

**REPLY BY THE PRESIDENT OF THE COMMITTEE *FOR THE*
ENVIRONMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE
TO QUESTIONS ASKED PURSUANT TO RULE 14 OF THE
RULES OF PROCEDURE BY DEPUTY C. LE TISSIER**

Question 1

In respect of each month during the period October 2020 to March 2024 how many flights paid for by the States did each political member of the Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* take and to which destinations and what was the class of the travel for each trip and member?

Question 2

In relation to question 1, what were the departure and return dates in respect of each member's trip from Guernsey, identifying which if any members extended their stay beyond States business for private/personal reasons?

Question 3

What were the dates of the event/meeting?

Question 4

The same questions, 1, 2 & 3 applies, how many Civil Servants and/or advisors accompanied political members on each trip to include departure/return/meeting/events dates?

Question 5

Which hotels paid for by the States did each political member of the Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* stay and for which nights during October 2020 – March 2024?

Question 6

What was the total cost of air fares, hotels and any other expenditure, including any standard day allowances in relation to the out of the island trips representing the States for each trip taken during the period October 2020 – March 2024 by each political member?

Question 7

What day allowances and other expenditure did each member receive for each trip during the period October 2020 – March 2024?

Question 8

The same questions 5, 6 & 7 above applies to Civil Servants and/or advisors accompanying political members on each trip October 2020 – March 2024.

Answer

The Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure's* answers to questions 1 to 8 can be found in the attached spreadsheet.

Question 9

In relation to previous Rule 6 (now numbered 11) questions on each members travel and expenditure during 2011 Deputy Trott as Chief Minister wrote *'in the spirit of moving towards more open and transparent Government, it is intended that information of this type will be provided as a matter of course in the next administration'*. As this didn't happen questions were repeated in January 2015 addressed to Deputy Le Tocq as Chief Minister, when replying he stated *'The Policy Council has no objection to the general publication of Deputies travel expenditure when representing the island outside the Bailiwick on a regular basis and that an appropriate frequency would be annual publication'*. As Deputy Trott & Deputy Le Tocq both as Chief Ministers at various times sought publishing States members travel details as above, and neither have pursued this happening, will the President of the Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* give assurances in the interest of transparency and accountability an annual detailed report covering the above will be published in the public domain, highlighting each States members travel details, costs and the reason for the trip?

Answer

The Committee *for the Environment & Infrastructure* supports transparency and accountability and will provide details of any costs incurred against its budget upon request. The information requested through this set of questions is neither comprehensive nor comparable, and as such it is of limited use.

For example, Deputy Le Tissier's questions fail to ask the most important question around the purpose of any trips. In any assessment of value for money, it is imperative to understand the reason for the trip, and impossible to make any judgement without that critical information. Only then can an informed view be taken as to the worth of any in-person meeting or trip off-island. The vast majority of the many meetings held between members and/or officers of the Committee and counterparts and other relevant people (such as in industry) off-island are held virtually. Also, it is important and relevant to note that Guernsey hosts counterparts and other relevant parties that travel to our island to meet with us. The suggested reporting process makes no attempt to capture this highly relevant context.

Off-island trips are rare for the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure, but there are some occasions where it is necessary and advantageous for the island for political members and/or officers to attend meetings or attend site visits in person. We play a valuable role in forums such as the British-Irish Council, the UK, Overseas Territories & Crown Dependencies Ministers' Council, and a range of inter-island

development meetings, in which we work collaboratively in a joined up, cross-jurisdictional way and gain a huge amount of useful information, saving ourselves a lot of work and time in the process. Such forums are also instrumental in building strong working relationships with counterparts in the UK and beyond, which serve the island and the Bailiwick very well.

Another example of the inadequacy of the proposed reporting is that Deputy Le Tissier's questions focus only on flights, accommodation and omits to ask for any details of any other forms of travel, which for completeness we have chosen to include below. However, we should note that these answers are unlikely to be comparable, as other committees may not have included any trips made by means other than flights, as they were not asked to do so.

On 13 September 2023, Deputy de Sausmarez travelled by boat to St Brieuc and Cherbourg to visit a wind farm and the renewable energy hub respectively to meet with French and Jersey counterparts, wind farm developers and local authorities to learn from their experiences and explore how Guernsey can develop its own offshore wind facility, as per the direction in the Electricity Strategy, returning 15 September 2023. The cost of travel was not met by the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure. The cost of one night's accommodation at the Hotel le Cercle for Deputy de Sausmarez, was £91.94 and the cost of accommodation for the civil servant accompanying Deputy de Sausmarez was £91.94. There were no other expenses claimed from the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure.

Should annual reporting be adopted, the Committee recommends that a clear framework should be used, that allows for meaningful, comprehensive analysis and mitigates the risk of double accounting and provides adequate context for people to make informed assessments as to the use of taxpayers' money. The assumption that any expenditure relating to off-island trips is unnecessary or in some way a frivolity is misguided and counterproductive, as it could lead to decisions and behaviours that disadvantage the island (such as our exclusion from forums from which we benefit enormously). While Committee members and officers are enthusiastic users of Teams meetings wherever possible, some trips – such as site visits to look at infrastructure – can't always for practical reasons be conducted virtually.

As the figures demonstrate, the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure only undertakes off-island travel that is considered essential or of great value to the States of Guernsey.

Question 10

Would you agree that changes need to be made and that in the interest of transparency and accountability States members trips on States business should be circulated to all Deputies within a reasonable time after the trip?

Answer

The Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure is supportive of measures to demonstrate transparency and accountability. Committees are of course already held accountable for decisions relating to the expenditure of their budget, which is approved by the States Assembly and scrutinised through the States' Accounts.

With this response demonstrating that very few trips have been taken over almost four years and with the States having limited resources, it is not believed that the suggested work is the States' highest priority, nor that the States of Guernsey could justify the officer time and the cost of continually collating and publishing these figures, especially in the absence of any clear, centrally adopted reporting framework.

The cost of compiling the information required to respond to these questions in officer time is £320.

Date of Receipt of the Question: 11 June 2024

Date of Reply: 26 June 2024

Committee Member													Accompanying Civil Servants									
2020	Month	Name	Date of travel	Destination	Date of Meeting / Event	Meeting / Event	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory notes		Number	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory Notes
	October	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	November	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	December	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
2021	Month	Name	Date of travel	Destination	Date of Meeting / Event	Meeting / Event	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory notes		Number	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory Notes
	January	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	February	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	March	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	April	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	May	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	June	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	July	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	August	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	September	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	October	Deputy de Sausmarez	20/10/21 - 22/10/21	Northern Ireland	21/10/21 - 22/10/21	British-Irish Council Ministerial Meeting	302.92	Standard		190 Europa Hotel, Belfast	N/A	492.92	Deputy de Sausmarez represented Guernsey at the British Irish Council (BIC)		1	277.96	Standard		190 Europa Hotel, Belfast	N/A	467.96	One civil servant with subject matter expertise accompanied the President
	November	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	December	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
2022	Month	Name	Date of travel	Destination	Date of Meeting / Event	Meeting / Event	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory notes		Number	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory Notes
	January	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	February	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	March	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	April	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	May	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	June	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	July	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	August	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	September	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	October	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	November	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	December	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
2023	Month	Name	Date of travel	Destination	Date of Meeting / Event	Meeting / Event	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory notes		Number	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory Notes
	January	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	February	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	March	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	April	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	May	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	June	Deputy de Sausmarez	19/06/2023	Jersey	19/06/2023	Inter-island Development Meeting	144.98	Standard	N/A	N/A	N/A	144.98	The significant majority of regular inter-island meetings are held on Teams, but each island hosts its counterpart for at least one in-person meeting per political term. Guernsey hosted a Jersey delegation of politicians and officers in December 2022.		1	144.98	Standard	N/A	N/A	N/A	144.98	Subject matter expert accompanied deputies
		Deputy Gabriel	19/06/2023	Jersey	19/06/2023	Inter-island Development Meeting	144.98	Standard	N/A	N/A	N/A	144.98										
		Deputy Matthews	19/06/2023	Jersey	19/06/2023	Inter-island Development Meeting	149.98	Standard	N/A	N/A	N/A	149.98										
	July	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	August	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	September	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	October	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	November	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	December	Deputy de Sausmarez	02/12/23 - 09/12/23	Dubai	02/12/23 - 07/12/23	COP 28	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	On 2 December 2023, Deputy Lindsay de Sausmarez was invited to represent Guernsey to promote the island as a leading sustainable finance centre and attract inward investment at the COP28 summit, duties which included the formal acceptance of the extension to the Island of the Paris Agreement. The cost of flights and accommodation was not met by the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure.		1	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	216.86 (shared taxis & food)	216.86	The costs of flights and accommodation was not met by the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure
2024	Month	Name	Date of travel	Destination	Date of Meeting / Event	Meeting / Event	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory notes		Number	Flights (£)	Class of travel	Accommodation (£)	Name of hotel	Other expenditure (£)	Total Cost (£)	Explanatory Notes
	January	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	February	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
	March	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A