.

2700 I really enjoy the challenges at the Home Department – and there have been several during my time. Financial Transformation Programme savings, mostly through efficiencies, have been rewarding and reasonably successful. Why rewarding? Well, knowing all States' employees had to look at ways of doing things differently so a change in mind-set right across the whole sector, with an outcome of finding ways of doing much of the same but in a more efficient manner. That exercise saved over £2 million. As a member of the Home Department during those years, I was particularly proud to be part of that process of returning the savings to the centre.

2705 One contribution to efficiency savings was a decision to appoint a Head of Law Enforcement overseeing the Police and Customs, this joint working together is still in its infancy, but with the potential for even more savings.

2710 So what next on the priority list for the Committee for Home Affairs? Bearing in mind Guernsey emergency services have to cater for all situations, more so than a small UK town with a similar population who can call out another Council or city. Guernsey cannot; we have no cavalry to help us out.

2715 At the top of the priority list must be the economy and its safety, and in many different guises. Our economy relies on keeping on top of the cyber threats, money laundering and complying with codes of practice such as Moneyval; not only for those living here, but for those operating businesses being able to flourish and prosper in an uncertain world. Security is our platform for all we do in the Islands for residents and businesses.

2720 The staff are working with Jersey – although it is in its early stages in preparation – for the new EU Data Protection Legislation coming into force 2018. A policy letter and legislation will be needed, but it is more than likely this will be a massive opportunity for the Bailiwick to be able to offer compliant data services to the economy and business opportunities.

2725 Our community needs to feel safe, certainly having community policemen back on the streets has been not only very popular, but successful. The latest Law Enforcement Annual Report makes for pleasant reading and I recommend Members, and the public, if you have time please read it.

2730 We now have some of the lowest crime figures for 40 years. The fancy title of Home & Operational Services Transformation Programme, known as HOST, is aimed at transforming the operations of the committee to be a more efficient and effective service to the public. What it really means is the introduction of great joint working across the services with St John Ambulance and Rescue Service, and the potential for property rationalisation; along with the introduction of new and modern ways of working, and the integration of trading standards, and last but not least, the housing control system, soon to be the new permit system, moving into the office of the Committee for Home Affairs.

2735 The current objective is to submit an outline business case, and full business case, by the end of 2016 for approval by the States, in order to further progress the transformation agenda. Within the five-year plan for HOST a target of £1 million efficiency savings are envisaged. This is good news and I want to continue to be a part in driving this forward. We are just on the brink of

developing a new justice policy. This is a multi-agency working group with a report before the States in the quarter 2017.

2740 Quite an extensive list of new Committee for Home Affairs Laws will be coming before the States; some are quite large pieces of work, such as the Population Management, which is one of the transferred responsibilities from Housing.

2745 We also have the new long-awaited outstanding Sexual Offences Legislation and we will have the opportunity to modernise our Police Laws as the Law Enforcement Legislation. That will bring us up into the 21st century standard – an exciting and challenging time as these Laws really affect people's lives and liberty.

Home Department led the way with a Government's business performance management framework and, when phase two is completed, will integrate the office of the Committee for Home Affairs with the Corporate Performance Management framework to enable a broader understanding of performance.

2750 Next month we are going to have the opportunity to really understand the resources that we need with T&R's benchmarking process, which after Home will go on to Education. I and the staff welcome this. Although there will be extra work, the result will have a significant impact on resources and I will endeavour to help with the report and support the staff.

2755 One of the best things this term was the Prison becoming a working prison. This has changed the Prison beyond recognition; the atmosphere amongst the prisoners and staff is unrecognisable to previously. The prisoners now work 8 a.m. to 6 p.m. daily and the work ethos has paid off and been popular, and once prisoners are released the continuing support when out in the community will, hopefully, reduce reoffending.

2760 The education unit installed at the Prison with five classrooms had a small take-up, but before long other prisoners saw how achievements and improving their lives can now happen whilst in prison, preparing them for when they leave. So many take pride in their work and many have taken and passed GCSEs and other examinations, whilst serving their time.

2765 Using the gym now is a perk in the evening, unless, of course, there are a few taking exams to train as fitness instructors. Private companies work with the prison staff and provide work for the prisoners.

The *What's On* sealed packets at the airports and harbours are prepared with the inserts by prisoners, furniture repairs for community use, and you see many of it around the Island, the list goes on.

2770 I could spend my 10 minutes just talking about all the beneficial work just going on at the Prison but I will not. If I am elected today an invite will be forthcoming for all States' Members to visit the Prison and other Home Affairs services and you will see it is not the grand hotel described by some.

2775 Before I move on, when looking at the Prison statistics, it helps establish that various policies are working. Why do I say that? Years ago the majority of prisoners were sentenced for violence, whereas now the majority of prisoners are in for drug-related crime – 32 currently, followed by 21 for sexual abuse, with 20 prisoners in for violence.

2780 More people are getting caught and sentenced for drug-related crime. The Alcohol and Drug Strategy promotions help to fight against drug use. The rise in cases going to Court for paedophilia reflects, in some cases, the ease of the internet, downloading images whilst at home with the culprit believing they will not be caught has proved otherwise. We have, and we need, a Police Force at the cutting edge of technology in dealing with these crimes.

2785 I now move to Alderney – some of you will be sad to hear that, but I am only talking about when I went for the day, but I welcomed representing the Home Department when I met with the Guernsey Police stationed in Alderney and the Alderney States' Members, gaining feedback on how working together can be improved and what can be achieved. There are different ways Guernsey can help Alderney, and we have, although more can be done.

I also represented the Home Department at the Youth forum, when they met here in the Royal Court for their At the States' Day. What an inspirational day that was: observing the young people

2790 on this Island debating in this Chamber about Island issues and what decisions by this States means to them and their future.

We recently lost our Chief Officer going to Health. It is even more reason to have continuity – something which I can bring as a new officer settles in. If elected as President, I will have quarterly public meetings welcoming the public to attend, and ask questions of their Government committees or share their ideas. Maybe the other committees will agree to taking Government to the people. Communication must improve this term.

2795 It is really exciting times with our blue light services, and I want to ensure we have a first-rate professional service to support the Islands, the economy and you. With your backing, I can continue to push through the efficiencies, and support our staff, and I will be very grateful for your vote to enable me to carry on.

2800 Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Soulsby will speak in favour of Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Soulsby:** Mr Bailiff, fellow Members.

2805 When Deputy Fallaize asked me to propose him for President of the Committee for Home Affairs I had no hesitation in saying yes. I know that holds true of his seconder, Deputy Dorey.

It is of no surprise to me either that Deputies St Pier, Trott, Le Tocq and Stephens have all been happy to endorse him. He is, quite frankly, the best person for the job. Even though he is still only 34, poll topper, Deputy Fallaize is now a bit of an old boy, having served as a Deputy for eight years.

2810 Throughout that time he has demonstrated the energy, enthusiasm, intelligence and thoughtfulness that make him more than capable for high public office in today's challenging world. I have watched Deputy Fallaize closely during the last term. Indeed, we sat very near each other as Chairs of Parliamentary Committees separated by the sensible Deputy Jones. I witnessed someone not afraid to give his opinion, but also someone with a positive and constructive approach. Now, as we all like to big ourselves up in our manifestos – they are a sales pitch after all – I think this particular sentence in Deputy Fallaize's manifesto is spot on, and I quote:

'What matters is getting things done for our Island, and that demands co-operation and pragmatic leadership.

This was also clearly demonstrated by his getting involved in leading negotiations which did lead to a resolution of the issues at L'Ancrese Common.

2820 Deputy Fallaize does not carp from the edges but gets involved to seek a solution, which is what people want from their leaders now. They are fed up with bickering and point scoring, and want to see some positive action.

Now, Deputy Fallaize is well known for his cleverly-crafted amendments, which have resulted in the term 'Fallaizian' entering the Guernsey political lexicon! (*Laughter*) Many an amendment has been laid in this Assembly, which may not have his name at the top, but display all the tell-tale signs. I think therefor without an e being a dead giveaway. However, more than one such amendment has been the difference between the complete failure of a policy letter and a dead-end and finding a way forward. That problem-solving ability will be critical as a President of a major committee. He does not throw his toys out of the pram in public; that is yesterday's politics.

2830 Deputy Fallaize was a member of the old Home Department board in the last term, what has now become the Committee for Home Affairs, and I know he has developed a constructive working relation with the heads of the blue light services, but Home Affairs is more than the blue light services, the Police, the Fire and Prison. It also has responsibility for such policies as the misuse of drugs and alcohol, domestic abuse and safeguarding children. These are incredibly important areas that need considerable focus this term. You only have to read the recent Scrutiny Committee Commission Report of the Children's Law by Kathleen Marshall to know that.

2835 Deputy Fallaize has demonstrated how important these social issues are to him, by seeking to prioritise expenditure in those areas, representing Guernsey at the British-Irish Council on the

2840 misuse of alcohol, sitting as a Mackenzie Friend in the Family Courts, and supporting the Voice of Victims campaign.

He has no previous baggage whatsoever with any of the services for which the committee is responsible, or with any of the third sector agencies with which the committee needs to work closely; what he has got is empathy and a considered and thoughtful approach.

2845 Of course, Deputy Fallaize is the architect of the machinery of Government changes, it is testament to the work that he did in putting together the policy letters that despite the fact there were successful amendments these did not fundamentally undermine the basis and construction of the proposals.

2850 Actually, it was part of the first debate that I saw Deputy Fallaize's collaborative approach. Neither myself as Chair of PAC or Deputy Rob Jones as Chair of Scrutiny were happy with the original proposals, but we worked with Deputy Fallaize and Deputy Conder at the time to come up with an amendment that would be suitable for both sides. That was a positive experience; instead of fighting each other in public we worked together to come up with an acceptable resolution.

2855 Finally, the decision to have a referendum on Island-wide voting arose from an amendment proposed by Deputy Fallaize, which I was pleased to second. He made it clear in his manifesto that he would seek a position from which he could work with others to deliver a well organised binding referendum. The committee responsible, which will have a very strong involvement with the referendum is the Committee for Home Affairs. The position that Deputy Fallaize should have, Members of this Assembly, is President of the Committee for Home Affairs.

2860 Deputy Fallaize has demonstrated he is a skilful parliamentarian, and strong board and committee member, and a successful Chair of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. However, now is the time for Deputy Fallaize to step up and take the reins of a committee and that is the Committee for Home affairs.

2865 Members, please vote for the candidate with the drive, energy, thoughtfulness, intelligence and co-operative approach. That person is Deputy Matt Fallaize.

**The Bailiff:** Next, Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

2870 What motivates me most of all to want to lead the Committee for Home Affairs is the opportunity to advance and articulate three causes about which I feel particularly strongly.

First, maintaining a community which is safe, stable and secure; second, protecting and empowering victims and the vulnerable; and, third, offering hope and rehabilitation to those who want to turn their lives around.

2875 Guernsey is a strong and secure community. It will remain so only while policing and border control are effective, resourceful and responsive to the public they serve. I believe in policing by consent; in other words, by securing and maintaining the approval and respect of the public. I also believe that law enforcement policy should be based on evidence of what works and what does not, and not by the need for headline-grabbing initiatives.

2880 For five years, spanning two States' terms, I argued in vain against the establishment of an unnecessary bureaucracy to run policing locally. Last year the idea of a Law Enforcement Commission was finally scrapped, saving the taxpayer more than £600,000 in every States' term. What is needed now is the replacement of policing legislation, which dates back nearly 100 years. This will set out properly the duties, powers, limitations, oversight and establish the impartiality of modern law enforcement agencies.

2885 The main objectives of criminal justice policy must be to protect the innocent and keep the incidence of crime as low as possible. Prison plays an essential role by punishing offenders, deterring future crime and rehabilitating those who want to turn away from crime. In 2014 H.M. Inspectorate of Prisons reported that Guernsey Prison was:

'... a powerful reminder of how good a small prison can be.'

2890 The emphasis at Guernsey Prison is, quite rightly, on purposeful activity, work and education. There is, however, now the need to review the use of short-term prison sentences. There is limited evidence that they are effective, and yet in Guernsey it is typical for a third of prisoners to be serving less than a year, and for more than 10% to be serving less than six months. It may well be that more use needs to be made of alternatives to custodial sentences, especially if that can be  
2895 proven to cut reoffending rates.

The point is the new Committee for Home Affairs has more responsibility than its predecessor for criminal justice policy. In the long and evolving relationship between the States and the Royal Court, the time has come for the elected Government to shape criminal justice policy, but with wisdom and caution, and in a way which respects the proper separation of powers between the  
2900 executive and the judiciary.

Blue light services are vital, but I do – as Deputy Soulsby has already said – wish to see as much emphasis placed on the Committee for Home Affairs' other responsibilities, in particular the misuse of drugs and alcohol, domestic abuse and the safeguarding of children. I have a track record of speaking up on these issues and voting to prioritise resources in these areas.

2905 The Committee for Home Affairs will also be responsible for the new population regime. I am a candidate who has always supported the replacement of housing controls with work and residency permits. These reforms should provide a more effective way of influencing the size and make-up of the population. If we want economic growth at a time when the number of economically inactive people is increasing – and we do – at least some increase in population is  
2910 probably unavoidable. But encouraging significant population growth would not resolve the demographic challenges of the future, indeed it would likely put us on a population escalator with no way of getting off, as well as placing unsustainable demands on infrastructure and services. A balanced and measured approach is vital to population policy, and that is what I will provide.

Sir, I have not lobbied anyone for their vote, nor has anyone on my behalf, I hope. Please understand that is not because I do not want the vote of every Member, it is not because I am ambivalent about this role, because I am anxious to serve in this role. It is just that I dislike the idea of extracting Members' votes under duress. I hope that Members will vote for me, but I hope they will vote for me based on what they hear from the candidates and on their knowledge of the candidate's character, temperament, strengths and weaknesses, and record in politics.  
2915

2920 The first task of whoever is elected will be to return next Wednesday proposing a strong, credible committee of talented Members, balanced in their political views, background and temperament. I know I can propose such a committee. I can then lead the committee in an inclusive collegiate way, encouraging Members to make the most of their skills and experience in a constructive atmosphere.

2925 Sir, I want senior officers to feel they can speak openly and plainly to a President and committee they can trust. Their advice needs to be respected, but it also needs to be challenged. This will happen only if there is mutual respect between the President and the officers. I can assure the States that if I am elected there will be.

All principal committees will need to work closely with the Policy & Resources Committee. As well as being grateful to Deputies Soulsby and Dorey as my proposer and seconder respectively, it is significant that I am supported by all the members of the Policy & Resources Committee, except of course, Deputy Brouard.  
2930

I am acutely conscious that policing is a transferred service between Alderney and Guernsey. My friends in Alderney can be assured that I will be a Bailiwick President of the Committee for Home Affairs and I will work closely with them to provide the support and the services they need as far as our joint resources will allow.  
2935

Which leads me on to Budget challenges. A Budget review, jointly agreed between Policy Resources and Home Affairs, or their successors, will get under way in a few weeks. I can assure

2940 the Assembly that if I am elected, Home Affairs will be a willing and constructive partner in that review, and will look upon it as an opportunity.

States' Members do need some background however. Since 2010, Home has reduced its expenditure by around £2.3 million a year in real terms. Genuine efficiencies account for 98% of these savings, so the Department has protected front line services like policing, customs, the fire brigade and probation.

2945 In the long term, additional efficiencies can be obtained by further integrating the emergency services and law enforcement agencies, and by rationalising property – all sensible things which I am in favour of. But in the short term, it is possible that the review will find limited opportunities to cut spending further without affecting front line services. I can tell the States that, for me, cutting front line services will always be a last resort.

2950 The principal committees each have a purpose. The purpose of the Committee for Home Affairs is to support a high standard of living and quality of life by maintaining and promoting a safe, stable and equitable society, which values public protection and justice, and respects the rights, responsibilities and potential of every person.

2955 I wrote those words: I want to lead a committee which lives up to them. I ask colleagues to give me that opportunity, by allowing me to serve the States and the Island as the President of the Committee for Home Affairs.

**The Bailiff:** We move now to question time, which will be for a maximum of 30 minutes.  
Deputy Lester Queripel.

2960 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** Sir, there have been several reports by Islanders over the past few years of unprofessional behaviour within the Safeguarder Service. As far as I am aware, the service has never been inspected by an independent external body. If you are elected, will you be calling for such an inspection?

2965 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

2970 The Safeguarder Service obviously comes under the Home Department but it is slightly independent of the Home Department; in fact, it operates through the Courts, it is a Court recommendation and a Court process for the protection of the child.

2975 There are lots of various panels that the Home Department operate which are completely independent. There was a review of the Safeguarder Service, and indeed I believe you were part of the committee that looked at that as the Scrutiny Committee and had them before you, and the outcome, we believe, was quite satisfactory, and a good outcome for the Safeguarder Service.

2980 You are always going to get one party, when you have got a child involved, that is going to be upset and not happy with the decision. That is the way it goes, unfortunately, with the Safeguarder, and it is always the child that comes first in the Safeguarder Service, but of course if there are problems and a complaint, most certainly those have to be dealt with and looked at thoroughly and appropriately at the appropriate time.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

2985 Safeguarders have an extraordinarily difficult job. The report which Deputy Lowe has referred to actually highlighted that there is good practice in a lot of areas. If I am elected I would want to support the staff at the Safeguarder Service because, as I say, I think they are doing an extremely difficult job.

2990 But one of the recommendations of the Marshall Review was to carry out an independent inspection, and that process is already under way. Terms of reference for an external inspection

are being put together now. That was already determined by the outgoing Home Department, and I would continue fully to support that if I was elected as President. I think it is essential, given the review that has just taken place into the Safeguarder Service, but I want to stress they are doing an extremely difficult job under trying conditions.

2995

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

3000

**Deputy Ferbrache:** We have had in every democracy, since the days of Montesquieu and beyond, a doctrine of separation of powers, which means sentencing policy is for the Courts. Do both candidates accept that although sentencing options may be enacted by statute, that that doctrine must be fully respected and sentencing provisions and sentencing policies will remain exclusively for the Courts of this Bailiwick?

3005

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Yes, absolutely. I think that the States has not provided sufficient direction in the area of criminal justice policy; and the new mandate of the Committee for Home Affairs expressly includes criminal justice policy and takes it further than the old mandate of the Home Department.

3010

I think the States do need to establish criminal justice policy, but they clearly need to give the Courts a very wide framework in which to operate because, as Deputy Ferbrache says, the separation of powers is critical and it is for the Courts to sentence people it finds guilty; it is not for Government to intervene in that process. I respect the proper separation of powers, but I want Government to be more pro-active, generally speaking, in criminal justice policy.

3015

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

3020

I am a strong believer it has to stay completely separate and that is well documented within the minutes at the Home Department, because I felt uncomfortable a couple of times with discussions that have taken place, because it is not for any political board to try and influence.

I am not saying that they did, but what I am saying is that I am actually uncomfortable if we are trying to say to the Courts that we would welcome community service rather than the Prison. It really has to be for the Court, who are sitting here, and they will make judgement appropriately.

3025

Yes, ideally if somebody can go on community service, fine, but it really must be down to the Courts and there must not be any political interference with that by trying to encourage community service. The decision has to be with them. There is no way politicians ... politicians make the Laws and it is up to the Courts to administer them, and there is nothing in between that should be dealt with.

3030

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Dudley-Owen.

**Deputy Dudley-Owen:** What will be your measure of a sensible balanced growth in regard to population?

3035

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3040

**Deputy Lowe:** Population – I have always maintained that we must try and keep the population as near as possible to our current population. Now, it always fluctuates and it is approximately 200 net per year.

I do not have an open door policy, I have never actually approved of an open door policy. We have to consider the quality of the life for people living here on this Island, but we also have to

have the balance of making sure this Island can thrive with businesses, and to encourage high net worth people here that are not going to necessarily need a lot of staff that will be on the low paid.  
3045 We have got to have the right people coming here for business, and we have got to make it easy for businesses to come and operate here, but I certainly do not support, and never supported, an open door policy.

We have a duty to look after people here and the quality of life, because otherwise if you have not got good quality of life we end up paying through the Health Service and all the other  
3050 ramifications that come along with a high population.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

3055 Well, of course it is a balance. If we try to stop any population growth then it is quite possibly that that will lead to economic contraction, and when we have a work force which is contracting already because the population is ageing, that is going to present us with considerable difficulties.

But I think talking about figures of 70,000 or 75,000, which I hear some people talking about, are crazy – certainly in the very near future. It has taken 30 years for our population to increase by  
3060 a percentage of around about 10%-12%. My view is that that rate of growth should not be accelerated. So I am talking about very measured population growth. I am just very concerned about trying to put some kind of cap on that, because of the effect it could have economically.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

3065 What will the candidates do to beef up community policing – bobbies on the beat, if you like – in our country parishes and in Town?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3070 I think it is important that policing is run by the Chief of Police. I do not think that politicians should be deciding which sort of crimes are responded to more quickly or which beats police officers should be undertaking.

The current policies which are being implemented by the Head of Law Enforcement and his  
3075 team are clearly working. Recorded crime has fallen by about 25% over the last five or six years. That does include greater community policing.

I believe in community policing. I think the prominence of community beat officers helps; it helps the community feel safer and I think there is quite a lot of evidence that suggests that it does cut crime. But I am not, if elected, going to be a President of the Committee for Home  
3080 Affairs who starts trying to direct exactly where the Chief of Police should be deploying his officers.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

3085 Certainly the Head of the Law Enforcement has encouraged anybody around the Island – it does not matter what parish it is – if they have a problem in a particular area to contact them and they will ensure, wherever possible, to get a community policeman out there.

I am also aware that the Police meet with the Douzaines on a regular occasion to get feedback  
3090 and work, and have that working relationship between the Douzaines and indeed the Police. And through that process as well, attending all the Douzaines, they have gained quite a lot of information where there have been potential problems where they have sent out the resources to try and keep an eye on what is going on and give comfort to the community.

3095 Certainly community policing has been extremely popular and successful, so we have seen a reduction in crime and we have seen a reduction in vandalism in certain areas where the community police have actually been down; and they are working with the youngsters, they are making the youngsters feel valued and trying to distract them from being a nuisance and try and join different organisations. So it has been successful.

3100 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc.

**Deputy Le Clerc:** Thank you, sir.

3105 I was disappointed last term at the lack of financial support from the Home Department for the Domestic Abuse Strategy. Can we have your reassurances that you will provide resources to support strategies such as the Domestic Abuse Strategy and the Children & Young People's Plan with the MASH – that is the Multi-Agency Support Hub – to continue this important strand of social policy?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3110

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

Indeed, the Home Department were very keen to try and put more money into the Domestic Abuse Strategy, but when we came to the States we made it very clear we were £600,000 in deficit and we just do not have enough money to actually be able to cover all the strategies.

3115 However, we did transfer the money across to the Domestic Abuse Strategy and we will work on that, but there is quite a considerable sum of money already. It is not a case of they needed that to get it started. They could probably double it for sure and still not have enough money.

3120 A lot of these strategies need a lot of money funding to be able to do a lot more work. There is no doubt about it, the Domestic Abuse Strategy is a good strategy; it is something that has to be welcomed. There is a lot more work taking place on that to try and now get into the community to do more preventative, both with businesses and with organisations, to try and assist where possible to promote this is not acceptable.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3125

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

I have always supported the Domestic Abuse Strategy.

3130 Two States' terms ago, during a States' Strategic Plan debate, I tried to stop the States from spending, or wasting, £200,000, I think it was, on an unnecessary tribunal of inquiry into the Airport Firefighters' dispute, and to redirect the money to fund the Domestic Abuse Strategy.

In the last States' term I worked with other likeminded colleagues to propose an increase in the budget for the Domestic Abuse Strategy in such a way that it did not increase overall States' expenditure.

3135 I am concerned that the outgoing Home Department may have made a decision about funding the Domestic Abuse Strategy which does not comply fully with the States' Resolution that was approved during the Budget debate. If I am elected I want to review that, because we ought to apply as many resources as we can possibly afford to that Strategy, and we certainly ought to comply with States' Resolutions. It is clearly a States' priority; it needs to be funded properly.

3140 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Prow.

**Deputy Prow:** Thank you, sir.

3145 One of the roles of Home Affairs which actually enjoys a very low profile is the actual collection of some £40 million in indirect taxation. Can I ask the candidates what they feel the future role of the Excise Regime will be?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3150 **Deputy Fallaize:** Well, I am not exactly sure what Deputy Prow is seeking to understand from our answers, but clearly it is a successful operation. I think it is probably the second single greatest source of income for the States, and I think the connection between policing and border and customs has been a success, and I would see that continuing to work together more closely.

I think there are further synergies. I mean they are not now two separate organisations, but we have dual warranting of officers, and I think that sort of integration and close connection needs to be taken even further.

3155

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3160 **Deputy Lowe:** Yes, indeed, the separation between the two has been in place for quite some time, but we are seeing more joining together. But the Duty is an interesting one as well because it is a huge amount of money we collect on Duty and yet a couple of times over the last year Duty has been down, and there are sort of frowns around the table because the Duty is down,. Well, actually it might mean the Drug and Alcohol Strategy is working, because people are not drinking as much.

3165 So you cannot have your cake and eat it really. If you are charging Duty and it is going down you should be quite pleased about that. That should be successful, because otherwise we are paying all this money, a huge amount of money into the Drug and Alcohol Strategy, and it has to work, so that is the outcome from that. I have nothing really else to add to that, sir.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut.

3170

**Deputy Brehaut:** Thank you.

I apologise if I have not got the terminology right, but I believe H.M. Inspectorate of Prisons raised concerns regarding female and male prisoners sharing facilities, and also at one stage children being in prison, in the absence of a secure unit. Can we ever get to a stage where these people are in stand-alone facilities?

3175

Thank you.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3180 **Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

Yes, he did, and the previous inspector did as well, and we have certainly carried out a lot of work at the Prison, and the female unit is separate and they have carried out alterations down there and the children area as well.

3185 It is a very difficult one because it is a small prison and if you have got a separate area just for children and it has to be manned on the odd occasion that you might have children in ... and bearing in mind children under 18, so when it talks about children in reports people sometimes think about a 10 or 12 year old. That is not the case; you are talking about 14, 15, 16-year-olds. They are still young, but they are separated and they have carried out work and alterations, and I believe there are still some alterations to do; but they have been in contact with the inspectors as well and promoted that when they had the report back, so the inspectors are fully aware of what has been carried out at the Prison, and the bit of work left to do to protect and separate within the working prison.

3190

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3195

**Deputy Fallaize:** I think every time our Prison is inspected the Inspectorate is bound to raise concerns about women, and indeed children, being in the same facility as men.

3200 If we were in the UK, or if resources allowed, we would clearly have separate facilities. That would be the ideal outcome. Unfortunately, resources do not allow. We can certainly accommodate women in the Prison and, as Deputy Lowe has said, a lot of work has gone in and is still going in to ensuring that the accommodation is appropriate and is fully separated, which has to continue and be supported.

3205 I am, like Deputy Brehaut, rather uncomfortable with the thought of children – particularly when you consider the ages of some of these children – in Prison, but maintaining a separate facility, as I think they do in Jersey, is hideously expensive and the Home Department has therefore gone to considerable efforts to ensure that in the unfortunate circumstance that children are in prison they are catered for appropriately.

3210 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** [*Inaudible*] ... but I wanted to know what the two candidates' attitude and policies will be towards supporting the Guernsey Lottery, which has moved to your mandate?

3215 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** My attitude would be to support the Guernsey Lottery.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3220 **Deputy Lowe:** Yes, I have always supported the Guernsey Lottery. I was Vice-Chairman of the Gambling Committee for many years and the great news about the Guernsey Lottery, especially the Christmas Lottery, is so many charities benefit – and we are probably talking now millions since the lottery started and I think the latest tranche of payments was publicised yesterday. So, yes, I do support the Lottery.

3225 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

3230 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** Jersey have introduced several operations in the last few years to mitigate against the exploitation of vulnerable children. One such operation is Operation Phoenix. Guernsey does not have such operations in place. If you are elected will you seek to introduce similar operations as Jersey?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3235 **Deputy Lowe:** I am not sure what they have got in Jersey. You have mentioned the title, but it does not mean an awful lot to me. I am unaware of what you are actually talking about. Is it a safe unit that you are talking about that they have in Jersey for children? In which case, we do have one, we have still got one, I believe, at Greenfields, but I do not fully understand the question, because I do not understand the name of the company or the organisation that you are talking about. So I apologise, sir, because I cannot answer that any more.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

3245 I am afraid I do not know what Operation Phoenix is in Jersey. What I do know is that the Department has worked very closely with other Departments, particularly Health & Social Services, to put in place much improved services for children who are vulnerable. There is now something called a hub. Everything seems to be called a hub these days, but this hub is to ensure that there is proper co-ordinated work between departments dealing with children who are vulnerable. That

3250 has consumed considerable resources within Guernsey Police. I am very supportive of that, but it does put great pressure on the committee's budget.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

3255 **Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

Given the increasing concerns by many over safety, particularly amongst the elderly, do the candidates consider the protection of life, property and livelihoods the top priority of Government?

3260 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** I think that we have an obligation in Government not to sort of talk ourselves down all the time. Actually, as I already said, crime is falling. That is not unique to the Bailiwick, but it is happening by about 25% over the last five or six years. That is clearly heading in the right direction and it needs to be taken still further.

3265 I read out the purpose of the Committee for Home Affairs previously. Clearly central to that is safety and security, and that will always, or should always, be at the top of the list of priorities for the Committee for Home Affairs. Protecting and defending the public and the jurisdiction is the first duty of any Government. That is certainly how I would see it if I was leading this committee.

3270 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

Yes, I covered that in my opening speech.

3275 That is has to be paramount. Security in Guernsey has to be a real priority for all different guises, and certainly regarding safety and safety in the home. You can get advice as well. You can contact the Police and they will come around to your home and they will help you; whether you are young or old, it does not really matter, they will come round and assist you and advise you what sort of locks to do and all different types of things – safety, security in the home.

3280 So, as I say, the safety aspect and the guise of the safety aspect that is under the Home Department is very wide, but certainly if you are talking about people in the community, then if they have any fears or any worries they will come along and have a look and they will advise you. And I recommend anybody to take that up, because they are more than happy to do that because if they can put the resources in to try and encourage you to put in safety equipment, it will be perhaps one less burglary that they will have to deal with.

3285 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Trott:** Sir, what are the candidates' views on the de-criminalisation of cannabinoids?

3290 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Not to be welcomed, Deputy Trott, I have to say. It goes against the Drug and Alcohol Strategy as well and, as I said previously, we have put a huge amount of money into that and that appears to be working very well, but I would not go down the route of de-criminalising cannabis.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you.

3300 I oppose the de-criminalisation of cannabis. I always have. I think not least of all because of the message that it would send out. I think that perhaps where in medical cases, where medical practitioners are advising that it ought to be used, then perhaps there is some room in that area to treat it in the same way that we treat other forms of regulated medication.

3305 But, generally speaking, for general use in society I am against the de-criminalisation of cannabis. In fact, I am afraid I am well to the right of many of my closest political colleagues on this issue, because I am against the liberalisation of drugs laws generally.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

3310 **Deputy Gollop:** How far do the candidates think we could move forward the agenda of integrating the emergency services and the uniformed services to produce synergy and, theoretically, financial savings?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3315

**Deputy Fallaize:** I think this is really high up the agenda, and needs to be, of the Committee for Home Affairs. One obvious area is property, where it would be possible to take property rationalisation further.

3320 But I said, when I spoke, I am in favour of further integration of law enforcement agencies and the emergency services. I am not suggesting that they all ought to become one organisation, because they separate roles and they have separate characters which need to be protected. But I am talking about more than just working together; I am talking in a very practical sense about embedding emergency services and law enforcement agencies, one with the other, sharing property, sharing resources. That has started, that work is under way, but I think it needs to be accelerated.

3325

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

3330 Yes, indeed, and of course we have the Joint Emergency Services Control Centre where we now answer all the calls at one place rather than a separate operation, whether it be the Police, whether it be ambulance station or fire station. It is all answered now at the Joint Emergency Services Centre. That has caused a few teething problems to start with. I believe it is settling down. That is one way of emergency services working together.

3335 As you know, the States actually approved, as well, the St John Ambulance & Rescue Service moving the emergency services across to the Fire Station, and indeed working with Home Department. They are in the initial stages of trying to work out an agreeable contract with the working bodies concerned, bearing in mind one is a charity, but they are trying to all come to the same conclusion to make everything more efficient and cost effective to our community.

3340

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

3345 Many Guernsey residents would like access to the National Lottery. What will the candidates do to ensure access for Islanders to the Lottery this term?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

3350 **Deputy Lowe:** Many years ago Camelot were happy to come to Guernsey; in fact they came here, they had a look at the properties that they wanted to put the machines in, and I showed them around and met with them, as Vice-Chairman of the Gambling Committee.

3355 But, unfortunately, it is the UK that stopped it, and so they were unable to do so because of what was happening over there. There needs huge change to the legislation in the UK which they were not prepared to take, bearing in mind that they could actually lose some money, because an awful lot of people in Guernsey get their Lottery tickets either when they are away or they get friends to get them, and they were not able to do that.

3360 So I am not going to say that I think this will happen, because there are committees that have tried since I left the Gambling Committee, and they felt at one time it was going to happen and they came across the same blockers. There are difficulties because it is just more than one issue for them to have to take that type of report to get it changed, and they would lose quite a considerable sum of money so they tell us, but we have no real idea how much money goes out of the Island.

3365 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

3370 **Deputy Fallaize:** Well, actually, I quite like our local lottery. I think it allows us to keep the income that is generated on-Island, and it gives us control locally on how the money is spent. So I am afraid that if I was elected, even if the practical problems that Deputy Lowe has referred to could be overcome, I think I would be very dubious about inviting the National Lottery in, if it meant – which I think it probably would mean – the demise of our own local lottery.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc.

3375 **Deputy Le Clerc:** Thank you, sir.

I found it valuable on SSD board, and HSSD board, to have non-States' members. Can the candidates advise, if elected, if they would or would not support non-States' members on the committee?

3380 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** I entered the States with perhaps not terribly positive views about non-States' members, but I have had my views changed over eight years.

3385 I would, of course, have a committee, and I am a democrat and if the committee did not want non-States' members then we would not have non-States' members. But I would certainly be suggesting to the committee that we recruit at least one, possibly two, non-States' members.

3390 I do not think that they should have a vote; I think we are now in the right position where they are appointed by the committee and removed by the committee. I do not think the committees need to bother this Assembly with that sort of business. But, to act in an advisory role, in a supporting role, yes.

I do not think politicians have a monopoly on wisdom. Certainly, politicians do not have a monopoly on wisdom and non-States' members can bring a great deal to the party, and I would like to invite non-States' members on to a committee I lead.

3395 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

I have never voted for non-States' members in all my time in the States, because you are elected as the members of the political board to make those decisions.

3400 During my 10 years on Social Security we brought in many experts for their expertise to assist us. They never even charged us, and these are people that are coming in to help us, advise about

the funds, and some quite technical matters. They came in as and when necessary, rather than being paid whatever the sum was. Currently the new one I think is around £2,000 per annum, because the non-States' members that you appoint, you appoint somebody for their expertise in a particular area; it is not for the full agenda that they will be sitting round the board room table for.

3405

That is what you are there for you and have been elected for.  
So I mean if I was appointed as the President of the Home Affairs and the rest of the committee wanted it I would not object and I would welcome whoever they appointed. I will always work with whoever I need to work with.

3410

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Last question. Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** I got the impression in the past that the Probation Service needed more trained staff because they were perhaps under resourced. If that is the case, would you ensure the probation team have the right resources to do their excellent job?

3415

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

**Deputy Lowe:** Thank you.

We meet with the Probation Service on a regular basis. They attend the business meetings that we have at the Home Department, and indeed we go and visit them as well.

3420

They have been training the local people as well, which is very good, and graduates, so they are like all sections of Home Department and any Committee that you have got in here – you could always have more resources.

They have to work with the Courts and sometimes it might mean the Courts have to wait a little bit longer for a report, but then they might go through a more slack period, in which case they are just ticking along, but I am not going to turn round and say I will promise the Probation Service more resources, because I do know that they are also reviewing how they operate.

3425

So it would be wrong and improper to misguide you, because we will wait and see how they get on once they have reviewed their current process.

3430

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** My approach would be, if I was elected, very promptly I would want to meet the service chiefs and gain the fullest understanding possible of their challenges. But the key here, I think, is communication and trust. There needs to be constant communication between the service chiefs and the committee, and there needs to be trust and respect both ways from the President and the members of the committee to the service chiefs and from the service chiefs to the President and members of the committee.

3435

I have been a member of a committee where there was not good communication, in some respects, from senior officers to members and it causes no end of problems. So I think the relationship between the President and the members of a committee and the senior officers is absolutely vital, and I know that I can maintain good relations and operate in an environment of trust and respect with those service chiefs.

3440

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Well, Members of the States, that concludes the period allowed for questioning the candidates. You now go to the vote for who you want to be as the President of the Committee for Home Affairs. That is a choice between Deputy Lowe who was proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Brouard, and Deputy Fallaize who was proposed by Deputy Soulsby and seconded by Deputy Dorey.

3445

Members of the States, whilst the votes are being counted, I propose to rise. As the Presiding Officer indicated this morning, if you are not back within the Chamber when the next events happen then it is your lookout, I am afraid. So we will be coming back in in four or five minutes.

3450

*The Assembly adjourned at 3.12 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 3.18 p.m.*

**Committee for Home Affairs –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Lowe elected**

3455 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for the office of President of the Committee for Home Affairs is as follows: Deputy Lowe, 20 votes; Deputy Fallaize, 18 votes. There were no blank papers and no spoilt papers. I therefore declare Deputy Lowe duly elected. (Applause)

**VII. Scrutiny Management Committee –  
Election of President –  
Debate commenced**

*Article VII*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Scrutiny Management Committee to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article VII, Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of President.

3460 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Are there any nominations for the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee? Yes. Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Trott:** Sir, I would like to propose Deputy Lester Queripel.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Is that nomination seconded?

3465 **Deputy Le Clerc:** Yes, sir, sorry.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc, thank you.  
Are there any other candidates being nominated? Deputy Jones.

3470 **Deputy Jones:** Yes, sir. I would like to propose the name of Deputy Laurie Queripel, thank you.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Is that nomination seconded?

3475 **Deputy Ferbrache:** I will second that.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Ferbrache.  
Deputy Roffey.

3480 **Deputy Roffey:** Yes, sir. I would like to propose the name of Deputy Chris Green, please.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Is that seconded?

**Deputy Fallaize:** Yes, I will second Deputy Green.

3485 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Thank you very much Deputy Fallaize.

We have three candidates so far. Are there any more?

Can I therefore invite those three candidates to come up to the bench, in what has become the accustomed fashion, in alphabetical order coming from the window? So Deputy Green, Deputy Laurie Queripel and then Deputy Lester Queripel.

3490 I invite Deputy Trott, the proposer of Deputy Lester Queripel, to address the States.

**Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir.

3495 Sir, some people may be quite surprised to see me nominating Deputy Lester Queripel, but he is undoubtedly one of the most tenacious and determined Members of the States that I have had the pleasure of serving with.

3500 Sir, he is currently a member of the Scrutiny Committee, but he stood in six unsuccessful elections before he managed to secure a seat. He is currently a member of the Town Seafront Working Group, but it was he that went to the Chief Minister's door, knocked on it, metaphorically speaking, and said, 'Please give me a seat on it. I have got lots to offer.' He is currently Chairman of Age Concern in Guernsey and currently Chairman of the Age Concern Guernsey Fuel Fund Committee. He recently completed a four-year term on the St Peter Port Douzaine.

3505 Now, sir, from the early part of the last Assembly it was obvious to all of us who were here that Deputy Queripel had spent hours in detailed consideration of policy reports. Constantly making notes, he would often ask questions that no other Member of the Assembly had thought to address, sir; sometimes with interesting results from those being questioned.

3510 He served as a member of the Scrutiny Committee for the past three and half years, and I do not think anyone who has worked with him would deny that Scrutiny is the be all and end all of his political life. He stood in the recent Election on a platform of scrutiny, pledging to his electors, that he would stand for the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee if successful in the General Election.

Sir, he has a number of detailed views driven by a genuine desire to ensure that the services, functions and policies of all States' departments and committees are operating as efficiently and as effectively as possible.

3515 Now, sir, I am going to make a prediction: my guess is that he will surprise many of the people in this room during the Q&A session that follows. He certainly surprised many of us the last time he stood to be Scrutiny Chair. So Deputy Lester Queripel has the role of Scrutiny running through his veins; it courses through his veins. It is the first thing he thinks of in the morning, it is the last thing he thinks of at night, he is a natural scrutineer.

Thank you, sir.

3520

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Thank you, Deputy Trott.  
Deputy Lester Queripel.

3525 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** Sir, I would like to start by thanking Deputy Trott for his support and his excellent speech, both of which are very much appreciated. Also Deputy Le Clerc for her support, because it means a lot to me, sir, that two much-respected politicians consider me to be worthy of the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

3530 So why do I want to be President? Well, sir, the people of Guernsey are crying out for honesty, transparency and accountability, and the Scrutiny Management Committee, the SMC, are the committee who can make all three of those happen right across the States. In fact, I would go as far as to say the SMC have now got the mandate, and potential, to become the most effective, the

most influential and the most powerful committee of all States' committees – even more powerful than the Policy & Resources Committee.

3535 I say that, sir, because some of my colleagues seem to think that P&R will have the ultimate power, but the reality is it will not. They must not be allowed to sit on a cloud floating above the rest of us, harbouring the view that they are untouchable. Even they will need to be scrutinised on an annual basis by the SMC if we are to actually attain transparency and accountability and not just pay lip service to the words.

3540 Gone are the days of Scrutiny just being a critical friend. The role of Scrutiny now has to be that of a detective, identifying inefficiencies within departments and addressing those inefficiencies and, as we all know, the mandate of the previous Scrutiny Committee was incredibly restricted. There were doors that the committee were not even allowed to knock on, let alone open. But the new mandate has a clause in it that reads as follows:

'To promote and facilitate the participation in scrutiny of the widest possible range of States' members and persons independent of the States.'

3545 So now there is no reason why SMC cannot knock on any door it wants to in a quest to attain the levels of transparency and accountability that the people of Guernsey deserve when, in the past, Scrutiny in the States has been re-active, reacting to issues after they have taken place, but it is absolutely vital that the next Scrutiny Committee are a lot more pro-active and a lot more dynamic. The next committee have a lot of work to do, and it is absolutely vital that they hit the ground running, and in order for them to be able to do that, the right person will need to be at the helm.

3550 So the question is why do I think I am the right person for the job, sir? I do not expect you to answer that; I am going to answer it myself, sir! (*Laughter*) Some of the members of the public are looking for heads on sticks when mistakes are made within the States. Speaking personally, I do not resonate with that approach, but I certainly resonated with the late Mr Paul Arditti's approach to scrutiny. When he was Chairman of the Committee ... Ironically, Mr Arditti did not actually want me as a member of his committee when a vacancy arose; he wanted my brother, Deputy Laurie Queripel. Well, he got me, sir, and he soon learnt to love me! Especially when I told him I resonated completely with his approach to scrutiny, and, sir, just to remind my colleagues of Mr Arditti's approach, I have here a press article from the October 2012 *Guernsey Press* which relays his approach perfectly. The article is headed 'Accountability of a type unseen in Guernsey Politics', and in the article Mr Arditti says the following:

'If there is evidence in a who, what, when and why type of enquiry, then I am going to name and shame. That is the catharsis the naming and shaming. They will decide whether they are going to try and cover anything up or square up to it.'

3565 Now, of course, sir, suffice to say if politicians and civil servants do their jobs properly they will have nothing at all to worry about. But the way I see it, is that the ultimate deterrent is embarrassment, which is the very reason why I resonated with Mr Arditti's approach to scrutiny in the first place. But, anyway, the ultimate intention is not to name and shame any of our civil servants or politicians; the ultimate intention, surely, is for Scrutiny to operate in a manner that effects a change of culture across the whole of the public and political spectrum, because nobody wants to be embarrassed, especially if family members and friends are drawn into that cycle of embarrassment.

3570 What leadership qualities do I have? Well, I was a manager of one of the largest record shops in London in the 1970's. I started as a counter assistant and I was promoted to manager in just over a year. Upon returning to Guernsey in the early 1980's, I set up my own decorating business, which I ran for almost 30 years, employing staff as and when needed. In the 1990's I trained and qualified as a reflexologist and set up my own practice, which I ran in tandem with the decorating business. For the last eight years I have been a facilitator of the Guernsey Poetry Group, organising all of their events.

For the last three years I have been Chairman of Age Concern, steering them through a time of transition, due to the fact that we very much wanted to raise the profile of the charity. It was me who set up the Age Concern Fuel Fund for pensioners who struggle to pay their fuel bills. As  
3580 Deputy Trott has already said, sir, I am also Chairman of the Age Concern Fuel Fund Committee.

Sir, I have been told that I am a people person, because I always listen to what people say and I value their efforts and their input. So, sir, if ever a person was made for the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee that person surely is me. I have lived and breathed scrutiny for the last three and half years, and I very much want to carry on living and breathing scrutiny.

3585 I have an excellent working relationship with all the staff in the Scrutiny office. I know how Scrutiny works and how it needs to work in the future to be effective. I have been a panel member on three major reviews undertaken by the committee in the last three years. I have a whole list of reviews that I think the next committee needs to pursue. In fact, I have already started working on those because I am driven by a genuine desire to attain transparency and accountability on behalf  
3590 of the people of Guernsey.

Actually, my interest in scrutiny first came about in 2009, when I submitted a thesis on vandalism to the then Scrutiny Committee, which was chaired at that time by Deputy Brehaut. It was the first major review the committee had undertaken and it resulted in an excellent report being published, which I have here, if any of my colleagues would like to see it, sir.

3595 So I am a natural scrutineer, I am tenacious and I am determined. I have probably submitted more Rule 5 and Rule 6 questions, and also asked more questions during States' debates, than other Deputy in the previous Assembly. The reason I did that, of course, is because asking questions is the only way in which a Deputy can hold departments to account

And to finish on the issue of questions, sir, I suspect it will be the responses to questions that  
3600 our colleagues will recall when they come to vote, and not what the candidates have actually said in their speeches. I would just like to remind colleagues that the scrutiny process does not actually work like that; Scrutiny do not respond to questions, they ask questions. I would ask colleagues to please pay more attention to what candidates have said in their speeches rather than the answers they give in response to questions.

3605 Thank you, sir.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Jones, the proposer of Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Jones:** Thank you, Mr Deputy Bailiff, Members of the States.

3610 I wish to put forward the name of Deputy Laurie Queripel for the position of President of the Scrutiny & Management Committee.

When he first asked me to propose him for this position, I did not hesitate for a moment, because I believe he would be an exact fit for this challenging job. I have known Deputy Queripel for many years and observed him more closely in the last few years as a Member of this States. He  
3615 is a man who is not easily fazed or afraid to tackle any subject and he has that other very attractive quality I admire in people, which is he says it like it is.

I know I have only got a few minutes to tell you why I think he would be ideal for this important job.

3620 First of all, a more diligent well-researched Deputy you would be hard to find, with possibly the exception of Deputy Dorey. He is perseverant and is not afraid to hold the system to account, or ask the right, and sometimes awkward, questions that others would prefer were not asked.

More importantly, he is not a man who is interested in witch hunts. That is not what Scrutiny is about for Deputy Queripel. However, we do want a Scrutiny Committee with teeth that is led by someone who is not afraid to bare them when it is needed. He has a very good eye for detail, plus  
3625 very astute instincts, and he also possesses a strong sense of social justice and fair play. He is a person of principle and, above all, is extremely diligent and hard working.

Deputy Queripel is also prepared to fight for the proper resources to do this job effectively. It has been the poor relation of funding and allocation of staff resources for far too many years, and

3630 his overriding political motivation has always been to see that the Island of Guernsey is well governed and its people are well served by its Government. Yes, process is important, and we have become bogged down in the past by some who are obsessed with process; and Deputy Queripel, while recognising that process is necessary, believes that getting results is much more important than that. He has no ambitions beyond that and does not seek this office for reasons of status, but because he and I both believe that he can best and most effectively serve the States, and our community from the important position of President of the Scrutiny Committee.

3635 His heart lies in the scrutiny process, not just for the procedure itself, but for what can be achieved by real and effective scrutiny, and for the ongoing and lasting benefits it can bring to the Island in the way that we deliver services and administration to our people.

3640 He is above all an open minded individual who always tries to take a balanced approach, a Deputy who is always prepared to weigh up all the evidence and options, preferring to work with people rather than against them. However, if he believes a line of enquiry or a course of action is appropriate and justified then he will pursue it and not be distracted, discouraged or diverted from the task in hand by those who may have other motives for wanting that enquiry to cease.

3645 So, to sum up, his eminent suitability for this role ... Deputy Queripel is honest, thorough, unafraid and, above all, he believes in transparency and in open Government which is accountable to its people. He has been re-elected on those qualities in the Vale, and we need to give him a job that utilises all of his abilities in this new States.

3650 So it is because of these attributes, and many more I have not mentioned, I feel absolutely confident that Deputy Laurie Queripel is exactly the right person to be President of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

Thank you.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Thank you.

Deputy Laurie Queripel.

3655

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

I would like to start by thanking my proposer, Deputy Jones, and my seconder, Deputy Ferbrache.

3660 In my view, sir, we have three very worthy and suitable candidates for the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee. I am hoping that the speech made by Deputy Jones and my following remarks will convince my colleagues, or the majority of my colleagues, to give me their vote.

3665 To start with, some background information. In the last States I was a member of the Scrutiny Committee from April 2013 until the end of that term and I was also a member of the Legislation Select Committee throughout the four years of the last term. So I already have that experience and knowledge under my belt, as it were. I have been a member of the Vale Douzaine since 2009 and I served as a parish Constable in 2011 and 2012.

3670 What I am about to say may sound like a contradiction in terms but hopefully it will not when I put it into context, so here goes. I consider myself to be pragmatic, but I am not a good compromiser. Now here is the context. When it comes to Government policies, when it comes to public services, when it comes to value for States' expenditure, I will not settle for second best. By definition, 'second best' means we can do better.

3675 As Deputies, we have been elected to govern and serve. One of our primary duties is to ensure that existing policies and any new or proposed policies are evidenced to be necessary or add value, and will provide value for money. We have a duty to ensure that services are appropriate, and are delivered efficiently and effectively in a way that meets the needs of those Islanders who need to access them. In other words, all Deputies have a duty to hold the system to account.

3680 But what, especially, can make those aims reality is an effective, meaningful and purposeful scrutiny process, and by putting the right people in place to manage and carry out that function, Scrutiny and the 21st century, where greater levels of accountability, transparency and openness

are demanded, must be dynamic, must be responsive and even pro-active, must be far-reaching and penetrating.

3685 It is time for Scrutiny to up its game, to come of age in order to make a genuine and significant contribution and difference. Not just in a retrospective sense via a lessons learned  
3690 approach, but by the application of timely and real time scrutiny. We need Scrutiny to be agile, to act quickly, not just as an interpreter of history, but to play a role in respect of present and future policy development, to provide input when the possibility of misguided actions appear on the horizon. That is a way or at least another way that scrutiny could add value to the business of Government. This can happen in part by subjecting policies, functions, services and expenditure  
3695 across the States to periodic analysis and by principal committees being subject to regular audits to assess their policy and financial performance. With the right mandate, resources, management and personnel – and that includes accessing skills from within and from outside the States to populate *ad hoc* panels – all this is possible.

3695 As Deputy Jones said, it is not about conducting a witch hunt, it is about establishing good relationships between the Scrutiny Management Committee and the other States' committees. It is about effective co-operation, two-way communication and exchanges of information.

As in all things, balance is the key. I am a passionate and motivated person, especially when it comes to scrutiny and the purpose of scrutiny. I also understand the need to adopt a measured and considered approach.

3700 Now, at this point Members may be thinking, 'That is all well and good. You have shared with us your experience with scrutiny, your vision and your passion for scrutiny, but this is also a management role. What about your management skills? What about your people skills?' Well, for over 25 years prior to being elected to the States in 2012, I was self-employed and for the vast majority of that time, in conjunction with my brother, Deputy Lester Queripel, I ran a small  
3705 business within the local construction industry. We were hands on, we did most of the work ourselves, but on bigger contracts, on bigger projects – and there were quite a few of them – we worked with partners and, at times, sub-contracted other tradesmen.

3710 Sir, I know all about working to time schedules and budgets. I know about productivity and efficiency. I know about taking responsibility, organising, supervising, delegating, communicating and working with others. I am able to be part of a team, work with a team, but also direct and oversee that team. I have the ability to identify problems and provide possible solutions, but I can also take advice; I am a good listener. In addition to that, for several years I was a member of the Youth Development Committee – the body that, in effect, organised and administered youth football across the Island.

3715 So, sir, through you, I say to my colleagues, those are my credentials, that is my vision. I hope I have made my passion for scrutiny clear. My motivation is simple and pure and should be easy to understand. I want to help ensure that this Island is well governed and the people of Guernsey well and best served. That is the ultimate purpose of the scrutiny function.

3720 If elected to this role, I expect it to be exciting, challenging and demanding, but most of all I expect the work of Scrutiny to be effective and to make a direct for the better. This Island and the people of Guernsey deserve no less. I believe I can best pursue these objectives as the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee, and for those reasons I ask my colleagues to support my nomination.

3725 Thank you, sir.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey, who proposed Deputy Green.

**Deputy Roffey:** Thank you, Mr Deputy Bailiff.

3730 I am delighted to propose Deputy Chris Green for the presidency of the Scrutiny Management Committee because I think it is a post for which he is practically, supremely qualified. Do not forget that this new committee will bring together the functions of three previous committees: the old Scrutiny Committee, Public Accounts Committee and the Legislation Select Committee.

3735 So, to me, the ideal mix of talents that we want on this very small team – just three people – will be somebody that is expert at scrutinising political strategy and policy, somebody that is an expert in scrutinising financial information, and somebody who is an expert in scrutinising legislative affairs.

3740 Of those three talents that we want to bring together, by far the hardest to find was always going to be the legal aspect. Sir, we are indeed fortunate that a well-respected advocate is wanting to actually put his name forward to chair this committee, and even more fortunate that it happens to be an advocate who also sat on the old Scrutiny Committee, therefore providing a degree of continuity.

3745 Frankly, Members, we should not be looking this gift horse in the mouth, but I am going to look inside Deputy Green's mouth – metaphorically anyway – to see what else he can bring to this role. Critically, he is a clever person. Now, that might seem like a trite thing to say, but why is it important? Well, over last week, and so far today, we have already elected some fairly bright cookies to sit on Policy & Resources Committee and to be President of the principal committees. It is essential that Scrutiny has an equality of arms with the people who are actually setting the policy in the first place. If our leading policy makers can run intellectual rings round our leading scrutineers the scrutiny function may as well just pack up and go home. We know that will not happen under Deputy Green.

3750 Secondly, I think he has got the right character. We have heard, yes, of course, the President of Scrutiny needs to be dogged and determined and worry away at a bone, and not be given the brush off by anybody – absolutely right, but I also think they need to be fairly calm and balanced. I do not think scrutiny is about show boating. I do not think it is about scoring points for the sake of it. I do not think it is about needless aggression. I think it is about making Government better by probing and getting under the skin of policy. That is what he would do relentlessly and calmly.

3755 Thirdly, I think we need to remember this new committee actually will not be doing all of the scrutinising themselves. That is not their job; they may do some, but we are not looking for scrutineers today. That Committee will be able to pick panels of Deputies and members of the public to carry out the hands on scrutiny, but what they will be doing is setting the scrutiny agenda.

3760 So how do we make sure that they pick a good agenda? Surely it is by having somebody at the top of that organisation that has got no real axe to grind, no obsession with one particular part of the political process, but a broad interest in the whole activity of this Assembly. Deputy Green fits that bill to a T.

3765 Finally, I will come back to the fact that he is an advocate – sorry to be obsessive about that, but what is the art of good scrutiny? It is asking the right questions when taking evidence. Now, Deputy Green's whole professional career has been about identifying and asking the right questions.

3770 Just to sum up, I think we need a generalist, I think we need somebody with the right character, I think we need a clever person, and ideally we need an advocate. Mr Deputy Bailiff, I give you Deputy Green. I think Members would be bonkers not to vote for him.

3775 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

**Deputy Green:** Mr Deputy Bailiff, Members of the States.

Firstly, I should thank my proposer, Deputy Roffey, for that speech, and my seconder, Deputy Fallaize, for proposing me for this role.

3780 Good scrutiny can very clearly have a number of very positive impacts on Government in Guernsey. It can help to give the States new evidence that improves the evidence base for decision making. It can assist the States in its analysis of the evidence base by providing new or different analysis. It can help to facilitate greater openness in the States by obliging Presidents of committees, and others, to explain and to justify what they have done more precisely. It can help to identify lessons about past mistakes, or indeed successes, by reviewing States' expenditure and

3785 policy, and it can help prompt higher standards – *much* higher standards – or better process within the States itself.

Our new system of enhanced committee government with a Scrutiny Management Committee: the Scrutiny Management Committee will have the responsibility to lead and to co-ordinate that scrutiny process with wise judgement and with as much skill as possible. The new Scrutiny Management infrastructure provides, in my opinion, a very good opportunity for the States to recalibrate the role of effective scrutiny in our enhanced system of government. I believe that the committee or consensus system of government is effectively in the last chance saloon, and we all hope that the enhanced system that we will be operating within will be a big improvement on the previous Machinery of Government.

3795 Within the new governmental structure, the new Scrutiny Management Committee has an important role in helping to make the States be as good as it can be through the reviewing and examining of policy, of services, of legislation and of the use of public monies and other resources.

Now, it is trite to say, Mr Deputy Bailiff, expectations on Government in Guernsey have never been greater. Similarly, the public expectations on scrutiny of committees of the States has never been higher. We must face those facts head on.

Clearly, the new Scrutiny Management Committee will be charged with the responsibility of choosing the areas of interest or concern to be scrutinised, rather than actually doing all of the scrutinising themselves, as Deputy Roffey said a moment ago. But, of course, the new committee will be able to draw upon panels of Deputies and non-States' members to do the so-called task and finish panels, unless the committee wishes to use its power to carry out a review itself.

The real judgement, Mr Deputy Bailiff, will be for the Management Committee to exercise its choices wisely, not to tilt at windmills or to pursue personal agendas or grievances. I believe I am a balanced individual who is not prone to vendettas or aggressive outbursts, and that the choices made in terms of what to scrutinise can be done with skill and with judgement.

I would also suggest, Mr Deputy Bailiff, that the other key ingredient for the new Management Committee will be the need for the scrutiny function to have a real sense of pace and urgency, if the circumstances so require it. So that, as Deputy Laurie Queripel said a moment ago, real time scrutiny can take place if issues develop, so you can adopt a much more pro-active approach rather than a purely *post hoc* or after the event approach which is really quite unsatisfactory in some ways.

Certainly, Mr Deputy Bailiff, I have some ideas about what areas of policy should be looked at as a priority by the new Committee, but I think that it would be wise for the new Committee, ideally, to brainstorm its ideas collectively, and as a team, first before deciding on its forward work programme. I would certainly look to create a mixed and balanced team on the Scrutiny Management Committee, a team that would bring together legal, financial and policy analysis skills in a cohesive group. But then I would be very keen indeed to work with a wide range of States' Members who may wish to come on to the task and finish groups.

Frankly, in the new system that we have got, if we do not have Members of the States who are prepared to put themselves forward for the task and finish groups, the theory and the intention behind the new Scrutiny is not necessarily going to work as well as it could do.

So we have the opportunity in this term to take advantage of that wider pool of talent from within the States, and using the expertise and experience as required. I think that is a great strength of the new set-up and, of course, we can hardly forget that the Scrutiny Management Committee will be, like any other States' committee, a creature of this Assembly. It will be the Assembly and Committee, working for and on behalf of the Assembly; and therefore the Scrutiny Management Committee, like all other committees of the States, will have to earn the respect of the Assembly over time.

I am particularly enthused by two particular aspects of the new mandate. Firstly, I would strongly support the wise use of public hearings for scrutiny, work streams in order to contribute positively to the Guernsey public's perception of scrutiny; and, secondly, I would be very keen

indeed to represent the work of scrutiny in the States in this Chamber, and indeed to publicly promote and champion the real value of scrutiny in our community.

3840 For too long, scrutiny in the wider sense of the word has been an 'also ran' in Government in Guernsey. We need to start to change that perspective and we need to start to change that reality. I am also very much encouraged by the introduction of Rule 3(19) of the new Rules of Procedure that confers a new right on the Scrutiny Management Committee to submit letters of comment on items submitted for consideration by the States, something that may well help to boost the profile of the new committee going forward.

3845 Perhaps I can say, Mr Deputy Bailiff, a few words about expectations, because notwithstanding the opportunity that the new system throws up, I think we ought to recognise from the outset, that the new committee, like other new committees in our system of government, will need some time to prove itself, and it is also inevitable that the new scrutiny mechanism will not be able to universally satisfy everybody in this Assembly, or indeed everybody in this community. Even with  
3850 the new powers and resources, it is unrealistic to promise some kind of scrutiny nirvana where the frailties and weaknesses of Government in this Island are erased from public view.

So, Mr Deputy Bailiff, Members, why would I be any good as President of the Scrutiny Management Committee? As Deputy Roffey said, I do bring certain legal skills that would be, of course, useful in the team that will manage the scrutiny in the States. I emphasise again it will be a  
3855 team; it is not about any one person. It will be the team, which will be behind the Management of Scrutiny in the States.

I do believe in testing evidence in any given scenario. I do believe that I can distinguish between the relevant and the irrelevant material when looking at policy or financial matters, or anything else. I do believe that asking the right questions in the right way is a precious skill that  
3860 takes some time – considerable time perhaps – to perfect. I am fortunate in having 14 years of professional legal experience at the Guernsey Bar already under my belt in that regard.

Am I the sort of politician who will shout and scream at the members of the Policy & Resources Committee in a public meeting? No. Histrionics have no place in my vision of effective  
3865 scrutiny. But am I the sort of person who can ask questions in such a way as to maximise the information required? Well, yes, I think I am that person. I believe in asking the right question, I believe in probing those in power and in authority, and I believe in listening carefully to the answers that you get from witnesses and, importantly, seeing what information you do not get.

Just a few words about my background and my political experience. I graduated from the University of Exeter with a degree in law in 1999. I was called to the English Bar in the year 2000  
3870 before being admitted as an advocate in Guernsey in 2002. Since then I have practiced mainly in litigation, principally criminal defence and private client litigation.

In terms of politics, since being first elected to this Assembly in 2012 for Castel, I have gained some very valuable experience over the last four years on four committees, that will inevitably assist me, if I am fortunate enough to be elected as President of the Scrutiny Management  
3875 Committee.

I believe that I have very much served my apprenticeship in the States over the last four years. I have served on Education, I have served on Social Security, I have served on the Parochial Ecclesiastical Rates Review Committee – if you remember that one – and perhaps most significantly for this speech, I have been on the Scrutiny Committee for the last two years or so,  
3880 and indeed, along with my colleagues Deputies Queripel, I was also on the Children's Law Implementation Review.

Mr Deputy Bailiff, in conclusion and in a nutshell, I am certain that I can discharge effectively the role of President of the Scrutiny Management Committee. It is a role and a challenge that I would very much relish. I do not want to play any part on the six principal committees of the  
3885 States in this term, because ultimately I think I am needed at Scrutiny.

I would be grateful if you could bear me in mind when you come to vote.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Thank you Deputy Green.

3890 Members of the States, we move into the period of questioning of the candidates. It will be for a maximum of 45 minutes. I remind you that questioners can speak for no more than 30 seconds and each candidate has up to 60 seconds to respond. The questions must relate to areas of policy included in the mandate of the Committee.

I will start question time at 15.57.40.

Deputy Brehaut.

3895

**Deputy Brehaut:** People talk about a pro-active Scrutiny but how re-active do you think Scrutiny locally could become? I know they have a different model in the UK but if there is a significant event on a Monday, by Wednesday people are usually in front of a Public Accounts Committee, or something of that nature, so are they adequately resourced to be able to produce reviews at extremely short notice in real time.

3900

Thank you.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

3905

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** Hopefully, yes. There is an issue with resources. I believe we are going to have to apply for extra additional resources, but UBRs, urgent business reviews, have been undertaken by Scrutiny in the past at very short notice and I see no reason why they could not carry on with that trend.

3910

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

3915

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Yes, I can add very little to the comments made by Deputy Lester Queripel. I like the way that they work in the UK, that they can have a couple of days later, people in front of a committee asking questions and looking for answers. As Deputy Lester Queripel said, we are looking for – if I become a member of the Scrutiny Management Committee, that is – extra resources, and I think if we can get those resources, those kind of things are very possible, that we can be very quick to react and actually be pro-active.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

3920

**Deputy Green:** The question was, 'How re-active can Scrutiny be in Guernsey?' The answer is it can be more re-active than what it is now, but as mentioned a moment ago, we are not going to be able to achieve some scrutiny nirvana in short order. We can be more re-active than what we are now. Can we be as re-active as the UK? In reality, maybe not.

3925

As the others have said the issue is one of resources. At the end of the day, if we can ensure that we have a room available with a *Hansard* facility at short notice, then we might be able to be much more re-active than we have been to date hitherto. But certainly the new powers to compel witnesses, to order the production of documents, all of that kind of thing, will help, but I think we are going to have to test the waters. But I am quietly confident that we can be more re-active than we have been hitherto.

3930

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

3935

**Deputy Tindall:** Under the mandate, it explains that the committee should at all times be responsible and accountable to the States for everything done by the committee and any panels it has appointed, including the content of any report issued under its name. How do the candidates think this will work in practice?

Thank you.

3940

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** I think it can work fine. I think it is up to the Scrutiny Management Committee to keep their colleagues updated, the States updated; so to bring regular reports to the States, to keep them apprised of any work streams that they are undertaking, any development in those work streams, anything they might be looking at in the future.

3945 So I think that can work fine. It is really up to the Scrutiny Management Committee to make sure that they communicate effectively with States' committees and the States generally on a regular basis.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

3950

**Deputy Green:** I think the answer is very good, strong communication between the Scrutiny Management Committee and the kind of specific panels that are doing the work. At the end of the day, it will be a team and you will have the three members of the Management Committee and the two non-States' members, and perhaps other task and finish panels. But at the end of the day it has got to be about regular meetings, clear communication, clear expectations and just making sure that everybody knows what they are doing and what the timeframes are, I think.

3955

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** It will work as it does now – extremely effectively – as long as every member takes responsibilities seriously, which they will do. But Deputy Green mentioned communication; communication is key to everything within the States. Communication levels within the States and from the States to the people of Guernsey are extremely poor. I have said that in so many debates. Very few people have picked up on that.

3960

I know some departments have worked at it. Communications have improved in the States and from the States slightly, but there is a lot more work to do regarding the issues of communication. Of course, Scrutiny can have a major effect on the levels of communication being improved within and from the States.

3965

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

**Deputy Gollop:** Sir, I had the pleasure and the honour of being Chairman and Vice-Chairman of Legislation Select in the past. How would the candidates strengthen that role and perhaps open it up to public review?

3970

3975

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

**Deputy Green:** Well, firstly, I think the new mandate that the Scrutiny Management Committee will have does actively encourage a greater amount of scrutiny being done in public, and I quote:

3980

'... to recognise that the carrying out of scrutiny in public where possible is likely to contribute positively to public perceptions ...'

So I believe that the Legislation Review Panel should at times, where it is appropriate, sit in public. That does not mean that every single meeting of it will be in public, but I think where it is appropriate. Then that can only contribute positively to the image of Scrutiny within our jurisdiction.

3985

I think, again, the mandate for the Legislation Review Panel is an interesting one. It should not just be about whether a piece of legislation complies with a States' Resolution. There are other aspects in time, and also the ability to recommend any changes in legislation is something that will help to bring things forward.

3990 So I think we need to take a much more pro-active approach to the scrutiny of legislation, it is not just about proof reading.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

3995 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** I agree with Deputy Green, we need to be a lot more pro-active and encourage scrutiny to be out in the public domain. How many times have we heard the words 'openness', 'honesty', 'transparency' and 'accountability'? Very often we seem to pay lip service to those words. Scrutiny have to ensure that we no longer just pay lip service to the words, but we actually attain all of them.

4000 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Thank you, sir.

4005 I have no problem at all, when the time is right, in regard to the Legislation Panel sitting in public. As Deputy Gollop knows, we benefitted greatly from the expertise of non-States' members sitting on that panel, on that committee That has got to continue when the panels come into force.

4010 Also, as Deputy Gollop knows, we have done more than just see that legislation complies with policy; we have actually sometimes challenged the policy and we have actually sometimes recommended certain changes that go beyond just complying with the policy, and those changes have been taken on board. So I think the committee is already quite effective. I think it can be more effective under the new regime.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Stephens.

4015 **Deputy Stephens:** Thank you, sir.

Do the candidates think that there is any area of Government activity where Scrutiny should not go? Anything that Scrutiny should not review?  
Thank you.

4020 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** I think I would have to say, yes, occasionally there would be a need for confidentiality, but that would be very rare.

4025 I am thinking of the time that two tankers were purchased to ensure delivery of fuel to the Island. I am not quite sure of the history of that, but the way I recall it – I am sure I will be corrected if I am wrong – is if the information had been put out to the public that there were just a few weeks supply of oil and fuel in tanks, there would have been a mass rush, we would have been totally stripped out of all fuel and oil within two days. There was an issue of confidentiality which I applaud. Somebody – I am not going to name any names, I think we all know who was  
4030 influential in that – quietly went out and bought two tankers! *(Laughter)*

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

4035 **Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Yes, I think there probably is a time and a place for confidentiality, but, generally speaking, I think Scrutiny should be able to shine a light wherever it needs to. The most important thing for me is ... especially in regard to not only policy but operational matters. So many operational matters have a real impact on the way that the Island is run. They have a real impact upon Islanders' lives in an everyday sense and I think that so many things seem to happen that do not come to the States, and then they happen and then people start to say, 'Hang on a  
4040 minute, that has an effect upon me, that has had an impact upon me, upon my family, upon my

4045 friends, upon my business.' So I think, yes, there probably are areas at times where Scrutiny should not tread; but, generally speaking, Scrutiny should not fear to tread because the most important thing, as I said, is the purpose – the *sole* purpose – of Scrutiny is to make sure this Island is well governed and well served, and the people of this Island are well served. Actually, in that regard, there is very little that Scrutiny should not look at. I think they should look at just about everything, because everything this Government does, whether it is in Committee, whether it is in here, affects the way this Island runs and affects the lives of the people of this Island.

4050 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

**Deputy Green:** Yes, I think Deputy Laurie Queripel put his finger on the issue there, which is that the whole point of Scrutiny is to add to and help the Government of this Island. You cannot eradicate that. The whole point of Scrutiny is to help the Government of this Island perform better in the short term, in the medium term, in the long term.

4055 Yes, there are some areas where Scrutiny possibly should not get involved with. Off the top of my head, perhaps issues concerning the security of the Island, areas that might be perceived to be counter to the economic interests of the Island. I do not know, but yes, there will be some limited areas where it would be inappropriate for there to be particularly pro-active public scrutiny in certain areas.

4060 But, generally speaking, I agree with what Deputy Laurie Queripel said. I think, generally speaking, Scrutiny should be able to shine a light where it needs to, but at the end of the day it is all about the *raison d'être* or what Scrutiny is about. It is about trying to carry out a process that will improve the performance of Government. You have to balance that in the round.

4065 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Trott.

**Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir.

Can I ask the candidates what they believe to be the outstanding success for Scrutiny in the previous term?

4070 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** I think there were a few successes.

4075 I think particularly the review of the Children's Law. We had a report conducted by Professor Marshall. Professor Marshall revealed a number of shortcomings, potential shortcomings, in Children's Services and made over 20 recommendations. So that was clearly a worthwhile piece of work to carry out.

4080 I think what the Scrutiny Management Committee need to do in this term now is to monitor how those recommendations are received and taken up, because it is clearly important in regard to Children's Services which affect their lives and their families' lives, that they get those things right. So I think that is the most important piece of work, although there were other important pieces of scrutiny during the last term.

4085 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

**Deputy Green:** I do not think it is a question of what was the outstanding one piece of work. I think the great value in Scrutiny and the work of the Public Accounts Committee over the last four years has been the cumulative impact of a number of different work streams.

4090 I think the Public Accounts Committee did some fantastic work with regard to the FTP, with regard to the States of Guernsey's investment policies. I think there was some excellent work done there. As my colleague said a moment ago, the work that Scrutiny did on the implementation of the Children Law, I think, was a fantastic piece of work.

4095 The security of air links public hearing, again, was a very good piece of work and, dare I mention it, the AFR, the kind of rapid public hearing that took place under the late, great Alderney Representative, Paul Arditti, and his committee, was a good piece of work.

So it is not so much what was the one outstanding issue; it was what was the cumulative impact of those two committees working side by side on different work streams. I think the kind of overall impact of what was achieved was fantastic.

4100 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

4105 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** I think the greatest success of Scrutiny was to raise the profile of Scrutiny. We raised the bar. Prior to the last Scrutiny Committee being in office, Scrutiny was seen as a committee only populated by Deputies and politicians who could not get a seat anywhere else. It is a fact. But we have raised the bar.

Now you have got three excellent candidates up here today, who live and breathe scrutiny. Four years ago that would not have happened. You did not have people that lived and breathed scrutiny; you had people who wanted to be on Health, people on Housing, people on Education, people on everything else but Scrutiny.

4110 So I think the greatest achievement, as well as my brother Deputy Laurie Queripel mentioned, Scrutiny was a catalyst, in fact, by conducting a review into the implementation of the Children's Law. Prior to that, HSSD had no intention whatsoever of looking at their own services they provided for children. Scrutiny did that.

4115 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

**Deputy De Lisle:** Thank you, sir.

How will the candidates represent the work of Scrutiny in the States and publicly promote and champion the value of Scrutiny?

4120

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

4125 **Deputy Green:** Well, first of all, I think the facility for the committee to put in letters of comment on particular policy letters will be a step forward. I also think it means in the ordinary course of debates in this Assembly there will be an opportunity for members of Scrutiny, indeed for the President of Scrutiny Management Committee, to make their voice heard.

4130 I think the other part of the question was really about how you are going to contribute to public perceptions. I think there is a communication job there to be done. I think the role of the public hearings is part of that. I think we have to demonstrate that we are prepared to have some, perhaps semi-regular, public hearings in the public domain in Guernsey that will help to contribute to public perceptions of Scrutiny.

Again, it comes back to what is in the mandate. We have to be led by what is in the mandate of the Scrutiny Management Committee. If you examine that mandate carefully I think the answers are there really.

4135

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

4140 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** I think we have championed the value of Scrutiny by conducting more public reviews and vastly improving the levels of communication by telling the public what is happening and why it is happening, and inviting them to get involved. I think communication, like I said before, across the States needs to be improved immensely. But Scrutiny can champion that, and they must champion that. They have to champion communication levels of improvement.

4145 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Yes, I cannot disagree with the comments of either of my colleagues, Deputy Green and Deputy Lester Queripel.

4150 I think good effective communication with the media and with the public and with our fellow States' Members will be very important. I think, actually, Scrutiny can champion itself by being an effective organisation by producing results that the people of Guernsey can see – *tangible* results.

4155 I think, other than that, also Deputy Green mentioned earlier that Scrutiny can attach letters of comment to policy letters. I think that is going to be really important. If we can come out with some incisive and insightful comments that will help to inform our colleagues and let the public know that we are aware of those issues, that we are looking at them, that we are considering them, that we are making intelligent and informed comments, I think all those things, the good communication, insightful and incisive comments in regard to letters attached to policy letters and the work of Scrutiny being really good and effective, do show the public it has a real place in Government and has got some real worth, some real value.

4160 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Is there anyone who wishes to ask a question of the candidates who has not asked a question yet? Anyone who wants to ask a question who has asked a question?  
Deputy Gollop.

4165 **Deputy Gollop:** Last one.

Would the candidates consider reviewing as to whether the new framework would benefit from the appointment of an Auditor General?

4170 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

**Deputy Lester Queripel:** I do not see any reason why not. Anything that is going to help the scrutiny process – absolutely.

4175 **The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Laurie Queripel.

**Deputy Laurie Queripel:** Quite happy to look at that. To my mind, anything that makes Government more accountable, provides more openness and transparency, anything that motivates Government to be more effective and to raise the quality of its game and to better serve the public, I think all those things are worthwhile doing. But that is something that whoever populates the Scrutiny Management Committee can look at and talk about. I do not see any reason why it is something that should not be looked at.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Green.

4185 **Deputy Green:** I would not rule out that, but I think we have to be mindful of the framework that we have been given by the States' Review Committee in the last States' Assembly, confirmed that this was the structure of Government and the way that scrutiny would be done. As I say, I would not rule it out, may be it is a matter for discussion in the new Management Committee, but I am not sure that that is necessarily the best way forward.

4190 **The Deputy Bailiff:** If no Member wishes to ask any further question, we will move to the vote.

4195 There are three candidates for the President of the Scrutiny Management Committee: Deputy Lester Queripel, proposed by Deputy Trott and seconded by Deputy Le Clerc; Deputy Laurie Queripel proposed by Deputy Jones and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache; and Deputy Green proposed by Deputy Roffey and seconded by Deputy Fallaize.

Well, Members of the States, once again whilst the votes are being counted we will adjourn briefly, probably for no more than four or five minutes.

*The Assembly adjourned at 4.17 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 4.24 p.m.*

**Scrutiny Management Committee –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Green elected**

4200 **The Deputy Bailiff:** The voting in respect of the Scrutiny Management Committee is as follows: Deputy Green, 21 votes; Deputy Laurie Queripel, 8 votes; Deputy Lester Queripel, 8 votes. There were two spoilt papers and no blank papers. As Deputy Green has secured a majority of votes, I declare him duly elected. *(Applause)*

**VIII. Development & Planning Authority –  
Election of President –  
Debate commenced**

*Article VIII*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Development & Planning Authority to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article VIII, Development & Planning Authority – Election of President.

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Are there any nominations for this presidency?

4205

**Deputy Brehaut:** Sir, would it be possible to have a brief adjournment? Only I get the sense that this has crept up on people rather unknowingly and there are people in the room who want to stand but they simply have not organised themselves with a proposer and seconder at this stage. I think an adjournment would be useful, I believe.

4210

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey.

4215

**Deputy Roffey:** Sir. Can I make a counter suggestion, given that we are pressed for time if we have any chance of finishing today? Could we, if that is the case move on to the next item on the agenda and let people gather their thoughts while we are going through that?

**The Deputy Bailiff:** Mr Procureur, would you –

4220

**The Procureur:** The view which has been taken in the past is that whoever is elected to a particular position, it may be relevant to their consideration of whether they are going to stand for another position, and so I think your predecessors, sir – and I am sorry Deputy Roffey – have been fairly strict about sticking to the order.

4225 **The Deputy Bailiff:** What I will do first then, is put the motion to you that has been proposed by Deputy Brehaut, that there be a short recess of perhaps no more than 10 minutes, maximum. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Deputy Bailiff:** I am going to declare that carried. I am going to rise and I will resume again at 25 to 5.

*The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 4.35 p.m.*

**Development & Planning Authority –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Gollop elected**

4230 **The Bailiff:** I have been released from my other duties! *(Interjections and laughter)*  
Right, do we have any nominations?

**Deputy Brehaut:** I would like to nominate Deputy John Gollop, sir.  
Thank you.

4235 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brehaut, nominating Deputy John Gollop. Do we have a seconder?

**Deputy Le Clerc:** Yes, sir, I am seconding Deputy John Gollop.

4240 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Clerc. Any other candidates? No. In that case, Deputy Brehaut do you wish to speak for up to five minutes.

**Deputy Brehaut:** Yes, can I draw on my extensive notes, sir, that I have left at home?  
*(Laughter)*

4245 I have worked with Deputy John Gollop for many years. We first worked together on the Housing Department some years ago and, of course, Deputy Gollop has been a member of the Environment Department.

4250 I have to say the role of the DPA, if I would not have been successful earlier today, I probably would have gone to this role, because I think people need to understand what this role is about. This is the outward facing side, the public facing side of planning. These are very big decisions that developers' futures, prospects, hinge on. You have to have your eye on the potential for your decision to be challenged, the potential for any appeal and you also have to avoid pre-determination in having conversations with others when you are in the process of leading up to a planning meeting.

4255 Deputy Gollop, over the time, has acquired all those skills and is familiar with this role, and Deputy Gollop is well known to all of us. He is a member of the Environment Department – or was – and is more than familiar with the process that he has volunteered, or the role that he has volunteered to adopt.

Sir, thank you.

4260 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop, you may speak for up to 10 minutes.

**Deputy Gollop:** I had actually considered applying for this post over the last few days, and it was one of those I discussed with the Policy & Resources team, and indeed at least one of the team there was saying that perhaps as I had a passion for this topic this was the logical fit for me.

4265 As Deputy Brehaut has rightly said, I have been a relatively happy member of the Environment board for the past two years, working with Deputy Brehaut, Yvonne Burford and the team on difficult planning decisions. We, of course, had one or two controversial high profile ones over the period, and I think we survived making the right common sense decisions on those occasions.

4270 I am aware that the nature of the open planning meetings perhaps requires some further tweaking, as to whether there is inequality of arms between the representors and the civil servants from other departments who advise, and so there are issues that the new committee will have to address.

I, too, have experience. I cannot claim to be a successful advocate, but I do have a quasi-legal background with a degree in law. I have sat for 12 years on Legislation, and therefore proofread – if that is the right phrase – a lot of the legislation, including environmental law.

4275 I sat for seven years on the Ancient Heritage Committee, that some may remember, which in those days had a scheduled buildings component; and I well recall having fascinating discussions with the then Deputy Paul and top architect Andrew Dyke and many others. I have even been up against at least one Member of this States in a legal capacity at various planning enquiries, putting forward points of view, that I invariably lost, but nevertheless I have had experience from every angle in these roles. I am aware it is a responsible position where one has to disseminate information carefully and take on board legal advice and professional advice, as well as sometimes making judgements on a socio-economic level.

4280 What is interesting is that it is, to some extent, the mandate of the former Island Development Committee, but it should be noted – as you, sir, advised us earlier – that, of course, the onus of the Strategic Land aspect has gone to the Environment & Infrastructure Committee, and yet this body will be responsible ... so social planning is in Environment & Infrastructure – SLUP, as it used to be called – but the day-to-day nuts and bolts of planning decisions, the open planning meetings and, of course, bringing back the almost completed epoch-breaking Island Plan, which hopefully will contribute to kick starting our economy, as well as protecting our habitat, is very close to fruition.

4285 So there are major work streams but, of course, there are also bridges to be built, with Policy & Resources and Deputy Brehaut's team. I will very much welcome working with other Members who have expressed an interest in this Committee, including perhaps those with professional experience if the States endorse my candidature today.

4295 **The Bailiff:** Members, you are voting now on the election of the President of the Development & Planning Authority: one candidate, Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy Brehaut, seconded by Deputy Le Clerc. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

4300 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Gollop elected as the President of the Development & Planning Authority. *(Applause)*

**IX. States' Assembly & Constitution Committee –  
Election of President –  
Debate commenced**

*Article IX.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article IX, States' Assembly & Constitution Committee – Election of President.

4305 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey.

**Deputy Roffey:** Sir, I would like to propose Deputy Matt Fallaize.

4310 **The Bailiff:** Proposing Deputy Fallaize. Is there a seconder?  
Deputy Jones.

**Deputy Jones:** I would like to second that.

4315 **The Bailiff:** Any other candidates? Deputy Le Pelley.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** I would like to propose Deputy Dawn Tindall, sir, for the post.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall. And a seconder?

4320 **Deputy Meerveld:** I would like to second.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Meerveld, thank you.

4325 Anyone else? No. In that case we have two candidates: Deputy Fallaize, proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Jones; and Deputy Tindall, proposed by Deputy Le Pelley and seconded by Deputy Meerveld.

I invite the two candidates to come up on to the bench.

I hope I will not have to leave as soon as Deputy Fallaize starts speaking this time, unlike last time.

4330 Well, now the order of speeches will be Deputy Roffey, to be followed by Deputy Fallaize, then Deputy Le Pelley, followed by Deputy Tindall. Deputy Roffey.

4335 **Deputy Roffey:** Sir, in my opinion, the person who is heading up SACC should ideally have two things. The first is a fair amount of States' experience, so that they know almost instinctively what will work and what will not work when it comes to the Rules of Procedure governing the work of this Assembly; even more importantly, actually, what will work and what will not work when it comes to elections to fill the seats in this Assembly in the first place. The second thing is I think they just need a deep interest in matters electoral, constitutional and governmental. They need to be a bit of a nerd! *(Laughter)*

4340 So how does Deputy Fallaize measure up against those criteria? Well, after eight years in the States he cannot claim to be one of the most experienced but I would put it to Members that actually the high octane way he has gone about politics for the last eight years probably means he has done a bit more politicking than even the most long standing Members of this Assembly. So I am sure he has picked up that instinctive knowledge of what will work and what will not work.

4345 As for engagement with matters electoral and governmental, well, he was Chairman of SACC in the last Assembly, he is widely acknowledged as probably the principal architect of the new system of government that we are embarking on as we speak, and of course it was his amendment that meant that we are supposed to be having a referendum on Island-wide voting in the coming year or so. So he has certainly got the experience.

4350 As for the last one, I am tempted to say he got us into this mess, he can get us out of it! (*Laughter*) No, that is not what ... He created this exciting opportunity (*Laughter*) and he is the right man to guide us through it. That is what I am trying to say there, really, sir.

4355 Sir, so what will the work be? Obviously, that Island-wide voting issue is going to be one of the big ones for SACC coming up, and I know that Deputy Fallaize has been fairly even handed about the pros and cons of SACC, but I also know he is a democrat and I know he recognises a *zeitgeist* when he sees it. So I believe that if we elect him today he will embrace that task with gusto and move it forward.

4360 But SACC will not be just about Island-wide voting. It has got a wide mandate. Sure as eggs, some of the Rules that we currently have in this book here are not going to fit our new system of government. They will need to be adjusted, they will need to be changed. We will not know which ones until we have sucked it and seen a bit over the next months, and I think he is the right person to be able to respond – looking at what he has done in the past to be able to respond rapidly and make sure that our Rules are fit for purpose.

4365 I hope – and I will be badgering him – if he is elected, that he will also look at the process we are going through now. I know this is not a speech about me, but I am going to make sure that he is aware of my views on this. Actually this is a nonsense, isn't it? We are putting people in place for the next four years when actually we do not know the strengths or weaknesses of lots of them because they are brand new. So I believe somebody ought to take that up and look if there is a more rational way of doing it, and I think Deputy Fallaize has the lateral thinking to be able to achieve that. But I am going to come back, in closing, to Island-wide voting.

4370 What do we want as an Assembly? I am not saying do we want Island-wide voting or do we not, but surely we want to put this long running saga to bed. We do not want to spend the next 10 years debating ourselves and how we are elected to this Assembly again and again and again.

4375 Yes, it is important, but it pales compared with the economy and health and education. So, if we are going to put it to bed, we want to give the task to somebody with a track record of tackling complex difficult issues and nailing them. Look at the way he drove through the system of government, look at how complex that was. He built a consensus; he nailed it. He will do this over Island-wide voting as well. He will put it to bed. He had better well, if we elect him. I hope we do.

4380 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

4385 Having enjoyed this process so much the first time, I decided to have a second go! (*Laughter*) But I should say this is not a sort of consolation prize because I always intended to stand to return to the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. I know it is not everybody's cup of tea. Maybe it is because I am a bit of a nerd, but I love it.

I am actually the only remaining member of SACC. Three of the other four members retired at the General Election and the other one lost his seat. I am happy to stand for this position on my record.

4390 I inherited the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee four years ago when I think it was at a bit of a low ebb. I think its credibility had been somewhat damaged in the previous term of the States', for reasons I do not need to go into now. I know that some Members did not agree with everything that the committee did in the last term, but we were a united committee and I believe that we spoke with reasonable credibility and authority in the States, and I think we therefore boosted the credibility of the committee.

4395 I believe in our system of government – I had better say that since I had a hand in designing it! – and I believe in this body as a parliamentary Assembly, and in its role in our system of government.

It is a peculiar role in the sense that this is an Assembly which has both parliamentary functions and executive functions, not quite unique but almost unique. I think I am well placed to champion and to represent and to articulate the parliamentary side of States' business, which is very important.

4400 I think it does help if the committee is represented by somebody who can speak publicly, and in this Assembly, with a good understanding of our system of government, and with a good understanding of our Rules of Procedure, and I am immodest enough to say I think I have as good an understanding of the system of government and the Rules of Procedure as anybody else.

4405 I also think that the successful candidate will have to work with the grain of opinion in the States. I think this was a mistake that was made by the one committee before the one I chaired in the last term, often bringing things to the States, bringing proposals to the States, which quite obviously were not going to get through.

4410 Actually, I was a member of that committee, I have to say that, but often found myself in a minority in committee, often with Deputy Shane Langlois, and he will remember the number of times the committee brought things to the States which were not successful, because it was not able to speak with sufficient credibility and authority in here.

4415 So I think understanding the balance of opinion in the States on these issues, being able to communicate with other members and being able to propose things which go with the grain of opinion in the States is important, and I think I can do that.

4420 I would cite both my record chairing the previous States' Assembly & Constitution Committee, because I think we lost almost no policy letter that we brought to the States, and also my involvement with the States' Review Committee. We took on a thorny issue which had been controversial and contentious previously, and built a consensus, and subsequently we were successful in the States. But, obviously, the two main roles for the committee in the first half of this term, will be to keep under review the Rules and the Procedures which relate to the new Machinery of Government. Quite clearly we will not have got everything right. There will be a need for review and to revise some of the Rules and the processes, and I think I am well placed to do that, and this business of the referendum on Island-wide voting.

4425 I proposed the referendum on Island-wide voting, because I believe it must be put to a referendum. I am not a recent convert to that position; I have held that position for years. I was working with Deputy Laurie Queripel when he proposed a referendum earlier in the life of the last States that was unsuccessful, but when the opportunity arose a few months to put forward a referendum myself, I did, and the States approved that.

4430 I am determined that that referendum will be held in the first half of the States' term, so that the result of the referendum can be put into effect for the next General Election. I am not talking about a sort of giant consultation exercise; I am talking about a properly organised referendum, the result of which would be binding in the States. That is the task that faces the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee, and it is something that I want to work on: find the right consensus in this Assembly, get proposals through here and then go out to the public in that binding referendum.

4435 I am grateful to Deputy Roffey for his generous words in proposing me, and for Deputy Jones for seconding me. Deputy Roffey has always been a bit of a sceptic about Island-wide voting, and Deputy Jones has been – well, I should not call him a fanatic, but – very enthusiastic about it. I think that the committee will need to bring those two sides of opinion together on this issue, and that is what I would intend to do.

4440 And just for Deputy Roffey, if I am elected, yes, I will ask the committee to have another look at this internal election process that we are going through at the moment.

4445 So, sir, I believe that, based on my record, I can do this job and I can do it well. I feel confident that I can propose a strong and credible committee of members next Wednesday and, believe it or not, I am raring to go.

Thank you, sir.

4450 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Pelley will speak in favour of Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Le Pelley:** Thank you, sir.

4455 I would like to propose Deputy Tindall for the role as President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. She is my newbie nerd. We need someone who has the skills, knowledge and desire to lead a team to assist the States with a challenge, to implement the new structure of government, which has been four years in the making. I believe that Deputy Tindall is such a person.

4460 Deputy Tindall has been a solicitor for more than 25 years, working in private practice and, more recently, in the finance industry, dealing with all aspects of compliance. During this time she has been involved with drafting, explaining and implementing a variety of processes and procedures, more particularly in relation to good governance.

4465 Deputy Tindall also has experience, as she has been a non-States' member of the Legislation Select Committee, so she is not completely new. By working with Deputies, Law Officers and civil servants, she has obtained an insight into the legislation process and has contributed to the States' Review Committee's work by way of meetings and reports.

I have not known Deputy Tindall for very long, but from the short conversations we have had I am satisfied that she is capable and would be suitable for this role – so much so that I am happy to propose her for the role as President of SACC.

Thank you, sir.

4470

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** Mr Bailiff, Members.

4475 As is right, I start with thanking Deputy Le Pelley for proposing me and Deputy Meerveld for seconding me.

4480 I believe the States have a challenge with the introduction of a new government structure. I have heard the phrase, 'We need to hit the ground running,' many times. The other phrase I hear is that, 'We need to be seen to be effective and efficient'. With the introduction of this new system, we have, I believe, sir, a great opportunity to do both, but this opportunity may not arise again.

4485 To play my part, I wish to lead the team that advises the States on these changes, and so I am standing as candidate for the role of President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. SACC is an essential cog in the Machinery of Government, and never more so than when there have been changes in the makeup of Government; never more so than when further changes such as Island-wide voting are contemplated.

4490 SACC will also develop and implement policies relating to, amongst other things, the processes of the States and its committees. I am standing because I believe in process. I believe in Rules and Procedures, I would even go so far as to say I live them. Before anyone sighs, I should add I also believe in the sensible, pragmatic approach to their interpretation, and a belief in the importance of clarity and flexibility. As many know, I am a lawyer and a compliance specialist, which I believe gives me the credentials for this role. I have drafted, implemented and explained many types of procedures over many years.

4495 As well as my professional background, I thought I would list some of my experience of committees and boards, both in the public and private arena. I am a director of a charity in Guernsey and until last month, as Deputy Le Pelly said, I was a non-States' member of the Legislation Select Committee, which I joined in 2012.

I should add that, whilst a newly-elected Deputy, my membership of the Legislation Select Committee has given me the experience I feel sufficient to be a suitable candidate for President of SACC. I was also on the Committee of the Guernsey International Legal Association, or GILA, for several years, finishing my stint there as Treasurer.

When in the UK, I was an honorary member of the board of Carers National Association of Wales, and on the STEP Committee in Cardiff. Professionally, my board experience includes running my own legal practice, that of director, money laundering reporting officer (MLRO) and when I was the head of compliance in Guernsey for a large international bank, I represented the compliance team at the board meetings of its Guernsey-licenced entities.

I have chaired many meetings at work and as a volunteer. In all those roles there are two areas of commonality, process and good government. Procedures which are clear and understandable provide the tools for good governance. However, without consistent application and clarification, different outcomes can arise, leading to confusion and disunity.

I would like to lead the team that helps the States to develop and implement policies to avoid this. I studied with interest the States' Review Committee's progress creating the new structure through its three policy letters. I entered into several discussions with the committee, which hopefully was as enjoyable for the members as they were for me. I also contributed to their work through the submissions of papers in respect of the future role of the equivalent of the Legislation Select Committee.

One might say the bulk of the work has been done, I would disagree. Deputy Fallaize once said that improving governments is a continuous process. There is no point in having a shiny new structure of government without proper installation and maintenance. I see the role as not just facilitating this implementation but also, as the mandate says, the continuing development of policies, in particular in relation to the practical functioning of the States of both Deliberation and Election.

Also SACC is responsible for ongoing support to Deputies, which I believe is essential because we all need that support to do our work. Whilst we all thrive under pressure, I know that stress can be avoided by having the right tools.

I was also pleased to note all Deputies have been asked to provide their views on the Election last month, which will be very helpful. One of the main constitutional issues the Committee will be involved in is the possible introduction of Island-wide voting. I have made no bones about supporting the introduction of Island-wide voting, stating it as one of my key policies in my manifesto. I did so because I believe anything that encourages participation in the governance of Guernsey can only be a good thing. I want to discourage apathy and promote involvement, and if that be Island-wide voting, then so be it.

I am also aware that this method of voting has been visited many times without success. As a student of constitutional politics to university level, having read the many missives on the subject and spoken to civil servants about possible general improvements to the electoral process, I feel there are areas that have yet to be fully explored on this subject.

If elected, I will apply my skills and knowledge, leading a team to work with other committees to seek to fulfil the Resolution of the States. I assure you, sir, I would do my utmost to help find a workable, cost-effective methodology for an election Island-wide. However, assuming the Resolution of the 19th February 2016 is not rescinded or amended, a referendum must be held first. As we know, the legislation, both primary and secondary, is yet to be drafted to enable this to happen, despite the States resolving for such to be drafted as long ago as 2002.

So, to conclude, I am able, willing and more than capable to lead a team to fulfil the wishes of this Assembly. Although in comparison to the most recent Chairman of SACC, I am a mere beginner in the study of the governance of Guernsey, I feel that I can offer a fresh pair of eyes and ears. I ask Members to please vote for me.

**The Bailiff:** Well, Members, there will now be a period of questions for a maximum of 30 minutes.

Does anybody have a question? Deputy Jones.

4550

**Deputy Jones:** Can I ask the prospective candidates whether, when looking at Island-wide voting, they will set up some form of working committee and co-opt other Members of this States, perhaps some who have an interest from both sides of the argument?

4555

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4560

**Deputy Fallaize:** Yes, I think that it is such a divisive issue, and it is such a significant issue, that if five members of this committee, or indeed any committee, just sort of lock themselves away in a committee room for several months without reference to other Members of the States, I think that is bound to fail. Quite what the mechanism would be – whether it would be a sub-group or a working party of the main committee – I am not sure, but I think it would be wise to bring in more opinions into the room and more shades of opinion from amongst this Assembly, than the five members who will be elected to the committee. So my answer is emphatically yes.

4565

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

4570

**Deputy Tindall:** I think we need to bring as many people into this process as possible, not just Members of this Assembly. In order to get a workable way of doing Island-wide voting, we need to take advantage of that wonderful knowledge that is within this Island. However, obviously it has got to be co-ordinated and I would suggest a working party may be a possible solution, but not necessarily the only one. So, again, it would be something to look into.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

4575

**Deputy Gollop:** Mention was made that a policy had been approved in the last States, I believe, relating to reasonable adjustment of resources for Members perhaps with disabilities. How do you feel about improving facilities for Members generally?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

4580

**Deputy Tindall:** I am glad you raised that because, to be fair, I am very lucky sitting there; I can stretch my leg and I am very comfortable; I know some areas in this Assembly are not. There is also accessibility to polling stations, which the GDA obviously was very much involved with, and let's be fair I believe in equality, diversity and inclusion, so anything to help.

4585

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Thank you, sir.

4590

The committee I chaired in the last States' ... I know this is not for States' Members, but for people with disabilities, we now allow them into the well of the Chamber, which was something that was new and, believe it or not, it was quite difficult to get that through at the time.

4595

Reasonable adjustment for Members is very important. The previous committee has been committed to that; for example, there are seating changes being made, which are not evident at the moment, but once this top bench is filled, there will be changes which, as a result partly of the reduction in the number of Members, will give Members more desk space and more leg space.

Those sorts of things which can be done relatively inexpensively or at no expense at all are to be welcomed. I would like to see much better facilities for States' Members carrying out their parliamentary duties. It is a question of what is affordable. I would certainly wish to advocate for that as much as possible.

4600

**The Bailiff:** Any other questions?  
Deputy Roffey.

4605 **Deputy Roffey:** Would the candidates agree with me that the operation of the States' Code of Conduct is far from perfect, it can often aggravate tensions rather than relieving them; and, if so, how would they go about improving that situation?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4610 **Deputy Fallaize:** When it was conceived I am quite sure what was envisaged was to give members of the public an opportunity to make complaints against Members of the States. Actually, what has often been the case is that Members of the States have made complaints against other Members. Now, this is not a misuse of the Code exactly, but I do not think it casts the States in particularly good light. The outgoing committee was unable to do it; it did not rise to the top of the priority list, but has recommended to the incoming committee that a full review is carried out of the States' Members Code of Conduct, and I will be keen to lead that as soon as possible.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

4620 **Deputy Tindall:** I noted that the Code of Conduct had been amended but, as Deputy Fallaize has just mentioned, I do consider that a full review is probably likely, and would obviously do so if necessary. I certainly recall during the Election period some issues with regard to the Code of Conduct which raised my eyebrows, and I would certainly not wish that to happen again.

4625 **The Bailiff:** Any more questions?  
Deputy Smithies.

4630 **Deputy Smithies:** Thank you, sir.  
I wonder if the candidates would share their views on the suggestion that the electoral roll should be changed from opting in to opting out?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

4635 **Deputy Tindall:** Personally, I think that is an extremely important change. If it could happen it would be fantastic. I have spoken to quite a few people during the Election. There was also the possibility of having the electoral roll close at midnight before the day of the Election.

All of these things are possible. I was looking at it because I was looking at it from an Island-wide voting perspective, but actually it could apply whatever voting process you have. So, yes.

4640 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4645 **Deputy Fallaize:** Actually, the electoral roll comes under the mandate of the Committee for Home Affairs, about which I do not want to hear anything! *(Laughter)* But the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee did recommend to the Home Department that every effort should be made to go to an opt-out system. It makes perfect sense to me. It is possible to do it now, I think. For a long time, it was not possible, but it probably is with the electronic census that the States now have. It is possible to do it.

4650 Every effort should be made to ensure that as many people as possible are inscribed on the electoral roll and have the opportunity to cast their votes. So I would very much favour an opt-out system, and I would be very pleased to work with the Committee for Home Affairs to bring it about.

**The Bailiff:** Any more questions? Yes. Deputy Meerveld.

4655 **Deputy Meerveld:** Sir, I would like to ask the candidates what are your views on electronic voting to be able to facilitate a larger proportion of the population being encouraged to vote?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4660 **Deputy Fallaize:** Well, there are two issues there. One minor issue of it could be more expensive. I say it is a minor issue, because I do not have enough detail to substantiate whether it would be more expensive. But the other issue is security. Now, I am quite happy to have electronic voting at polling stations, but I do not think that we ought to be guinea pigs in Guernsey. I think that we ought to allow others to pioneer it and if it works then we can follow.

4665 There have been examples where electronic voting has been used in other jurisdictions, and it has not been successful; there have been serious problems. But I dare say that, as technology moves on, those problems can be ironed out and there is no reason to oppose it in principle. If it is a more efficient process then it is to be welcomed so long as it is inexpensive and reliable and safe.

4670

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** I understand that there has already been an investigation into whether or not we could actually have electronic voting at the polling booths. It is quite possible we could hire the equipment. We also have an extremely important aspect here that Guernsey is a safe haven for data, and I think we should promote that, and if that includes in our elections, great.

4675

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lowe.

4680 **Deputy Lowe:** What are the candidates' views on simultaneous electronic voting, please?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** Yes, please.

4685

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

**Deputy Fallaize:** Do you know, I really do not care whether we have simultaneous electronic voting, in the sense that I do not think it would achieve what people think it would achieve. But I mean if the States' want to spend several tens of thousands installing it then it is no skin off my nose. But when it was looked into, we found that you could speed things up by making sure that everything that is currently done by going round the Chamber be done electronically, but that would not create more transparency, because if you made all of the *aux voix* votes electronic, that would actually take more time. You have to choose between saving time and efficiency, or transparency. You can install transparency, but it takes more time, or you can have it quicker but it potentially compromises on transparency. That is why the last States rejected simultaneous electronic voting.

4690

4695

Personally, if the States want to spend money on it and do not mind if the voting process takes longer, then I have no particular objection to it.

4700

**The Bailiff:** Deputy De Lisle.

4705 **Deputy De Lisle:** What views do the candidates have on improving the broadcasting of proceedings of the States of Deliberation and the States of Election in terms of perhaps cameras and television and so on, sir?

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4710 **Deputy Fallaize:** Well, Deputy De Lisle will remember that the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee, which I Chaired in the last term, brought to the States proposals significantly to liberalise the broadcasting regime for States' meetings, as a result of which they are now streamed on the internet and it is open to anybody who wishes to broadcast States' meetings in whatever form they choose, so long as they obtain the permission of the Committee.

4715 But all of the rules around the broadcasting of States' meetings have now been removed as a result of the reforms that we made in the last term. I am not sure that we could justify the expense – the taxpayers' expense – of running a sort of broadcasting regime ourselves, in-house, at the present time, but certainly all of the restrictions which previously applied were done away with by the previous SACC, and I think that was a thoroughly good thing.

4720 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** If it was the States' decision to allow for cameras and the expense of it, all I would say is that as the President of SACC it would be my responsibility to ensure everyone had suitable media training to be able to ensure that they were aware that they were on camera and presented Guernsey States in the best light.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Lester Queripel.

4730 **Deputy Lester Queripel:** Sir, I appreciate that resources are often a problem, but it makes life very difficult for Deputies when *Hansards* takes so long to be provided. Either in electronic form or paper form. What assurance can candidates give us that the speed in which *Hansards* are supplied will be improved in the future?

4735 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Tindall.

**Deputy Tindall:** *Hansard* is obviously a very old institution and method of recording the States' meetings, and I think it is an invaluable source for all of us when researching. So in my view it is a priority to try and ensure there are sufficient resources to ensure it is available to Members as soon as possible. Clearly, anything to do with resources needs to have a balanced approach anyway.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

4745 **Deputy Fallaize:** I was on the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee which proposed the introduction of *Hansards*, and I think that that was a good reform as well. The committee actually is absorbing more responsibilities in a roundabout way as a result of the restructuring of the States, and I think that is going to require a reassessment of the staff resources of the committee.

4750 Clearly, it is not satisfactory if parliamentary proceedings are not being made available for some months after the relevant meeting. It is something that has to be resolved. I mean the process has worked very well. But over the last few months there were some problems, they are now up to date, but I think that the resources of the committee generally need to be re-examined, because it has slightly broader responsibilities in the new system.

4755 **The Bailiff:** Anyone else? No.

In that case, Members, you are to vote for the election of the President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. Deputy Fallaize was proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Jones; and Deputy Tindall, proposed by Deputy Le Pelley and seconded by Deputy Meerveld.

I propose that we rise for five minutes and resume at 5.20 p.m.

4760 Can I just ask whether members of the Civil Contingency Authority have been sworn?

**The Procureur:** I am not sure that Deputy St Pier is going to be able to stay with me. He had to make some arrangements tomorrow, but the others will be available.

4765 **The Bailiff:** Well, we could do it now.

**The Procureur:** Let's do it now.

**The Bailiff:** We have got five minutes. So, yes.

*The Assembly adjourned at 5.15 p.m.  
and resumed its sitting at 5.20 p.m.*

**States' Assembly & Constitution Committee –  
Election of President –  
Deputy Fallaize elected**

4770 **The Bailiff:** I am now being handed the voting record for the election of the President of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee. The voting was as follows: Deputy Fallaize, 27 votes; Deputy Tindall, 11 votes, with no blank or spoilt papers. I declare Deputy Fallaize elected as the President of SACC. *(Applause)*

**X. Transport Licensing Authority –  
Election of President –  
Adjourned to next sitting**

*Article X.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Transport Licensing Authority to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article X, Transport Licensing Authority – Election of President.

4775

**The Bailiff:** Do we have any candidates? Any nominations? Transport Licensing Authority President. Would somebody like an adjournment so that perhaps some discussions could take place?

4780 **Deputy Fallaize:** Why don't we defer it until Wednesday when we elect the members of the committees?

4785 **The Bailiff:** Yes, rather than come back tomorrow morning, it may be we can finish today if we defer that. I agree. Unless there is any urgency that anybody knows about, it could be deferred until ... I will put that to you that we adjourn the election of the President of the Transport Licensing Authority to Wednesday 18th May. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** Fine, well, that will be the first matter then to be dealt with next Wednesday.

## Billet d'État XV

### I. Overseas Aid and Development Commission – Election of President – Deputy Yerby elected

*Article I*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

4790 **The Greffier:** Billet XV, Article I, Overseas Aid & Development Commission – Election of President.

**The Bailiff:** The President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission has to be nominated by the Policy & Resources Committee. Deputy St Pier. Oh, Deputy Stephens.

4795 **Deputy Stephens:** Thank you, sir.

I would like to nominate Deputy Yerby as President of the Overseas Aid & Development Committee.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Yerby, and is there a seconder?

4800 **Deputy Brouard:** Sir, I would like to second Deputy Yerby.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

4805 So we have Deputy Yerby and there can be no other nominations, because it is only the Policy & Resources Committee who can nominate someone. Deputy Yerby is proposed by Deputy Stephens and seconded by Deputy Brouard.

I believe we still have speeches. Deputy Stephens.

**Deputy Stephens:** Thank you, sir.

4810 This Commission is responsible for distributing the funds allocated by the States towards overseas aid and development, and towards emergency relief. It is also responsible for working with the private sector to further develop programmes relating to the collection and distribution of funds for overseas aid and development. The Commission aims to support projects which will progress the provision of the basic needs of some of the world's least developed countries. These

4815 include medical and health facilities, education, housing, water and sanitation, and the access to the means to earn a living.

The majority of the Commission's work is in Africa, although it does also fund projects in the rest of the world. The Commission is focused on giving communities in less developed countries a hand-up not a hand-out.

4820 Deputy Yerby brings a range of skills and experience to this which would equip her very well for this role. Her first degree at the University of Cambridge was in modern languages, including, French, Russian and German. At least two of these are spoken widely in countries which are recipients of overseas aid funding. But most importantly perhaps, her languages background has given her a global outlook and sensitivity to the perspectives and challenges of communities around the world.

4825 Further to this, Deputy Yerby is currently studying, by distance learning, a master's degree in public health. Her studies at the University of Edinburgh, once again, have given her an international outlook and cover a broad scope. These studies will provide her with considerable insight into the kinds of projects supported by the Overseas Aid & Development Commission, and the potential impact these projects could have within their communities.

4830 Deputy Yerby and I first worked together in 2011 when I was the first political champion for people with disabilities and Deputy Yerby was the Civil Service officer designated to work on the Disability & Inclusion Strategy. We worked closely together developing both our roles and learning from each other. I soon developed a real respect for Deputy Yerby, her determination and commitment and capacity to work with enthusiasm on any project that came her way.

4835 After leaving the Civil Service in 2014, Deputy Yerby joined the Guernsey Community Foundation, working in an organisation which has many parallels with the role of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission.

4840 The Foundation, although it is focussed on the local community, rather than overseas, runs a strategic branch programme which is intended to build the capacity of a voluntary sector and create sustainable long-term change. It also works with potential private philanthropists to encourage more well directed, charitable giving within the community.

4845 Deputy Yerby's role within the Foundation was research and policy analysis, and there is no doubt that she will bring insights from her experience there which will help us discharge both aspects of the Commission's remit: the distribution of grant funding and the creation of relationships within the private sector to support further giving.

4850 As well as formal qualifications and experience, Deputy Yerby brings a level of personal commitment which I believe will enable her to flourish in the role. She is the kind of person who reads developmental economics for fun – or so I am told! She spends most of her free time volunteering, she is sensitive to the challenges faced by people who are living on the margins of society, whether in Guernsey or in the wider world, and has respect for the inherent dignity of all human beings. The contribution that Guernsey makes to overseas aid and development is an opportunity for us to have a positive impact in the global community. The skills and knowledge that Deputy Yerby will bring to the role should help us to make the very best of that impact.

I ask Members to support Deputy Yerby in her wish to take on this important Commission.

4855 Thank you, sir.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Yerby.

4860 **Deputy Yerby:** Sir, compared to the challenges some of my colleagues are taking on today, Overseas Aid & Development is a quiet little job. It does not have policy-making responsibility; rather its role is to fulfil a policy made at the level of the States to distribute around £3 million a year in overseas aid to the countries and communities where it will have most impact. It is, in fact, a rather nice job, with an obvious feel good factor.

4865 So Members might be forgiven for looking a little askance at me, a first timer, going for the glamour of a presidential title which does not hang as heavy with hard work and responsibility as

those which my colleagues have just accepted. But I trust, sir, that Members might know me a little better than that, because although the Overseas Aid & Development Commission does not have a policy role, it plays an important part in discharging the business of Government. The way we distribute our aid and the governance surrounding that process can enhance or hinder Guernsey's international image. The very act of providing development assistance is partly fulfilling the moral duty of the Government in today's interconnected world.

Sir, as Deputy Jane Stephens has already said, I started a master's degree in public health last year. My interest, which had been stirred by my time working at HSSD, was confirmed by watching the Ebola crisis unfold over the previous winter.

Ebola was a perfect storm for a country such as Sierra Leone. Already shattered by war and struggling to rebuild, it was hit by a frightening disease which left even our advanced health systems reeling in panic.

Ebola dealt multiple blows to the country. Not only did it put unimaginable pressure on an already weak health service, and devastate families and communities with death, disease and a still emerging trail of long-term ill health. It also shut down business and caused grave hunger and hardship, as communities were closed off by stringent quarantine requirements. The damage to the country's economic and social fabric will take years to rebuild.

This pushed me into public health for several reasons. I witnessed this awful crisis unfold from a distance – just one of many in a world troubled by earthquakes, emerging diseases, conflict and poverty – and I felt an unshakeable responsibility to do more in this world in which I live so well, and others with such disadvantage.

Public health offered me the tools to do more, to understand the causes of disease and the reasons why it spreads, to understand how poverty and deprivation affect life chances. To see how resources can be allocated and systems designed to improve the health and wellbeing of the population.

Sir, my interest in the Overseas Aid & Development Commission is entirely analogous to my interest in global public health, and the two are complimentary. Here too I am motivated by a sense of duty which impels us, as a mature democracy and a strong society, to raise others up in so far as it is in our power to do so.

This is wholly in keeping with the ethos of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission, which seeks to support sustainable projects that result in long-term transformative change for the communities that they assist. I am motivated not by pity, but by respect for the lives and dignity of fellow human beings worldwide, and by a deep belief in the potential of every person – a potential which all too often is kept locked up by the disadvantage or deprivation which circumscribe their lives.

Sir, one might describe the work of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission as nice, but one could not truthfully describe it as easy. Past annual reports show that the Commission has regularly received requests for three or four times as much money as it has for funding to disperse. Those requests represent projects, people and communities whose need and capacity to benefit from our assistance is considerable. But who, in many cases, must go unassisted.

The insights I bring, not only from my public health training but also from my time at the Guernsey Community Foundation, will help me to work with the commissioners to make those decisions about resource allocation thoughtfully and dispassionately. But there is no question that the choices that we make and the things we leave unfunded will weigh on my conscience, sometimes heavily. That is a mixed blessing, I know, but I hope that the Assembly might consider that sensitivity, that willingness always to look inwards and scrutinise oneself, the choices one makes and the impact they have on the lives of others, as a potential asset in a role which help us to fulfil our duties towards the world outside.

Sir, before I close I must address that point. The work of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission helps Guernsey to fulfil our duties to the world outside. It is, however small, a role with an international outlook and international connections. In today's papers we have seen some criticism of the way the UK organises its aid funding, following certain comments made by their

4920 Prime Minister about corruption in other countries. We know that many organisations involved with international aid and development are also big campaigners on taxation. I do not say this to suggest that we should aid as a political tool – far from it, external affairs is a completely separate matter; although there are times when dialogue between the two would be important and appropriate. I simply say it in recognition that the context in which we operate is complex and hugely inter-connected, and the person in this role should demonstrate an awareness of that and a sensitivity to it.

4925 Our investment in overseas aid and development is an opportunity for us to have a positive impact on the world around us. We owe a moral duty both to the Islanders whose taxation funds our overseas aid budget and to the people and communities who receive our financial support, to ensure that we use that investment to achieve the best possible impact, that the way we approach overseas aid fosters sustainable development, meeting the basic needs of the community both  
4930 now and in the future.

I am grateful to Deputy Stephens for proposing me and to Deputy Brouard for seconding me. I have worked with, and looked up to, both of them when I was a junior civil servant and they, like now, were Members of the States. I am still adjusting to sitting here as equals among people who I have observed and often admired from as distance. I still feel pretty small, but perhaps that sets  
4935 a perspective that honest recognition of the scale of the responsibility I have taken on by joining the States will help to ensure that I do not underestimate the effort and commitment that will be required of me in this role, or in any other.

I would consider it an honour and a responsibility to serve the States as the President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission and, if the Assembly should choose to entrust me with  
4940 this role, I will seek to discharge it thoughtfully, diligently and compassionately at all times.

Thank you.

**The Bailiff:** Well, Members, the presidency of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission. Deputy Yerby has been proposed by Deputy Stephens and seconded by Deputy Brouard. Those in  
4945 favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Yerby elected. *(Applause)*

## **II. States Trading Supervisory Board – Election of President – Deputy Jones elected**

*Article II.*

*The States are asked:*

*To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board to serve until 30th June 2020 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.*

**The Greffier:** Article II, States' Trading Supervisory Board – Election of President.

**The Bailiff:** The President has to be recommended by the Policy & Resources Committee.  
4950 Deputy le Tocq.

**Deputy Le Tocq:** Sir, I am very pleased to put forward the name of Deputy David Jones.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Jones, and a seconder? Deputy Brouard.

4955 **Deputy Brouard:** I would like to second Deputy Jones please.

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard. There can be no further nominations.  
Deputy Le Tocq.

4960 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Sir, I will be very brief because Deputy Dave Jones does not really need any introduction, never mind whether you have been in the States for two minutes or for 20 years. But particularly this trading board – the States’ Trading Supervisory Board – if you look at the mandate of this particular board you will see how wide and how important it is when it comes to all the things that we sort of take for granted in Guernsey, and particularly the assets that the  
4965 States – that we – own, effectively, when you consider from the sense of supervisory capacity over those assets that we own as incorporations, incorporated companies as shareholders or whether the operational aspects such as the Harbours and the Airport and all of the work of the waste and water as well. So this is a huge responsibility and so it is absolutely essential we bring out our big guns, and that is what we are doing with Deputy Jones.

4970 Deputy Jones, sir, is not a shy or retiring type. He is also one who gets to grips with a mandate. He demonstrated that when I first met him when we were elected at the same time in the year 2000, with the Housing mandate; and, sir, we have absolute confidence that he is the right man to take on this particular responsibility.

So I ask Members to support Deputy Jones.

4975

**The Bailiff:** Deputy Jones.

**Deputy Jones:** Thank you.

4980 You will be pleased to know I have not prepared a speech of any kind, and I thank the Chief Minister ... Sorry, I thank our *former* Chief Minister, (*Laughter*) Deputy Le Tocq, for his kind words about Housing, but of course I had an awful lot of help when I first went into Housing and I spent 16 years – my whole political life – on Housing. So I did not want to be seen as a one trick pony and I wanted to go forward to try another job.

4985 This is a huge responsibility and we have billions and billions of pounds worth of assets out there that have not always been well managed in the views of many. But I am also not a great fan of commercialisation either. I prefer a middle path where I believe there is room for a small community like Guernsey to own and have its own airlines and airports and harbours, and we do not need all the trappings of the UK vision of commercialisation or privatisation. It is a breeding ground for large salaries for people who do not do very much. All those large salaries have to  
4990 come from somewhere, and in the case of transport it is usually the travelling public.

So it is a real, huge honour to be asked by Deputy St Pier to undertake this role. I will be flopping around in the dark with it for a few weeks because I have a lot to learn about it. The trading boards have not been a natural area of interest for me, other than when I have been fighting against the commercialisation of them and setting up a regulator etc. So I am really  
4995 honoured. I know the size of this job.

There is just one thing I need to say to all of you: at the beginning of this role I do have to go back to Southampton to have a very small operation – or I hope it is small – and I will be back. I have been assured by the committee’s civil servants that we will not be rushing back to the States imminently with any big ticket items. So I will have a little bit of leeway, and two things will  
5000 happen: either there will be a by-election in the Vale or I shall come back (*Laughter*) and run this committee to the utmost of my ability!

Thank you, very much.

5005 **The Bailiff:** The President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board. Deputy Jones has been proposed by Deputy Le Tocq and seconded by Deputy Brouard. Those in favour; those against.

*Members voted Pour.*

**The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Jones elected. *(Applause)*  
That concludes the business for this meeting and we will see you again next week.

*The Assembly adjourned at 5.40 p.m.*